AGENDA

6:30  1. Call to Order - Roll Call

2. Approval of Agenda

3. Approval of PMCAC Meeting Minutes – 3-13-17

4. Chair Announcements

5. Open Forum (3 minutes per person limit - please file an open forum request with staff prior to start of meeting, or file a request to speak on a particular item prior to discussion of the item)

6:45  6. Council Liaison Report (5 min.)

6:50  7. Presentations, Discussion & Action Items (1 hr. 45 minutes)

   a. Remediation: Monthly Report, March. 2017 – Bill Carson, Terraphase; (15 min.) Q&A (10 min.)
   b. Presentation: Pt. Molate Erosion Control Study, Franz Haidinger, P.E., NCE (15 min) Q&A (10 minutes)
   c. Presentation: Cyclo-cross event overview, Murphy Mack, SuperPro Racing - (15 minutes), Q&A (10 minutes)
   d. Reports: Review PMCAC update report to Council - Garrett, Carman, Hanson (10 min), Q&A (10 min.)
   e. Reports: Community Planning Meeting update - Hanson, Brubaker (5 minutes), Q&A (5 minutes)

8:35  8. Staff report (Notable items from written reports in agenda materials) (10 min.)

9. Brief PMCAC Ad Hoc Committee and Subcommittee Reports (10 m n.)
   a) Very High Fuel Hazard Mgt. contract report (Hanson, Beyaert)
   c) Pt. Molate archive

10. Action Items Review (2 min.)

11. Future Agenda Items (3 min.) - Bay Trail (May),

9:00  12. Adjournment & Next Meeting

Scheduled Meetings
Committee Meeting - This meeting is held in a building that is accessible to people with disabilities. Persons with disabilities, who require auxiliary aids of services using city facilities, services or programs or would like information of the city’s compliance with the American Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, contact: Rochelle Monk, City of Richmond (510) 620-6511 (voice).

Pt. Molate Community Advisory Committee Staff Liaison Contact: Craig K. Murray (510) 307-8140, craig_murray@ci.richmond.ca.us. Additional correspondence can be directed to PtMolataCAC@gmail.com

Agenda and minute information on the PMCAC can be found on the City Clerk’s website:

PMCAC Repository Information is available at: https://docs.google.com/open?id=0B9WZrZeb-72MxVkJWY1ZDQMNWIwNC90ZjEuL1g5YjctOTQtMjI5Y2E2PjNDYw

Terraphase Environmental Repository: https://terraphaseengineering.sharefile.com/f/592048379f448948
City of Richmond – POINT MOLATE COMMUNITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE  
Multi-Purpose Room  
440 Civic Center Plaza  

PROPOSED MINUTES  
Monday, March 13, 2017, 6:30 PM

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

Chair Hanson called the meeting to order at 6:37 pm.

Present: Committee Members, Beyaert, Brubaker, Carman, Gilbert, Gosney, Hanson, McNeil, Portero, Ruk
Absent: Duncan, Garrett, Howe
Staff Present: Craig K. Murray, Staff Liaison, Development Project Manager II, Gayle McLaughlin City Council Liaison, Debra Holter, Fire Prevention, Office Assistant II

2. Approval of Agenda

Hanson called for motion to approve.

Action: Committee approved (M/S Beyaert/Brubaker 9-0-3-0) to adopt the motion.

AYES: Beyaert, Brubaker, Carman, Gilbert, Gosney, Hanson, McNeil, Portero, Ruk
NOES: None
ABSENT: Duncan, Garrett, Howe
ABSTAIN: None

3. Approval of PMCAC Meeting Minutes.

Hanson called for motion to approve February, 2017 minutes with minor change to 7f stating presentation was moved to March 13, 2017 meeting due to time constraints.

Action: Committee approved (M/S Beyaert/Brubaker 9-0-3-0).

AYES: Beyaert, Brubaker, Carman, Gilbert, Gosney, Hanson, McNeil, Portero, Ruk
NOES: None
ABSENT: Duncan, Garrett, Howe
ABSTAIN: None

4. Announcements Through the Chair

Hanson stated there was a lot of items on the agenda last month with community meetings and engineering remediation work, first letter follow up to clarify items come to Chair and Vice-Chair for placement on agenda.
Beyaert made Bay Trail announcement regarding road work status and East Bay Park design 65% complete. Discussion held regarding Chevron wanting high fence around Bay Trail due to liability and security.

5. Open Forum

Speaker Cordell Hindler played music video of Kool and the Gang’s “Celebration” to commemorate PMCAC’s 70th meeting. Kit Pappenheimer of Pt. San Pablo Harbor gave update of work and events on site, stating 21 piles replaced, 100 people attended Sportsman’s Club event and they are launching an “Open House” party on June 24, 2017 which everyone was invited to attend.

6. Council Liaison Report

Gayle McLaughlin stated there was nothing new on legal front and was awaiting ruling from February 14, 2017 court hearing regarding Upstream v COR. She mentioned Bridge Arts, Terminal 4 renovation and that Oakland American Steel artists must move and thought Winehaven or cottages could possibly be used during May-Oct from dawn to dusk due to no utilities.

7. Presentations, Discussion and Action Items

a. Tomar Schetrit of Terraphase provided slide presentation and spoke on IR Site 1, landfill location. Remediation complete, landfill capped in 2002, water collected and treated with silica gel before discharge. Monitoring four (4) methane vents, no methane detected. Tomar to follow up with Bill regarding locating source.

b. Geotracker overview held over until April 10, 2017 meeting.

c. Tony Brake of Golden Gate Raptor Observatory showed slide presentation regarding Osprey Project and answered questions from committee members.

d. Hanson stated we need to get in sync with Planning Department. Hold until further information is gathered regarding Community Planning Meetings and funding sources. Portero stated subcommittee needs to continue meeting.

Speaker Cordell Hindler provided link to Neighborhood Coordinating Council for possible input and help with community meetings.

Hanson called for motion to have subcommittee keep meeting on planning and design package for input from community meetings, previous studies to be incorporated, benchmark to be adjusted as necessary.
Action: Committee approved (M/S Hanson/McNeil 8-0-3-1) to adopt the motion.

AYES: Beyaert, Brubaker, Carman, Gilbert, Hanson, McNeil, Portero, Ruk
NOES: None
ABSENT: Duncan, Garrett, Howe
ABSTAIN: Gosney

e. PMCAC update report to City Council needs more work.

f. Discussion regarding changing Bylaw term restriction. McLaughlin to put on City Council March 21st agenda to recommend to Council discuss term limits to change from four consecutive 2 year terms to five consecutive 2 year terms.

Speaker Cordell Hindler thought that was a good suggestion.

8. Staff Reports

Craig Murray updated committee on staff reports. Mentioned all Commission terms expire in May 2017 and applications were provided. McLaughlin stated she would talk to Mayor and City Clerk regarding status of policy change on terms.

9. PMCAC Ad Hoc Committee and Subcommittee Reports

Brubaker summarized 12 open action items (9A.1 in packet), security payments, someone to take over repository from Garrett, meet with Parks Director on landscape maintenance, Terraphase presentation in repository. He also stated he has started a spreadsheet on income expenses. Electrical restoration item went to Council. Gilbert spoke on Chinese Camp becoming a National Landmark, flyer routed to committee members. Hanson discussed Very High Fuel Hazard Management contract, sent email to Greg Hardesty, Parks Director, who suggested we meet with Fire Prevention officer regarding fuel issues and talk about contract.

10. Action Item Review

a. Terraphase to research UST's above landfill.
b. Terraphase to send link to presentation to us to distribute or put into repository and the live link will be sent from Craig to get to repository.
c. Community outreach will continue to meet and the report to Council will be revised.
d. Councilmember to bring to Council to extend PMCAC terms.
e. Launch party at Pt. San Pablo Harbor.
11. Future Agenda Items

   a. Opening of Winehaven to the public.

12. Adjournment of PMCAC regular meeting.

Hanson called for motion to adjourn meeting.

Action: Committee approved (M/S Hansen/McNeil 8-0-4-0) to adopt the motion.

   AYES: Brubaker, Carman, Gilbert, Gosney, Hanson, McNeil, Porter, Ruk
   NOES: None
   ABSENT: Beyaert, Duncan, Garrett, Howe
   ABSTAIN: None

Meeting adjourned at 9:09 p.m.

SCHEDULED MEETINGS
Committee Meeting –
Monday, April 10, 2017, 6:30 p.m., Multi-Purpose Room, 440 Civic Center Plaza

This meeting is held in a building that is accessible to people with disabilities. People with a
disability who require auxiliary aids of services using city facilities, services or programs or
would like information of the city’s compliance with the American Disabilities Act (ADA) of
1990, contact: Rochelle Monk, City of Richmond (510) 620-6511 (voice).

