

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE HPC MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 14, 2021

Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

Virtual

July 13, 2021

5:30 p.m.

MINUTES

Roll Call:

Chair McNamara called the meeting to order at 5:35 p.m.

Present: Chair Robin McNamara; Vice Chair Joann Pavlinec; Commissioners Fatema Crane, Caitlin Hibma, Michael Hibma, and Gretchen M. Stromberg

Absent: Commissioner Jonathan Haeber

Staff: Jonelyn Whales

Approval of Minutes:

June 8, 2021

ACTION: It was M/S/C (M. Hibma/Pavlinec) to approve the minutes for June 8, 2021; approved by voice vote: 5-0-2 Ayes: McNamara, C. Hibma, M. Hibma, Pavlinec, Stromberg; Noes: None; Absent: Haeber, Crane
--

Meeting Procedures:

None.

Public Forum:

No speakers

Liaison Reports:

There was no liaison present and no reports.

Consent Calendar:

None

Public Hearing: None.

Commission Business:

- | | |
|---------------|--|
| 1. PLN21-160: | Brickyard Landing Chimney/Kilns Stabilization and Preservation Project |
| Description | STUDY SESSION TO RECEIVE AND PROVIDE INPUT ON THE HISTORIC STRUCTURES SPECIFICATION (HSS) REPORT TO STABILIZE AND PRESERVE THE HISTORIC BRICKYARD CHIMNEY AND KILN STRUCTURES OF THE BRICKYARD LANDING HOMEOWNER'S ASSOCIATION |
| Location | 1223 BRICKYARD COVE LANE |
| Zoning | PA, PLANNED AREA DISTRICT |
| APN | 560-480-002 |

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE HPC MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 14, 2021

Applicant MICHAEL CARNALL, BRICKYARD LANDING HOMEOWNER'S ASSOCIATION
Staff Contact JONELYN WHALES Recommendation: **PROVIDE & RECEIVE COMMENTS**

Ms. Whales announced that the item is a study session regarding the Page and Turnbull historical structure report that the homeowner's association (HOA) has done. Page and Turnbull made recommendations on how to stabilize and preserve the historical structure. Staff is seeking input from the Commission on the best form of preservation treatment for the project.

Mike Cornell explained that the structure is a remnant of the Los Angeles Stress Work Company. He noted that there has been no effort to stabilize or preserve the kilns or the chimney. Over the years, the HOA has had several analyses completed on the chimney and all have indicated that the structure will likely fall if there is an earthquake. No analysis has been done for the kilns. The HOA has approached the City and they advised the HOA to have a historical structure report done. The HOA sought further investigation from Pullman Services, a contractor, who did a drone analysis of the top of the structure. The top of the chimney is more fragile than expected due to exposure to weather.

One option suggested is to dismantle the chimney to a stable height to mitigate any damage that it may cause if it does collapse. That would cost roughly \$100,000. The other option is to dismantle the chimney to a stable height and then rebuild it. The cost for that would start at \$200,000. If the chimney is restored, reinforcements would have to be placed inside to make it stable enough to withstand an earthquake. If the reinforcement system is installed, that would likely cost an additional \$100,000.

Mr. Cornell disclosed that the kilns are a dome-shaped structure and are held together by the straps around the outside of the dome walls. Kiln two has two viable straps that are still at three-quarters of their full thickness, but both kilns suffer from broken or rusted straps.

The HOA would like to restore and preserve the kilns if possible. He noted his personal preference is to preserve the kilns and reduce the height of the chimney so that it is stable.

Commissioner C. Hibma disclosed that she was contacted by Bonnie Joe Coulson, president of the Point Richmond History Association, and there was a discussion about the project.

Vice Chair Pavlinec asked if Page and Turnbull will be at the next meeting and if the HOA is proposing to move forward with the recommendations made by Pullman Services. Ms. Whales confirmed that Page and Turnbull will be present the next time the item comes before the Commission. Mr. Cornell answered yes, those are the steps the HOA is wishing to pursue but the work and costs may increase once work begins.

Vice Chair Pavlinec noticed that Pullman Services has proposed to have the original bricks disposed of and Page and Turnbull recommends that the bricks be stored on-site. Mr. Cornell explained that the \$60,000 charge in Page and Turnbull's report is to clean the bricks and prepare them for storage.

Chair McNamara suggested to store the bricks on the ground. Mr. Cornell indicated that he is not an expert on storing bricks, but there are a lot of them and he predicted that the mortar would have to be cleaned off them.

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE HPC MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 14, 2021

Vice Chair Pavlinec inquired what the cost is to dispose of the bricks. Mr. Cornell announced that it is not clear how that process works but the HOA is investigating it. Vice Chair Pavlinec predicted that the quote from Page and Turnbull includes the cost of disposing of the bricks.

Commissioner Stromberg summarized that Pullman Services provided a cost proposal to the HOA last June of 2020 and then they provided an updated cost proposal in June of 2021. Pullman Services provided an additional updated cost proposal after Page and Turnbull made their assessment in June of 2021. Mr. Cornell confirmed that is correct. Commissioner Stromberg noted that Pullman Services' final quote incorporated Page and Turnbull's recommendation to disassemble the chimney to half of its current height.

Vice Chair Pavlinec asked if Pullman Services will dismantle the chimney by half and then repair the lower half so that the chimney is stable. Mr. Cornell answered yes.

Vice Chair Pavlinec asked if the HOA supports having half the chimney dismantled or only 50-feet. Mr. Cornell disclosed that his recommendation is to dismantle the chimney by half of its existing height. Vice Chair Pavlinec noted that the greater the height difference, the more representative the chimney is. She suggested installing metal or some type of structure on top of the chimney after it's been deconstructed to represent the original height.