Minutes respectfully submitted by: ____________________________

Craig K. Murray, PMCAC Staff Liaison
March 9, 2017

Ms. Margarete Beth
California Regional Water Quality Control Board
San Francisco Bay Region
1515 Clay Street, Suite 1400
Oakland, California 94612

sent via: email

Subject: Monthly Remediation Status Report for Work in February 2017, Former Naval Fuel Depot Port Molate, Richmond, California

Dear Ms. Beth:

This monthly remediation status report summarizes the remediation activities conducted by Terraphase Engineering Inc. (Terraphase) on behalf of the City of Richmond at the former Naval Fuel Depot Point Molate (the Site). This remediation status report is intended to meet the requirements of Task 9 in the Regional Water Quality Control Board (RWQCB) Order R2-2011-0087 (RWQCB 2011d). The requirements of Task 9 are as follows:

The Discharger shall submit a report to the Regional Water Board, 30 days prior to the start of any onsite remediation activities, and then on a monthly basis beginning 30 days after the start of the remediation activities, outlining the onsite remediation activities accomplished during the past month and those planned for the following month. The first monthly report at the beginning of each quarter shall include monitoring and test results and any conclusions or proposed changes to the remediation process based on those results. If any changes to the remediation are proposed during any monthly report, applicable supporting monitoring or test data will be submitted at that time. The status report shall also verify that the Prohibitions in Section A, stipulated above, have been adhered to. Should any of those prohibitions be trespassed, the report shall propose a recommendation acceptable to the Executive Officer to correct the trespass.

This remediation status report provides a monthly update on the progress of environmental investigations, remediation, maintenance, and monitoring at the Site. This report is organized around each task listed in the RWQCB Order R2-2011-0087 (RWQCB 2011d). Additional tasks related to the Installation Restoration (IR) Site 3 Packaged Groundwater Treatment Plant (PGWTP) and site-wide groundwater monitoring are included below. For major work tasks completed in 2015, please see the monthly status report for December 2015 (Terraphase 2015aa). A reference list of reports and submittals is included as an attachment to this letter.
Task 1: Soil Cleanup Goals (Compliance Date: February 13, 2012)

Work completed in February 2017:

1. None.

Major Work Items Previously Completed in 2016:

1. None.

Upcoming work in March 2017:

1. None.

Task 2: Soil and Groundwater Management Plan (Compliance Date: March 15, 2012)

Complete - Final Soil and Groundwater Management Plan submitted to the RWQCB September 21, 2012 (Terraphase 2012jj).

Task 3a: IR Site 3 Feasibility Study and Remedial Action Plan (Compliance Date: May 4, 2012 Revised: February 28, 2014)


Task 3b: IR Site 3 Remedial Action Completion Report (Compliance Date: February 3, 2014 Revised: June 30, 2015)

Remedial Action commenced August 2014 and was substantially completed in November 2015.

Work completed in February 2017:


Major Work Items Previously Completed in 2017:

1. None.

Upcoming work in March 2017:

1. None.

Task 4a: IR Site 4 Interim Remedial Action Work Plan (Compliance Date: April 3, 2012)


Task 4b: IR Site 4 Interim Remedial Action Completion Report (Compliance Date: November 2, 2012)

Complete - Interim Remedial Measures Performance Evaluation, IR Site 4, Drum Lot2/Building 87 Area, Formal Naval Fuel Depot, Point Molate, Richmond, California. October 22 (Terraphase 2015u)

Task 4c: IR Site 4 Human Health Risk Assessment (Compliance Date: November 4, 2013)

Work completed in February 2017:

1. Preparation of response to RWQCB comments on HHRA work plan.
Major Work Items Previously Completed in 2017:

1. None.

Upcoming work in March 2017:

1. Preparation of response to RWQCB comments on HHRA work plan.

Task 4d: IR Site 4 Feasibility Study and Remedial Action Plan (Compliance Date: February 3, 2014)

Not Applicable. This task may not be necessary dependent upon the outcome of Task 4c. A revised completion date will be requested from the RWQCB.

Task 4e: IR Site 4 Remedial Action Completion Report (Compliance Date: February 3, 2015)

Not Applicable. This task may not be necessary dependent upon the outcome of Task 4c. A revised completion date will be requested from the RWQCB.

Task 5: UST Management Plan (Compliance Date: March 4, 2013)

Work completed in February 2017:

1. Review of RWQCB comments on tank closure request for UST 2.

Major Work Items Previously Completed in 2017:

1. None.

Upcoming work in March 2017:

1. Review of RWQCB comments on tank closure request for UST 2.

Task 6: UST Removal Plan (Compliance Date: 90 days prior to UST demolition)

Not Applicable—Triggered when demolition of a UST is contemplated. No UST demolition is scheduled at this time.

Task 7: UST Status Report (Compliance Date: June 3, 2012)

Work completed in February 2017:

1. Conducted the routine monthly UST closure monitoring inspections.

Major Work Items Previously Completed in 2017:

1. None.

Upcoming work in March 2017:

1. Conduct the Q1 UST closure monitoring inspections.

Task 8: Amended Land Use Controls (Compliance Date: When environmental closure is requested)

Not Applicable. No closures have been requested.

Task 9: Remediation Status Reports (Compliance Date: Monthly)
Work completed in February 2017:

1. Submitted the monthly remediation status report for January 2016 (Terraphase 2017d) to the RWQCB.

Major Work Items Previously Completed in 2017:

1. Submitted the monthly remediation status report for December 2016 (Terraphase 2017b) to the RWQCB.

Upcoming work in March 2017:

1. Submit the monthly remediation status report for February 2017 to the RWQCB.

Task 10: Discoveries During Facility Redevelopment (Compliance Date: 60 days from initial discovery)

None

Task 11: IR Site 1 ROD (Compliance Date: None)

Work completed in February 2017:

1. Routine monthly landfill inspection of signs, gates, locks, etc.
2. Submittal of 2016 IR Site 1 annual report (Terraphase 2017f).
3. Conduct routine sampling IR 1 treatment system.

Major Work Items Previously Completed in 2017:

1. Submittal of IR Site 1 5 year review report (Terraphase 2017a).

Upcoming work in March 2017:

1. Routine monthly landfill inspection of signs, gates, locks, etc.
3. Conduct routine sampling IR 1 treatment system.
4. Quarterly inspection of IR Site 1 with CCEHD
5. Response to RWQCB comments on 5 year review report.

Task 12: Construction Stormwater General Permit (Compliance Date: Prior to field work)

A Notice of Intent was filed with the Water Board (Application # 449157) September 3, 2014. A WDID was issued for the project (2 07C370778). A notice of termination (NOT) was filed with waterboard on February 6, 2017 and approved February 9, 2017.

IR Site 3: PGWTP

Terraphase, under the direction of the City of Richmond, operated, maintained, and monitored the PGWTP under the existing General Waste Discharge Requirements for: Discharge or Reuse of Extracted and Treated Groundwater Resulting from the Cleanup of Groundwater Polluted by Volatile Organic Compounds (VOC), Fuel Leaks and Other Related Wastes (VOC and Fuel General Permit) (RWQCB 2012a). The PGWTP ceased all operations on July 31, 2015. Notice of Termination for the VOC and Fuel General Permit to the RWQCB and receipt of Notice of Rescission from the RWQCB was received October 9, 2015.
Site-wide Groundwater Monitoring

The purpose of the site-wide groundwater monitoring is to provide groundwater quality data that can be evaluated against established screening criteria for the Site. This program will help protect human health and the environment and prevent releases to the San Francisco Bay. Integrating data collected under this program with previous data is intended to support compliance and closure in accordance with regulatory requirements. Groundwater monitoring is being conducted on a semi-annual basis (wet-season and dry-season) per the Site-Wide Groundwater Monitoring Plan (Terraphase 2011n) that was approved by the RWQCB on August 30, 2011 (RWQCB 2011b). Data collected is summarized and submitted as semi-annual monitoring reports to the RWQCB.

Work completed in February 2017:


Major work items completed previously in 2017:


Upcoming work in March 2017:

2. Meeting with the RWQCB to discuss results of Phases 1&2 of the workplan for alternative quantification methodology, additional characterization and/or risk evaluation for areas outside of IR Site 3 where USEPA Method 8015 without Silica Gel Cleanup quantifies TPH and TPH decomposition products as exceeding the Fuel Product Action Levels within 150 feet of the San Pablo Bay (Terraphase 2015a).

Prohibitions Verification

As required in Task 9 of the RWQCB Order, the following prohibitions (Section A of the RWQCB Order) were adhered to during the remedial activities in February 2017, to the knowledge of Terraphase.

1. The discharge of wastes and/or non-hazardous or hazardous substances in a manner which will degrade, or threaten to degrade, water quality or adversely affect, or threaten to adversely affect, the beneficial uses of the waters of the State is prohibited.
2. Further migration of wastes or hazardous substances through subsurface transport to waters of the State is prohibited.
3. Activities associated with the subsurface investigation and cleanup that will cause adverse migration of wastes or hazardous substances are prohibited.
4. The tidal marsh habitat and wetland habitats onsite shall be completely avoided unless encroachment on these areas is required to implement Facility remediation work and resultant impacts to the affected habitat are mitigated through a plan approved by the Executive Officer. A setback of 50 feet shall be established around the tidal marsh and any wetland area as a means of preventing any unintended impacts to it from the remediation.
5. The Site’s offshore eel-grass habitat shall be completely avoided during any remedial work to the maximum extent practicable.
Summary

The above detailed summaries by task provide a look at the ongoing remediation activities at the former Naval Fuel Depot Point Molate. The RWQCB accepted the Final FS/RAP for IR Site 3 on June 4, 2014. Construction at IR Site 3 was substantially completed in November 2015.

If you have questions regarding this report, please call Tomer Schetrit at (510) 645-1850.

Sincerely,
For Terraphase Engineering Inc.

[Signature]

Tomer Schetrit, PE (C81411)
Senior Project Engineer

cc: Craig Murray, City of Richmond
Carlos Privat, City of Richmond
Bruce Goodmiller, City of Richmond
LaShonda White, City of Richmond
James Whitcomb, BRAC Program Management Office
Venkat Puranapanda, ACE Group
Jim Hanson, PMCAC
Mark Howe, PMCAC
Joan Garrett, PMCAC

Attachments: Point Molate Bibliography
Point Molate Bibliography

City of Richmond. 2012. Letter from Richard Mitchell (Planning Department) to Mr. Tristan Tozer (California Office of Historic Preservation) RE: Section 106 Consultation for the Point Molate IR Site 3 Remediation Project, Former Naval Fuel Depot Point Molate, Richmond, CA. April 3.


RWQCB. 2010. Letter from Mr. George Levy to Mr. Levine RE: Approval of Field Assessment Methodology for Potentially Mobile Free Petroleum Product at Installation Restoration (IR) Site 3 at the former Naval Fuel Depot (NFD) Point Molate, Richmond, Contra Costa County. November 30.


RWQCB. 2011b. Letter from Mr. George Levy to Mr. Steve Duran RE: Approval of Site-Wide Groundwater Monitoring Plan for the Former Point Molate Naval Fuel Depot, Richmond, Contra Costa County. August 30.


RWQCB. 2012b. Letter from Mr. George Levy to Mr. Bruce Goodmiller RE: Review and Comments - Draft FS/RAP, Former Naval Fuel Depot Point Molate, Richmond, Contra Costa County. February 17.

RWQCB. 2012c. Letter from Ms. Lila Tang to Mr. Steve Duran RE: Reauthorization to Discharge from the Packaged Groundwater Treatment Plant (PGWTP) located at the former Naval Fuel Depot, Point
Molate, Western Drive, City of Richmond, Contra Costa County under the Requirements of Order No. R2-2012-0012, NPDES Permit No. CAG912002 (VOC and Fuel General Permit). March 22.

RWQCB. 2013a. Letter from Bruce H. Wolfe to Mr. Bruce Goodmiller RE: Approval of Modified Sampling Plan – Fish Toxicity General NPDES Permit No. CAG912002, Order No. R2-2012-0012


Terraphase. 2012r. Addendum to the Revised Final Groundwater Remediation Work Plan for IR Site 4, Drum Lot 2/Building 87 Area, Former NFD Point Molate, Richmond, California. May 3.


Terraphase. 2012ii. Step Out Investigation, IR Site 4 Drum Lot 2, Building 87 Area Point Molate, Richmond, California. September 17.


Terraphase. 2013f. 4th Quarter 2012 Landfill Monitoring Report, IR Site 1, Former Naval Fuel Depot Point Molate, Richmond, California. February 15.


Terraphase. 2013h. Well Abandonment Completion Report, Former Naval Fuel Depot Point Molate, Richmond, California. February 15.


Terraphase. 2013w. 2nd Quarter 2013 Landfill Monitoring Report, IR Site 1, Former Naval Fuel Depot Point Molate, Richmond, California. August 15.


Terraphase. 2013bb. 3rd Quarter 2013 Landfill Monitoring Report, IR Site 1, Former Naval Fuel Depot Point Molate, Richmond, California. October 30.


Terraphase. 2015e. 4th Quarter 2014 Landfill Monitoring Report, IR Site 1, Former Naval Fuel Depot Point Molate, Richmond, California. February 14.


DRAFT
Pt. Molate Community Advisory Committee Report to City Council
January, 2016 to March, 2017

The Point Molate Community Advisory Committee works with the City Council, staff and other citizen advisory boards and commissions to provide advice and input on all Point Molate matters.

This report summarizes Pt. Molate CAC contributions between January, 2016 and March, 2017 to monitor remediation activities and advise the Council on potential revenue opportunities, City cost savings, planning, and site asset conservation, both physical and natural.

1. Remediation Work under the Regional Water Quality Board permit

This section of the report summarizes information presented to the Point Molate Community Advisory Committee about the current status of the cleanup sites at Pt. Molate, as well as options and estimated costs to achieve Regional Water Board permit requirements.

Background

In 2011, the California Regional Water Quality Control Board issued Order NO. R2-2011-0087 to the City of Richmond and the Department of the Navy to undertake a final clean-up of various sites at Point Molate. Due to residual contamination from decades of Navy activity, remediation work was necessary to ensure protection of human health, water quality, and the environment consistent with possible future uses of Point Molate.

The Regional Water Board order targeted four sites* on the approximately 300 upland acres of City property in the middle of the Pt. Molate peninsula.**

This current Regional Water Board permit includes:

- Site 1 - a capped hillside landfill constructed by the Navy
- Site 3 - a large area below Winehaven, location of former Navy treatment ponds
- Site 4 - two former oil drum lot areas. "Drum Lot 1" is a large concrete pad at the Point Molate pier. "Drum lot 2" is made up of three large concrete terraces at the foot of the hill across from the Beach Park..
- Twenty underground storage tanks (USTs) located throughout the property.
The City contracted with Terraphase Engineering to administer site cleanup to meet the Regional Water Board's permit requirements.

* Regional Water Board cleanup site designations are normally preceded with the prefix "IR" (i.e. "IR Site 1"), but they are simply being referred to as "sites" for the purposes of this report.
** The other former Navy property at Pt. San Pablo - "Terminal 4" - was also turned over to the City, but it is not covered in this permit.

Remediation Summary and Highlights

After six years of remediation work at Pt. Molate, including completion of a major project to remove thousands of cubic yards of oil-contaminated soil below the Winehaven building, City staff report that approximately $3.9 million remains of the original $28.5 million of Navy escrow funds. Below is a summary of the status of the Regional Water Board designated permit sites and the underground storage tanks based on staff and Terraphase Engineering monthly reports to the Pt. Molate CAC.

Site 1 - Hillside landfill in south valley

Technically, the landfill has been granted closure, but ongoing contaminant monitoring of groundwater wells is required until there are low sampling results over two consecutive years. At an estimated $50,000 per year, the landfill is the most costly site to continue to monitor and maintain. Two of the six groundwater wells at the landfill have shown consistently high contaminant levels. In March, 2017, the Pt. Molate CAC recommended that City staff and Terraphase engineers further evaluate remediation of these two groundwater wells to achieve water quality objectives and to relieve the City of ongoing, costly landfill monitoring and maintenance expenses.

Site 3 - a large area below Winehaven

The removal of the thousands of cubic yards of bunker fuel-contaminated soil at Site 3 was the major remediation project required under Regional Water Board permit. The project was completed in December, 2015. A letter requesting final acceptance of the remediation and erosion control portions of this project has been sent to the Board. The City is still required to continue to pay for and conduct ongoing monitoring and maintenance of the groundwater wells at this site.

Site 4 - Former oil drum lots near Winehaven and above the Beach Park

Site 4 primarily consists of two former concrete Navy oil drum storage areas, "Drum Lot 1" south of Winehaven at the pier, and "Drum Lot 2" above the Beach Park.