Commissioner C. Hibma supported Vice Chair Pavlinec idea of installing a ghost framework that represents the height of the original chimney.

Chair McNamara also supported that idea.

Commissioner M. Hibma suggested having a plaque near the structure that shows the original chimney along with a physical ghost structure on top. He said partially demolishing a historic resource and then leaving it is not compliant with Secretary of the Interior Standards. He agreed that partial demolition and salvaging the existing bricks is the right approach. Any partial demolition should be reconstructed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior Standards.

Vice Chair Pavlinec mentioned that the historic structure is a local resource and it was not analyzed to see if it is eligible for the National Register. Commissioner M. Hibma agreed that there is no clear statement on the status of the historic structure, but confirmed that it is listed on the City of Richmond's Historic Register.

Commissioner M. Hibma noted that a partial demolition is considered a project under the California Quality Environmental Act (CEQA). Vice Chair Pavlinec believed that if the structure is not listed on the National Register, the project would not require a CEQA analysis.

Vice Chair Pavlinec suggested that the applicant work with the Richmond Arts Commission to possibly receive a grant to build a structure that mimics the height of the chimney. Commissioner C. Hibma added local metalworkers may also be able to help with installation.

Vice Chair Pavlinec reported that there is consensus among the Commission that the bricks have to be removed from the top half of the chimney.

Chair McNamara wanted to see the bricks sold by the HOA to pay for further restoration of the structure instead of having the bricks disposed of by the contractor. Vice Chair Pavlinec agreed. Commissioner C. Hibma disclosed that the Commission can recommend that there be proper documentation of the existing chimney and that the bricks go to a specific cause or use. Vice

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE HPC MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 14, 2021

Chair Pavlinec shared that another option is to give the bricks to local artists for art projects. Mr. Cornell noted that there has been discussion of using the bricks in a decorative design in the neighborhood.

Commissioner M. Hibma recommended that the applicant remove vines or plants that have attached themselves to the kilns if possible. Also, provide temporary structural support to the kilns while the work on the chimney takes place. Mr. Cornell explained that one of the kilns is in declining disrepair and any type of temporary structure may cause further damage.

Commissioner C. Hibma asked if the HOA has erected the fence that was recommended by Page and Turnbull. Mr. Cornell acknowledged that there is a fence around the structure currently but not the full length of the recommended fence because the structure resides right next to the neighborhood pool.

Vice Chair Pavlinec indicated that after some investigation, none of the folks at Pullman Services have a historic background or have expertise in historic preservation. In the Page and Turnbull report, they recommend that the project be overseen by a person with historic expertise. She emphasized that it is important to maintain the integrity of what is left and that a historical structural engineer should oversee construction. Commissioner C. Hibma and Commissioner M. Hibma agreed. Mr. Cornell acknowledged that they have not identified a structural engineer to work on the kilns and he encouraged the Commission to provide suggestions. Commissioner Stromberg agreed that Wiss, Janney, Elstner Associates (WJE) have done a lot of great work.

Commissioner Crane asked, based on the recommendations provided by Page and Turnbull, if the Commission is discussing the demolition and rehabilitation options for the chimney and kilns. Commissioner C. Hibma explained that the partial demolition option is what the HOA prefers.

Vice Chair Pavlinec believed that the project can be categorized as an emergency project which would exempt it from CEQA review. Commissioner Crane believed that because the item is not an action item, that assumption is not needed.

Commissioner Crane asked if the item will come back to the Commission for action and if so, when. Commissioner M. Hibma concurred that the item will come back to the Commission and Vice Chair Pavlinec note that it will come after the HOA decides what approach they want to pursue.

Commissioner Crane wanted the applicant to come back with a proposal regarding demolition as well as a proposal for reconstruction. She did not support a proposal for demolition that did not include reconstruction and her preference is a proposal for rehabilitation.

Commissioner C. Hibma shared that rehabilitation and/or reconstruction is the preferred approach, but the Commission should be sensitive to cost as well as City policy.

Vice Chair Pavlinec supported Commissioner C. Hibma's comments as well as removing the top half of the chimney. She wanted to see a plan that shows what the HOA plans to do to the structure over the next 10-years.

Commissioner C. Hibma was concerned that reconstruction is likely not to happen if it is not done right away.

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE HPC MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 14, 2021

Commissioner M. Hibma noted that it will help the HOA to have a comprehensive overall plan for the chimney and the kilns. Then when subsequent projects come along, the process will be more streamlined. If the chimney is to be partially demolished, there needs to be a laid-out timeframe that includes milestones.

Mr. Cornell reported that the HOA will come up with a plan and he believed the first step will be to make the chimney safe and stabilize the kilns.

Commissioner M. Hibma shared that there is a group that specializes in bricks. He suggested the applicant reach out to them and leverage their network and expertise.

Jeff Fines, the HOA member, commented that he has been taking notes and that the HOA will be discussing the item at their next meeting.

Commissioner C. Hibma suggested that the applicant research the Secretary of the Interior Standards before submitting a proposal. Vice Chair Pavlinec added that the applicant should reference the Technical Bulletins as well.

Chair McNamara restated that there needs to be a plan in place that goes beyond the first steps.

Commissioner Crane asked when will the Commission be meeting in person again. Ms. Whales answered that the City is waiting for the county to decide when in-person meetings will begin.

Adjournment - The Commission adjourned at 6:45 p.m. to August 10, 2021.