Drum Lot 1 has been accepted for commercial and parks and recreation uses. Drum Lot 2 is more complicated. The former trichloroethylene (TCE) and chlorinated volatile organic compounds in the soils below the concrete pads have been substantially reduced. A "Human
Health Risk Assessment" is now needed to determine if this former drum lot could be made available for a variety of uses. However, more rigorous screening protocols have been put in place by the Regional Water Board. The Pt. Molate CAC has recommended that the assessment encompass both restricted (usually commercial and parks and recreation) and unrestricted uses (usually residential and institutional) so that the Council is advised of all possible uses of the site and the cleanup costs associated with each use.

**Underground Storage Tanks (USTs)**

There are twenty large underground storage tanks on City property in the hills above Stenmark Drive. Eleven of the twenty storage tanks have been approved for closure. However, "closure" does not relieve the City of continued monitoring and maintenance of any of the tanks so the Pt. Molate CAC requested and received cost information for various scenarios. Continued monitoring is estimated at $15,000 per year. Investigation for clean up and full closure is estimated at $150,000 per tank. Complete tank removal is projected at $500,000 to $700,000 per tank. Unless tank cleanup or removal is recommended, annual UST monitoring and maintenance will continue and is budgeted in the Navy escrow remediation funds through 2035.

**Groundwater Monitoring**

Groundwater monitoring wells are the primary way that the above sites and the UST's are monitored for progress toward permit standards. There are a total of 59 groundwater monitoring wells at Point Molate that are used to quantify the concentration of diesel, bunker, and jet fuel in groundwater. Terraphase Engineering submits bi-annual groundwater monitoring reports to the Water Board: dry season and wet season. They have also submitted a recommendation to the Water Board that 12 of these wells be discontinued.

The most recent issue regarding Point Molate's groundwater concerns "polar compounds". Polar compounds are the chemical compounds remaining when petroleum products break down. Polar compounds sometimes can be more hazardous than their "parent" chemicals. The City now has to apply the more stringent regulatory screening criteria using polar compounds. Unfortunately, all monitoring wells within Site 3 measured above acceptable levels for polar compounds in the most recent dry season monitoring report.

**The Navy Escrow Remediation Fund**

After six years of contaminant monitoring and remediation work at Pt. Molate, including removal and replacement of the contaminated soil at Site 3 below Winehaven, the remaining remediation escrow balance reported to Pt. Molate CAC by City staff and Terraphase Engineering in March 2017 is $3,885,743. The insurance policy for Pt. Molate remediation expires in 2020. As noted above, there will be ongoing remediation costs for monitoring and maintenance after 2020. However, Terraphase engineers estimate that the current remediation escrow funds will largely cover the remaining and ongoing remediation costs to meet Regional Water Board permit requirements. At this time, they estimate that that after 2020, the City will need to cover approximately $200,000 over and above the Navy escrow funds provided to meet...
the Regional Water Board permit for remediation (See Figure 2). The Pt. Molate CAC notes that this recent budget estimate also implies that there is not enough in the escrow fund to cover any new or moderated remediation work, or very long term permit monitoring.

**Figure 2: Long-Term Remediation Cost Estimates - Point Molate**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Projected Cost to Complete Permit beyond 2020</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Site 1 - Landfill</td>
<td>$678,515</td>
<td>Assumes 15 additional years of monitoring and maintenance past 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site 3 - Former Oil Sump Area below Winehaven</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Includes wetland construction, LUC mechanism, and reporting requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site 4 - Former Oil Drum Lots 1 and 2</td>
<td>$125,000</td>
<td>Projected cost through 2020 (does not include data gap investigation $100-200k)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Underground Storage Tanks</td>
<td>$389,098</td>
<td>UST management will continue beyond 2020. UST removal is not included in projected costs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-Term Groundwater Monitoring</td>
<td>$609,008</td>
<td>Projected additional cost beyond 2020 includes potential further monitoring at IR Site 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site Wide (Legal, Escrow, Insurance)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>$1,801,621</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Projected Escrow Budget March 2020</td>
<td>$1,617,879</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estimated City Responsibility</td>
<td>$183,742</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


2. *City savings, efficiencies, and income generation opportunities initiated by Pt. Molate CAC*

- Building standard rental agreement recommended

The Committee worked with the City Attorney, Tim Higaes of DIMO, and Council liaison Gayle McLaughlin to ensure that Nematode Holdings was in compliance with local and state codes, licensing, that the properties had been inspected, and that the lease defined the licensing payment and in-kind contributions for use of rental space at Point Molate. Nematode Holdings license for rental and subletting of space was amended twice during 2016 to expand the areas
rented at Pt. Molate from a single section of building 123 to all of building 123, plus a number of other buildings, most clustered around 123, but also the pier, bldg 87 and the Winehaven building, a total 33,000 square feet. The Council approved a license to rent space on December 6, 2016 for $.05 per foot, or $3,361 per month and 50% of all net revenues from sub-licensees.

- Electrical restoration study for enhanced income generation

The committee provided a study session to the Council headed by Mark Howe to review costs and methods to upgrade infrastructure to provide adequate power for low intensity commercial use of the properties. A relatively inexpensive in situ wastewater treatment was described for low intensity commercial use. Howe also provided an analysis of comparable market rate pricing for local commercial rentals to outline income opportunities for the City from restoring electricity, water connections, and low intensity wastewater treatment. Preliminary estimates indicate that up to $3 million annually could be realized by the City in rental income from re-furbishing existing Pt. Molate buildings and cottages and re-establishing basic utilities. The City Council conducted the study session on May 24, 2016. A tape of the presentation can be viewed on the City Council meeting video archive site.

- Contract cost savings recommended

In a cost saving measure, the committee recommended termination of the contract with NCE since the bulk of the remediation work has been done. Council approved this recommendation on November 1, 2016, resulting in $80,000 savings this year to the Navy remediation escrow fund.

- Salvageable materials

There are a variety of materials still in storage at Pt. Molate. An inventory has been initiated (Gosney) of salvageable materials at Pt. Molate for potential resale income to the City.

- Very High Fire Hazard Severity Zone vegetation management contract assistance
Several discussions were held (Hanson) with the Parks Department on the Contractor's progress in reducing upland fire hazard weedy vegetation while conserving desirable, lower-fuel native Pt. Molate vegetation, in line with specifications under the City's $84,000 annual contract for fuel management.

3. **Planning Assistance**

- **Urban Land Institute recommendations for Pt. Molate**

At the behest of the Pt Molate Working Group and with financial support from Trust for Public Land, the city engaged with the Urban Land Institute (ULI) for a Technical Advisory Panel (TAP) review of Pt. Molate which was completed in April. Final reports were published in June. Additionally, PMCAC held a joint meeting with the Pt. Molate Working Group to discuss the ULI/TAP findings.

- **Bay Trail extension into Pt. Molate**

An initial plan review meeting on the Bay Trail extension was organized by the East Bay Regional Park District (EBRPD) and NCE, the firm selected to do the trail design. Pt. Molate CAC members (Beybey, Carman, Hanson) made comments on ways to improve user experience and natural resource protection in the design of the Bay Trail extension into Pt. Molate. In March, Pt. Molate CAC members (Beybey, Brubaker, Hanson, Gilbert, Stello) accompanied EBRPD Senior Planner, Suzanne Wilson, on a walking tour to review the proposed Bay Trail alignment.

Pt. Molate CAC (Bruce Beybey) provided a time lapse history of erosion of the shoreline at Pt. Molate indicating erosion rates of nearly a foot/year. A section of the Burma road adjacent to the planned Bay Trail extension and a newly-constructed wetland has been undermined (the wetland was constructed along the shoreline in the south valley as mitigation for the Site 3 treatment area below Winehaven). The City has undertaken a shoreline erosion engineering study.

- **Base closure models**

Pt Molate CAC hosted Exec. Director Michael Boland of the Presidio Trust. Boland described how the Trust used an incremental site improvement plan at the Presidio in order to generate initial revenues to fund additional improvements.

- **Community planning meetings for land use designations**

A subcommittee of the Pt. Molate CAC (Brubaker, Carman, Gosney, Hanson, Potrero) was formed to work with the Planning Department on the design and development of content for community planning meetings for community input on land use designations and zoning for the area. Initial meetings were held and initial comments were submitted.
Summary

The Pt. Molate CAC continues to monitor remediation activities and advise the Council on potential revenue opportunities, City cost savings, planning, and site asset conservation, both physical and natural. Two key recommendations at this time are:

Remediation - A budget report by Terraphase (Figure 2) estimates that enough of the remediation escrow funds remain to complete major portions of the RWQCB permit, however it is also estimated that there is not enough in the escrow fund to cover any new/moderated remediation work or very long term permit monitoring. The Committee reaffirms the need for City staff to provide a timely, adequate opportunity to review and comment on any draft remediation work schedules, site plans, and vendor contracts for Pt. Molate in order to continue to recommend efficiencies, savings, and income opportunities to the Council and City staff.

Income Generation - Based on an analysis of the underutilization of the buildings at Pt. Molate as interim commercia. rental spaces, the City should locate and apply funds to restore electricity to the buildings at Pt. Molate and incrementally increase the rental income based on the cost, income and the breakeven analysis presented to the City during the May 24, 2016 Council study session.

2016-17 Members:
### Pt. Molate FY2016-17 Budget

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Account</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Vendor</th>
<th>Budget</th>
<th>Actual</th>
<th>Encumb.</th>
<th>Balance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Non-Departmental</td>
<td>01917090-4C0218</td>
<td>Security</td>
<td>DP Security</td>
<td>$253,331</td>
<td>$118,962</td>
<td>$69,003</td>
<td>$65,366</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Works</td>
<td>01233631-4C0537</td>
<td>Landscape</td>
<td>D&amp;H Landscaping</td>
<td>$83,940</td>
<td>$56,105</td>
<td>$27,835</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>$337,271</strong></td>
<td><strong>$175,067</strong></td>
<td><strong>$96,838</strong></td>
<td><strong>$65,366</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*As of March 31, 2017*
April 3, 2017

Captain Louie Tirona  
Southern District Commander  
Richmond Police Department  
Richmond, CA, 94806  

During the Month of March 2017, First Security Services maintained 128 hours per week of contracted security services. 1500-0700 hours (Mon-Fri), and 24 Hour weekend coverage.

The deployment of security at Point Molate, consist of the following service standards.

1. To monitor activity of the lower portion of the region to include the shoreline and perimeter fencing from a Mobile Position. Security personnel will also monitor all activities within the Point Molate region to include visitors and contractors during our onsite patrol hours.

2. During patrol hours First Security utilizes our FirstWatch patrolling and Incident reporting system. All site location activity tracks the movement of assigned security personnel to ensure that security expectations and contracts requirements are being fulfilled.

3. Document all contractors and visitor entry with prior approval per provided Release, Waiver of Liability and Indemnity agreement.

The reflected information is detail surrounding the security service at the Point Molate site during the month of March, 2017.

Primary Security Personnel Assigned:

Patrol Officers: Mussa Mohammed, Arlington Reed and Gilbert Pete.  
New weekend officer: Lee Van Erby

Supervisors: Alex Treadwell and LaMeisha Reed and Operation Manager Michael Ward.

First Security Services personnel initiated 624 full patrols within the designated point Molate area during the month of March 2017.

Incident Reports:  
No incidents detailed for the month of March 2017.
Administrative Action Taken:

- 3/3/17; Site assessment processed
  - Bay trail project, approved entry paperwork processed.
  - Approved dates February 2017 - December 2017
  - Coastal Archaeological Ruins
  - Personal Photography - Naval Depot

- 3/6/17; Tour interior and exterior of Point Molate Facility approved entry paperwork processed.
  - Approved dates February 10, 2017 – March 10, 2017

- 3/23/17; Officer reported people walking from the Beach Park to secured grounds locations. Request of signage review at the North end of the Beach Park to enforce “No Public Access”.

- 3/31/17; Officer reported that windows to Quonset Hut/Bldg. 87 need to be boarded up.

- Performed additional mobile patrol detail on cafeteria and warehouse locations at the Port. (Per request of captain Tirona)

- 3/28/17; Met with captain Tirona for general operation discussion and site overview.

Site Environmental Concerns:

- Continued, No Driving directives on IR Site (3) and shoreline area due to state regulators native grass grow initiative. (Enforced until further Notice)
PMCAC Landscapers Report

Please see update on landscaping at Point Molate as well as attached pictures of work done:

March 2\textsuperscript{nd} and 3\textsuperscript{rd}

- Abatement of weeds along Stenmark Dr. fence line by Tank 3 entrance to Garden Road.

March 9\textsuperscript{th} and 10\textsuperscript{th}

- Abatement of weeds on Ridge Road from Tank 10 to Road “F”

March 16\textsuperscript{th} and 17\textsuperscript{th}

- Abatement of weeds on Road “D”.

8.4
March 23rd and 24th

- Please Note: Minimal work was done on March 24th due to weather conditions.
- Began mowing of grass around houses 31-47 and 53-56.

March 30th and 31st

- Finished abatement of grass around houses 31-47 and 53-56.
- Completed abatement of grass around Gray's Circle
- Removal of fallen tree limb by road to Tank 3.
- More limbs near "power Lines" by tank 3 road entrance in need of removal. See picture below.
Work to be done for Month of April:

- Tank mowing schedule will be paused for April.
- Brush abatement along Road "G", Range Road, and Ridge Road. Brush will be abated at least 5 feet from the road. Map of work area is attached.
- Estimate to have Blue Gum Eucalyptus near house 54 removed. Trees are touching building. Eric Munson recommends this work to be done. (see picture 5)

More trees have fallen on top of Bldg 32 and have caused minor damage. These trees are blocking access to Bldg 57, 58, 59. Estimate #1770 to remove trees is attached to this report. (see pictures 1, 2, 3)

Tree 3 Blocking Range Road at Road "C" needs to be cleared. Estimate #1879 to remove Tree is attached to this report. (see picture 4) It was recommended by Eric Munson that these are given attention as soon as possible due to them blocking roads.

Thank You,
Jonathan Lal
April 6, 2017
March 27, 2017

Greg Hardesty, Superintendent,
City of Richmond Parks and Recreation Division
Department of Infrastructure Maintenance and Operations
3201 Leona Avenue
Richmond, CA 94804

Via email to Greg_Hardesty@ci.richmond.ca.us

SUBJECT: Pt. Molate vegetation management - contract specifications and actual contract activity, Spring 2016 to present

Hello Greg:

Since a dry season is again upon us, I'm following up on our discussions with the Parks Department about contract work under the City's vegetation fuel management contract for Pt. Molate. As you know, Pt. Molate has been designated as a Very High Fire Hazard Severity Zone. Pt. Molate and its unique scenic, historic, and natural beauty is highly valued by the City and Richmond residents. The City Council's renewal of a $250,000, three year vegetation fuel management contract from the City's General Fund in September, 2015 was passed to achieve vegetation fuel reduction while protecting the site's natural habitat values.

The attached documentation is provided for City use to point out where the site does not appear to be matching the City's contract specifications. The dense, weedy French broom (*Genista monspessulana*) along the hillside road edges is of particular concern. The Pt. Molate Community Advisory Committee (Pt. Molate CAC) has requested a report on this topic. The next regular meeting is Monday, April 10, and I would like to be able to report back on how contract activity will be aligned with the contract's intent in the coming dry season.

Over the last year and a half, we have been in conversation with you and your staff regarding the relationship between contract specifications and actual general fund paid contract activity at Pt. Molate. During winter 2016, Pt. Molate CAC representatives accompanied the Parks Department Lead Supervisor, Mark Maltagliati, in field discussions with the previous Contractor, D&H Landscaping, about compliance with the contract specifications...
(Attachment 1). Subsequently, the Contractor was notified of about non-compliance issues and began to address those issues (Attachment 2). The Contractor also began to submit monthly reports that showed where contract work was being done. The monthly report was borrowed from on a simple Google map reporting template to easily view where contract work had occurred during the month.

In late spring 2016 we were informed that the Contractor was being temporarily shifted to clear weedy brush around the underground storage tank drains. At approximately the same time, the City’s contract was transferred to a new Contractor.

Based on discussions with City Fire Prevention Officer, Eric Munson, removal of the tall, dense weedy broom along the road edge is a priority for fire personnel. There is a contract specification for road edge vegetation removal, however this critical specification was not met at any time during last year’s dry season on the hillside access roads above Stenmark Drive. Additionally, and as a result, a new fuel laden invasive weed, Stinkwort (Dittrichia graveolens), was able to flourish and reseed along hillside roads.

As you know, the Council added a contract stipulation "to promote and protect native plant species in natural areas as well as in the beach park to protect natural habitat and maintain the integrity of the hillsides, creeks, and wetlands." This provision was added because Pt. Molate’s unique native plant resources are an beneficial asset to the City. Retaining the resident native bunchgrasses, forbs, and shrubs provides the City with long term road edge erosion control, as well as a desirable, competitive, and lower fuel load substitute to the dense, weedy French broom. Therefore, this contract requires that the Contractor’s crew know what French broom, Pampas Grass, and Stinkwort is in order to either leave low-growing native plant species, or to not over-prune or over-mow these plants.

The City’s Fire Prevention Services Division advises City Department’s on fire prevention priorities at Pt. Molate. The Pt. Molate CAC is also concerned about site safety and contract compliance to protect the natural, financial, and scenic assets on this City property. We are submitting the following recommendations for safety and City asset protection as chair of the Committee’s Parks and Open Space subcommittee.

**Recommendations:**

1. **For the safety of emergency and public safety personnel, immediately remove jutting tree branch hazards to the specified 12' clearance height or higher.**

A Blue Gum eucalyptus has fallen and overhangs the road above at the intersection of Ridge and "C" Roads. A branch has been cut to windshield height and is therefore a safety hazard to public safety vehicles (Figure 1). The contract specifications call for elevating "any tree limbs
along roadsides... that are below 12' to allow for vehicle travel." An average fire truck is in the range of 12' tall. A Blue Gum branch is also in a low, dropping condition at the on "G" road about 300' up the hill from Building 123. (Figure 1). While not in the scope of the fuel reduction contract, wires of unknown function have been also left hanging in this location.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure 1. SAFETY HAZARDS to EMERGENCY PERSONNEL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contract Requirement - Tree limbs over road to be cut up to 12' minimum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actual - Existing low branches below 12' in hillside at Range Rd. and &quot;C&quot; Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February, 2017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Recommend payment consistent with compliance to contract specifications

The contract specifications state that sixteen underground storage tank sites are to be mowed during the summer and fall months. However, the Contractor has been also mowing the tank tops during the winter months when weeds are short, wet, and green and not a fire fuel concern. Also, low grass weeds are also being mowed during the wet months and, in at some cases, well beyond the required 100' from the buildings below Stenmark Dr. at Winehaven.

At the same time, upland hill road edges are not being mowed to specification during either the wet or dry times of the year, leaving a large standing vegetation weedy fuel mass and fuel ladder along the roadsides (see #4 below). Lack of ongoing compliance with this contract specification also means that the line of sight is blocked on hillside road corners to public safety responders.

Cutting low green grass weeds over the winter would appear to be of little use to the fuel reduction intent of the contract. The annual weedy grasses simply regrow until they die and dry out in late spring or early summer.
Also, the City's contract is based on payment for compliance with the specifications, not for time and materials spent on site. The contract requires that the requisite skill, equipment, and time be expended to meet the contract specifications. If, as once noted by the City Parks representative, the means and methods being used by the Contractor don't do the job, then the Contractor is required to arrange for and supply the personnel and equipment that will.

Recommend that monthly payment is consistent with compliance to contract specifications.

3. **Confirm baseline assessment of Pt. Molate vegetation contract compliance at start of 2017 dry season**

A February baseline assessment of contract compliance by specified contract locations is included (Attachment 3) in order that City management, the Contractor, and the Pt. Molate CAC begin the 2017 dry season with a mutual understanding of fuel reduction conditions and dry season priorities at Pt. Molate (follow up visits during March indicate that the February assessment continues to represent current conditions). Overall, it appears that the control of weedy vegetation around the Winehaven Village buildings, along Stenmark Drive, and at the top of tanks has met or exceeded contract specifications. Critical hillside road edges are not in compliance.

If you have any corrections to this baseline assessment, would you please return it to myself and Craig Murray, Pt. Molate CAC staff, with any corrections for the Pt. Molate Community Advisory Committee meeting for April 10. Otherwise, we will assume that this baseline assessment spreadsheet is an accurate representation of vegetation fuel contract compliance at Pt. Molate at the start of this dry season.

4. **Road edge vegetation weedy fuels removed on Pt. Molate hillside roads to contract specification.**

---

**Figure 2. City Contract Requirement - Weedy fuel vegetation to be cleared back 10' and from road edge and maintained at <3"**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Not in Compliance - High fuel hazard remains along road edges - typical hillside road conditions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image1.jpg" alt="Image 1" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As noted, a key contract specification is removal of weedy vegetation within 10' of roadways to less than 3" in height. As shown in Figures 2 & 3, the Ridge Road, Range Road, and east-west heading hillside roads do not meet this contract requirement.

For the safety of emergency and public safety personnel, a priority should be to achieve and maintain compliance with the contract specification to establish a line of sight at blind corners. This objective may largely be achieved by cutting and removing the road edge vegetation (mostly weedy invasive French broom) to the specified 10' back from the road edge. Regardless, there is also a contract specification that requires that vegetation be pruned at intersections to ensure sufficient line of sight (Attachment 1).

Figure 3. City Contract Requirement - Weedy fuel vegetation to be cleared back 10' and from road edge and maintained at <3"

| Not in Compliance - Dry cut weed fuel load left along road edges for ten months on South valley roads west of refinery. New noxious invasive fuel weed, stinkwort, allowed to spread over summer/fall, 2016. |
|---|---|---|

5. Comply with native plant protection contract provision and best industry standards

Recently, I noticed that the road edge grass along Stenmark Drive was being mowed to about 1/2" tall and beyond from the 10' distance required by the contract. I pointed out to the crew that the ultra-low mowing was damaging of the long-established native bunchgrasses and native forbs to remain. These plants help hold the road edge bank in place at this location. The crew asked if I would flag them, so I came back and put in marker flags for the bunch grasses.

Last summer, a potentially State-listed rare site wildflower found in the south valley on the shoulder of Range Road was marked with red flags with the words "RARE PLANT". Even with clear flagging and little other vegetation at this road edge location, these plants were mowed down.

Taller native shrubs may certainly be pruned where necessary, but in addition to bird habitat, these plants provide a desirable, competitive, and lower-fuel vegetation substitute to the invasive weedy Broom. Therefore, any needed pruning of established native shrubs needs to be
done in a way that does not to disfigure or shorten the life of the plant. Likewise, the City's contract language states that landscape-related contract work, such as pruning, is to meet "the best industry standards."

Also, State and Federally-protected rare plants are to remain; most are small and not a fuel source anyway.

I volunteered onsite training to the D&H crew in early 2016 to help them recognize both the broom and the soil-holding native bunch grasses to remain. Whether by ongoing training or from on-site Contractor supervision, the fuel reduction work should adhere to the native species protection provision of this contract and best landscape industry management standards.

6. Improve Monthly Progress Reporting

The Pt. Molate CAC has been receiving monthly reports on this contract that have had little information, or else indicate that the month's activity is inconsistent with the intent and specifications of the City's vegetation fuel reduction contract. It is unknown what inspection or Contractor reports are used by DIMO and the Parks Department to determine a monthly payment corresponding to the level of contract compliance, but in order to understand the City's progress on vegetation fuel reduction at Pt. Molate, and to meet normal standards of reporting for any municipal audit purposes, the following improvements in the monthly reporting are requested:

- to be able to determine from monthly reports specifically where on site and when work was completed,
- where areas are in compliance with the contract, and
- specifically what areas are planned to be brought into compliance by the end of the next month

Given that the Parks Department has a huge scope of work and limited staff, I hope that the above information proves useful in assessing some immediate and longer term actions to achieve the intent and specific requirements of this fuel reduction investment by the City and its residents. If we can be of any further assistance in the meantime, if you would like to meet, or if you have any questions about the information in the report, please feel free to contact me.

Sincerely,

Jim Hanson

Jim Hanson, Chair, Pt. Molate Community Advisory Committee, Parks and Open Space Subcommittee
cc:  Tim Higares, Director, Department of Infrastructure Maintenance and Operations
    Eric Munson, Fire Inspector, Fire Prevention Services Division
    Craig Murray, Project Manager, Pt. Molate, and staff to Pt. Molate CAC
    Mark Maltagliati, Supervisor, Richmond Parks and Recreation Division
    Bruce Beyaert, member, Pt. Molate CAC, Parks and Open Space Subcommittee
    Paul Carman, member, Pt. Molate CAC, Parks and Open Space Subcommittee
    Dorothy Gilbert, member, Pt. Molate CAC, Parks and Open Space Subcommittee
SECTION 10
PROJECT DETAILS

10-1 General

10-1.01 Quality Control

The Contractor guarantees that the maintenance and work stated herein shall be done to the satisfaction of the Engineer. Failure to meet acceptable standards of performance and quality of work shall result in termination of the Contract.

The Engineer shall decide any and all questions which may arise as to the quality or acceptability of work performed and as to the manner of performance and rate of progress of work; all questions which arise as to the interpretation of the plans and specifications; all questions as to the acceptable fulfillment of the Contract on the part of the Contractor; and all questions as to claims and compensations.

The Engineer's decision shall be final and he shall have the authority to enforce and make effective such decisions and orders which the Contractor fails to carry out promptly.

10-1.02 Progress Schedule

Progress schedules will be required for this contract and shall conform to the provisions in Section 8-1.04, "Progress Schedule" of the Standard Specification, and these Special Provisions.

Contractor shall submit a maintenance schedule to the Engineer within 15 working days of the award of contract.

10-1.03 Response to Complaints

Complaints regarding the performance of maintenance work or any other aspect of the Contract work which the Engineer considers justifiable and the responsibility of the Contractor will be referred to the Contractor for immediate attention. Such referrals may be verbal or written if given verbally by the Engineer a written copy shall be prepared by his office and forwarded to the Contractor within three (3) business days and on a standard complaint form. Response to the verbal complaint shall be not wait for the written confirmation to be received. The Contractor shall respond to the complaint within twenty-four (24) hours and shall immediately forward a complaint response report to the Engineer, detailing the reasons for the complaint and actions taken to correct the problem.

In the event that a total of five (5) days pass from the time that the complaint was received by the Contractor without the complaint response report being received by the Engineer and therefore the matter being closed, all payments due or that become due to the Contractor will be withheld until such time that any and all outstanding complaints have been resolved and written reports satisfactory to the Engineer have been received. Any failure to maintain the required complaint response procedure will be sufficient cause for the City to terminate the Contract.
10-3.04 Dust Control

Dust control shall conform to the provisions in Section 10, "Dust Control" of the Standard Specifications and these Special Provisions. Contractor shall exercise diligence in preventing dust nuisance. When necessary or when directed by the Engineer, the Contractor shall apply water for laying dust. Water shall be applied by means of pressure-type distributors equipped with a spray system that will insure a uniform application.

The payment for water and its distribution shall be considered as included in the prices paid for the various contract items of work and no separate payment will be made therefor. The prices paid shall include full compensation for furnishing all labor, materials, tools and equipment and doing all work involved as specified.

10-1.05 Stormwater Pollution Control

Attention is directed to Section 7.1-01G, "Water Pollution" of the Standard Specifications and these Special Provisions.

Contractor shall exercise every reasonable precaution to prevent any debris, chemical or other harmful material in the construction water resulted from his operations from discharging into the storm drain system.

Conformance with the requirements of this section shall in no way relieve the Contractor from his responsibilities to comply with any local, State or Federal regulations and ordinances on stormwater pollution control.

Full compensation for conforming to the requirements of this section shall be considered as included in the prices paid for the various contract items of work and no separate payment will be made therefor.

10-1.06 Maintaining Traffic

Attention is directed to Section 7-1.08, "Public Convenience," 7-1.09, "Public Safety", and 12, "Construction Area Traffic Control Devices," of the Standard Specifications. Nothing in these special provisions shall be construed as relieving the Contractor from his responsibility as provided in said Section 7-1.09.

Lane closures shall concur with the provisions set forth in the latest edition of the Manual of Traffic Controls of the State of California Department of Transportation. Contractor shall submit traffic control plan for approval 5 working days before work begins.

Personal vehicles belonging to the Contractor's employees shall not be parked on the traveled way at any time, including any section closed to the public traffic. When entering or leaving roadways carrying public traffic, the Contractor's equipment, whether empty or loaded, shall in all cases, yield to public traffic.
The Contractor shall maintain one traffic lane not less than 11 feet in width in each direction during working hours. At all other times all traffic lanes shall be accessible. Complete closure of any portion of a street is NOT allowed at any time.

The Contractor shall maintain a three-foot width of clear sidewalk to allow free passage through the work area to pedestrians at all times. Convenient access to all abutting property shall be maintained at all times.

In the event that on-street parking is hindering construction work, Contractor may apply for an encroachment permit to eliminate existing on street parking during actual periods of construction. Contractor shall submit plans, indicating the locations and the number of parking spaces to be eliminated during construction and the duration of such elimination, for approval. Encroachment permit can be applied for at the Engineering Division, 1401 Marina Way So. for which the fees will be waived. Contractor shall submit encroachment permit application 5 working days before work begins.

All traffic and regulatory signs, lights, barriers, steel plates, barricades, flagging and other traffic control devices required to maintain traffic shall be furnished and installed by the Contractor. Construction signing and marking shall conform to the current "Manual of Traffic Controls for Construction and Maintenance Work Zones" issued by the State of California, Department of Transportation.

Full compensation for maintaining traffic, complying with these Special Provisions and for furnishing flagging if required and signing shall be considered as included in the prices paid for the various contract items of work and no additional compensation will be allowed therefor.

10-1.07 Obstructions

Attention is directed to Section 8-1.10, "Utility and Non-highway Facilities" and Section 15, "Existing Highway Facilities" of the Standard Specifications and these Special Provisions.

Attention is directed to the presence of underground utilities in the construction area. The Contractor shall exercise due caution in performing his work so as to not damage the utilities. The Contractor shall obtain existing utility locations by contacting the USA Locating Service, telephone number (1-800) 642-2444, at least two working days prior to performing any excavation. Contractor shall make his own determination if existing utilities need to be carefully excavated ("potholed") to determine actual location and depth prior to sanitary sewer pipe installation. If needed, Contractor shall include the cost of all potholes in the unit price bid for the sanitary sewer pipe installation. No separate payment for potholes will be made.

Utilities and underground pipelines, which are to remain in place shall be worked around and protected from damage or interruption of service. The Contractor shall notify the City and the responsible utility company when any utility must be relocated or set to grade by the utility company in order for the Contractor to complete the Scope of Work.

Full compensation for conforming to the requirements of this Special Provision, not otherwise provided for, shall be considered as included in the prices paid for the various contract items of work and no separate payment will be made therefor.
NOTE: Where these specifications cannot provide clear direction as to work and materials to be provided, such will be provided by the Contractor as “the best of industry standards” with reference to “California Landscape Standards” by the California Landscape Contractor’s Association. The Engineer shall provide interpretation, authorization and direction. The construction related aspects of these technical specifications apply to repair work and extra work and do not assure that the Contractor will be given any or all extra work to be performed automatically. The Engineer and Contractor will agree on term and scope of extra work prior to performance.

10-2.01 Building Clearance Requirements -- All vegetation must be mowed to less than 3" within 100’ of all structures in the service area.

10-2.02 Roadway Clearance Requirements - All vegetation within 10' of roadways shall be maintained to less than 3”.

10-2.03 Tank Site Clearance Requirements -- (16 fuel tank sites) shall be maintained at a height less than 3” during the summer and fall months.

10-2.04 Typical Maintenance Tasks:

Schedule of typical vegetation and landscape maintenance services additional work may be required if determined by the City inspector/representative.

**March-October:** Priority to be on fire fuel reduction

**November-February:** Priority to be on storm water runoff and debris clean up

1. Inspect and keep free of debris all applicable drains, inlets, grates, v-ditches, culverts etc. (particularly from mid-October to mid-April).
2. Keep Mowed/Weed whipped all grasses and other flammable vegetation required specifications and supporting maps to a satisfactory height. Typically no more than 6”, (particularly from March to October)
3. Inspect roadways, including Western Drive and all other roads throughout the designated property, for any debris and clean as needed. Typically use a back pack blower to blow off areas that receive frequent droppings from trees or other organic matter present.
4. Elevate any tree limbs along roadways or within the designated maintenance areas that are below 12’ to allow for vehicle travel.
5. Remove any downed tree limbs within the project area that has a diameter of 6” or less. Any tree limbs larger than 6” diameter will be considered additional work and subject to approval prior to removal.
6. Remove litter from roadways and project site as needed
7. Mow turf within the “Point Molate Beach Park” Every two weeks from April through November.
8. Prune vegetation at intersections to ensure sufficient line of site.
9. All fence lines within the project site are to receive vegetation maintenance on both sides to maintain a 2' buffer.
9.00.040 Definitions.

The definitions set forth in Section 9.20.010 of this Code shall be applicable to the provisions contained in this chapter. In addition, the following words shall have the following specified meanings:
(a) "Board of Appeals" means the body defined and created by Section 6.02.130 of this Code.
(b) "Director of Public Works" means the Director of the Public Works Department of the City of Richmond and any authorized representative thereof.
(c) "Owner," in addition to the definition set forth in Section 9.20.010 of this Code, the term "owner" also means the occupant, lessee or interested holder in real property, as the case may be.
(d) "Property" means premises, as defined by Section 9.20.010 of this Code. This term shall also include any portion of any public street or right-of-way which the owner of adjoining property has the responsibility to maintain.
(e) "Rubbish" means any cast-off, damaged, discarded, junked, obsolete, salvage, scrapped, unusable, worn out or wrecked object, thing or material composed in whole or in part of asphalt, bitumen, carbon, cemment, plastic or other synthetic substance, fibre, glass, metal, paper, plaster, plaster of paris, rubber, terra cotta, wool, cotton, cloth, canvas, organic matter or other substance, having no substantial market value or requiring readjusting in order to be used for its original purpose. The term rubbish shall also include "solid waste" as defined in Section 9.20.010 of this Code.
(f) "Weed" means any plant, or any part of a plant, including but not limited to seeds, seedlings, roots, branches, trunk, root crown suckers, or rhizomes suckers, that is out of place and is therefore a pest causing a fire hazard, traffic hazard, visual blight, ecological detriment of other risk to the public interest. A weed can be annual, biennial or perennial in reproductive habit and take the form of, but not be limited to, a tree, bush, ground cover, sedge, grass, vine, bulb or aquatic species. All weeds that are listed as noxious or quarantined by the federal and state governments or which are invasive exotic species are included. Periodically, the Contra Costa Agricultural Commissioner or the City of Richmond Pest and Control Advisor, licenses in category "E," can deem a plant species a weed to address a localized pest problem.
(g) "Invasive Exotic Species" means invasive and aggressive non-native plants which tend to spread into the surrounding ecosystems and displace native plants because they are more aggressive in their growth habits, or because they put out more seed that lasts longer in the soil, or because there is nothing to eat them, compete with them, or disease them in the California ecosystem.

Invasive exotic species that may be found in Richmond include, but are not limited to, the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scientific Name</th>
<th>Common Name</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Carpobrotus edulis</td>
<td>Iceplant</td>
<td>Invades many coastal communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centaurea solstitialis C</td>
<td>Yellow starthistle</td>
<td>Invades grasslands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coluteaster pannonica C. lactea</td>
<td>Coluteaster</td>
<td>Invades many coastal communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cortaderia jubata</td>
<td>Andean pampas grass,</td>
<td>Invades coastal habitats</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cortaderia selloana</td>
<td>Pampas grass</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cynara cardunculus</td>
<td>Artichoke thistle</td>
<td>Invades grasslands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyttisus scoparius C</td>
<td>Scotch broom</td>
<td>Invades grasslands, CA-FF, Cyttisus scoparius C Scotch broom Invades coastal thicket, oak woodlands, Sierra foothills</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Kyle, it has come to my attention that certain provisions associated with the Point Molate Landscape maintenance Contract are not being met. After our site visit and inspection on January 21, 2016 we have seen no progress or examples of the seasonal work necessary. I have been entrusted as agent for the City of Richmond to report on the progress and effectiveness of D & H Landscaping to fulfill the maintenance contract.

Specifically, under Section 10 Project Details, sub-section 10-2.02 Roadway Clearance Requirements – All vegetation within 10’ of roadway shall be maintained to less than 3”. As we both observed and discussed on 1/21/16, there is plenty of overgrowth throughout the project area and most of which is near the 3’ mark. If D & H has attempted to start meeting this requirement, then could we meet and document where. As was pointed out on last site visit, there are several mapping tools that could ease your reporting requirements and show good faith. Keep in mind that these requirements are a part of the fuel reduction and accessibility issues.

Under Tank Site Clearance Requirements sub-section 10-2.03, the description list 16 fuel tank site, but there are 20 within the outlined property. Requirement – shall be maintained at a height less than 3” during Summer and Fall months. It was recently observed that native bunch grasses and Juncus species were re-growing naturally during this rest period. It would be preferred that they not be mowed to the standard listed in these requirements, but be saved and allowed to spread. Each fuel tank site has unique properties with indigenous plant species returning. Many of these meet the soil holding, low fuel load, that was once naturally there. Let’s work together in identifying these unique spaces, thus reducing your work load. As with every site it will be necessary to maintain the perimeter to the standard including fallen tree branches and mowing to 3”.

Additionally in Section 1C Project Details, sub-section 10-2.04, Typical Maintenance Task, there is listed seasonal priorities. In particular the November-February priority on storm water runoff and debris clean up. There are 9 listed goals of which we have not seen any activity except blowing off fallen leaves along roadways. We are concerned with v-ditches and culverts not being effective because they are filled with debris. In cooperation with the volunteer group Friends of Point Molate and the City of Richmond Parks, requirement #7 (mowing of turf at PMBP) has been eliminated. This means that no activity is required at the beach park or along Stenmark Drive in front of the park. Here’s another labor saving to you allowing you to re-direct your team. The volunteer group is very pleased with no contract activity in or in front of the park.

I would like to be able to report next month to the property owners that the contract is being met satisfactorily. We can meet anytime to discuss details and walk through site specific activity. Detail information of where your landscape team has been would be helpful in monitoring this project. I realize and do not expect it to be completed immediately, but would like to see an attempt towards that goal.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Contract Requirements and Compliance</th>
<th>South Watershed</th>
<th>North Watershed</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>February 12, 2017</td>
<td>Vegetation within 10' of roadways shall be maintained to &lt; 3&quot;. Native species to be protected</td>
<td>NO NO NO NO NO NO NO NO</td>
<td>NO NO NO</td>
<td>1. not corrected since fall, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-2.02 Roads</td>
<td>Inspect and keep free of debris all applicable drains, inlets, etc.</td>
<td>unk unk unk unk unk unk unk unk</td>
<td>unk unk unk</td>
<td>2. hanging wires and tree limb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-2-04.0 Typical Maintenance Tasks</td>
<td>Keep mowed/weed whipped all grasses and other flammable vegetation required per specs and supporting maps, typically ≤ 6&quot;</td>
<td>NO NO NO NO NO NO NO NO</td>
<td>NO NO NO</td>
<td>prepared by Jim Hanson for Pt. Molate Community Advisory Committee, 2-16-17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Inspect roadways for any debris and clean as needed.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. Road edges mowed, but northern coastal scrub and coastal prairie conserved per contract</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Elevate tree limbs along road sides or within designated maint. Areas below 12'</td>
<td>NO (1)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Remove downed tree limbs within project area ≤ 6&quot; dia.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Remove litter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Mow turf in Beach Park every 2 weeks - April to Nov.</td>
<td>N/A - Contractor does not mow park - community volunteer management since contract awarded in 2015</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Prune at intersections for line of sight</td>
<td>NO NO NO NO NO NO NO NO</td>
<td>NO NO NO</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Maintain 2' buffer along fence lines within project site</td>
<td>NO NO NO NO NO NO NO NO</td>
<td>NO NO NO</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-2.03 Tank Sites</td>
<td>(16 fuel tank sites) shall be maintained to &lt; 3&quot; during the summer and fall months</td>
<td>n/a n/a n/a #17 #16 #18, 19</td>
<td>#13, 10, 11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-2.01 Buildings</td>
<td>All vegetation within 100' of all structures maintained to less than 3&quot;</td>
<td>NO n/a n/a unk</td>
<td>Yes Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
REPORT FROM THE FIELD: WORK ACCOMPLISHED IN MARCH 2017

POINT MOLATE FRIENDS, April 4, 2017

The rain has continued, interspersed with some delightful sunny weather. The weeds have been very lush, but so far we have kept up with them—even though they are thick, plentiful and tall, and walking through them can seem like wading. Cat’s Ears, with their thick tap root and bristly leaves, are much in evidence as are big stretches of a pesky wild geranium, of vetch and other invaders. On the other hand the rare rumex crassus has shown up, also the once plentiful, now rare meadow barley grass, and the beautiful California state grass, purple needlegrass (Nassella pulchra). Buttercups and Juncus are appearing too. The south end of the Beach Park is in good shape for now, Jim McKissock says, and we have pulled weeds and broom and mowed the north end of the Park, hoping soon, with good weather, to reach the north end.

One Tuesday, March 14th, we were rained out. By now we have a double rain year. Jim McKissock reports that at his house the rainfall measures 37.35 inches, and he thinks that the amount at Point Molate is higher. Rain is predicted for this Friday—which means more mowing and weeding for us.

Jim McKissock has been in touch with the four new owners of Point San Pablo Harbor, and one Tuesday we drove over there and met, in the newly renovated, very pleasant Sportsmen’s Bar, with one of them, Yaella Frankel, who is currently staying at the property with her husband. She outlined most articulately plans her group have made for fixing up the property, propagating wild vegetation there, and developing a plan for a work training program that would benefit us as well.

COMMUNITY MEMBERS WHO HAVE CONTRIBUTED THEIR TIME THIS MONTH: Jim McKissock; Paul Carman; Mike Eichenholz; Tom Gehling; Dorothy Gilbert; Chia Hamilton; Jim Hanson; Tom Johnson; Joe Pulco; Charles Smith; Carol Teltschick; and Barbara Thompson. Despite the one Tuesday we lost to the rain, 70-80 person-hours were contributed overall.

Dorothy Gilbert
Sportsman Bar Point San Pablo Inside is new and nifty

Rumex crassus rare
Meadow barley quite rare now

Purple needle grass CA State grass