

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE HPC MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 13, 2022

**Historic Preservation Commission Meeting
Virtual**

August 23, 2022
5:30 p.m.

MINUTES

Roll Call:

Chair Pavlinec called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m.

Present: Chair Joann Pavlinec; Vice Chair Caitlin Hibma; Commissioners Linda Hemmila and Michael Hibma

Absent: Commissioners Fatema Crane, Jonathan Haeber and Gretchen M. Stromberg

Staff: Jonelyn Whales

Approval of Minutes: None

Meeting Procedures:

Chair Pavlinec stated that any decision approved may be appealed in writing to the City Clerk within ten (10) days, or by Tuesday, September 6, 2022 by 5:00 p.m.

Public Forum: No speakers

Liaison Reports:

There was no liaison present and no reports.

Consent Calendar: None

Commission Business:

A. Commission member reports, requests, or announcements –

Commissioner M. Hibma reported Vice Chair C. Hibma and himself were working with the Richmond Historic Museum to nominate the Carnegie Library for the National Register.

Chair Pavlinec requested that the Commissioners inform the Commission when the nomination was going before the State Historic Resource Commission.

Vice Chair C. Hibma mentioned she had ex-parte communications with the property at 207 Nicholl. She encouraged the applicant to discuss the next steps with the Planning Department and the full Commission.

Chair Pavlinec mentioned that the State's Budget included a \$36 million commitment to the regional park at Point Molate and that funding potentially included the winery.

Public Hearing:

1. PLN22-242: FERRY POINT PIER RESTORATION PROJECT

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE HPC MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 13, 2022

Description	PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A MAJOR ALTERATION PERMIT TO REMOVE THE PIER AT FERRY POINT IN THE MILLER/KNOX REGIONAL SHORELINE, TO PREVENT FURTHER DECAY AND TO PRESERVE THE GANTRY STRUCTURE.
Location	900 DORNAN DRIVE, RICHMOND, (MILLER/KNOX REGIONAL SHORELINE)
Zoning	PR, PARKS AND RECREATION
APN	N/A, THE NEAREST ONSHORE APN IS 561-010-006
Applicant	EDWARD WILLIS, EAST BAY REGIONAL PARK DISTRICT
Staff Contact	JONELYN WHALES
Recommendation:	CONDITIONAL APPROVAL

Devan Reiff, a Principle Planner with East Bay Regional Park District, acknowledged that Ferry Point Pier is a City landmark on the Richmond Historic Register as well as listed on the Historic Resources Inventory. Over the last several decades, the pier had decayed and parts of the pier had washed away. The proposal was to demolish the pier but restore the steel gantry structure, the car apron and the concrete fishing pier. Construction would last 8-weeks and was to begin as soon as October 2022. The steel gantry was located between the north and central wharves.

Anna Marie Guerrero, Cultural Services Coordinator for the Park District, gave a summary of the history of the pier. In 1898, the Santa Fe Railroad line was expanded from Sacramento to a new terminal at Point Richmond. Freight operations began May 1, 1900, and the first passenger train arrived on July 3, 1900. The Santa Fe Railroad shops were relocated to Richmond in 1900 which prompted the construction of the Ferry Point Pier. The pier consisted of three fingers with the north pier used for railroad freight cars and the central pier used for passengers. The car ferry apron included a hydraulic lift that was used to transport freight cars from the land to the water by lifting the freight cars up and down. By 1915, a second freight slip was constructed at the tip of the northern wharf which included a second hydraulic lift with a car apron. Several improvements and ongoing maintenance were made during the year 1939. Passenger use was discontinued in 1904 when Santa Fe Railroad moved passenger drop-off to Oakland, California. The rail ferry service in Richmond was suspended during World War II. It resumed in 1919 but was discontinued in 1933. The pier on the southern side of the passenger ferry slip was removed between 1939 and 1946. Santa Fe Railroad continued car float operations at Ferry Point Pier until 1970 when it was permanently closed. The terminal shed was dismantled in 1973 and major changes were completed to the northern pier between 1971 and 1980.

In 1972, the Park District acquired the land and renamed the area George Miller Regional Shoreline. The State Lands Commission owns the land below the pier. The concrete fishing pier was completed in 2001.

Mr. Reiff remarked in January 2021, a large portion of the northern pier collapsed into the Bay and began heading out into the neighboring shipping channel. Under an emergency contract, the Park District hired a marine engineer to remove the pier from the water. After a second collapse, the Park District hired Moffatt and Nichol to evaluate the current conditions of the pier. Moffatt and Nichol concluded that over 70 percent of the timber piles, as well as the fender walls, had severe deterioration. The superstructure was in fair condition but the extent of the deterioration made it not feasible to restore the pier to its original configuration.

Moffatt and Nichol explored several options for next steps. The first was to repair the pier and demolish the portions of the pier that could not be repaired. That alternative would preserve the

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE HPC MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 13, 2022

pier for another 20 to 30 years but then would require full demolition. The other option was to demolish the structure and remove it, which was what the Park District was proposing. That alternative removed all of the wooden piles, retained the gentry crane, the apron structure and the concrete fishing pier. This alternative was viewed favorably by the other regulatory agencies and it supported restoration goals for the Bay. The project was reviewed under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and was found to be exempt under Emergency Permits.

Ms. Guerrero shared that the Park District mailed out nine letters and made phone calls to public and private organizations involved with historic resources. Several agencies requested documentation about the project, some suggested that historical signage be installed at the site, and one provided maps and drawings of the original pier.

Mr. Reiff noted that the project met several restoration goals. It also improved the habitat for eelgrass, removed floating debris hazards from the Bay and removed toxic treated wood.

Ms. Guerrero added that the resource will be documented by using the Historic American Engineering Record documentation, drone photography and videography will be done, and supplemental interpreted panels will be installed. The Park District had begun a Historic American Engineering Record (HAER) with a Historic American Building and Historic American Landscape Survey.

Vice Chair C. Hibma requested clarification on where the car apron was located and details about removing the railing. Ms. Guerrero clarified that the rails would remain on site. The access pier to the car apron would be removed due to deterioration.

Commissioner M. Hibma asked if restoration of the gantry included repairs, cleaning and an ongoing maintenance plan. Glen Gilchrest, Design Manager, and Civil Engineer, explained there is no way to maintain or restore historic pilings other than to place a fiberglass jacket on them which dramatically changed their appearance. Ms. Guerrero added that the permit with the U.S Corp of Engineers would outline a maintenance plan for the gantry. Commissioner M. Hibma requested a Secretary of Interior's Standards analysis for preservation be done for the gantry and be presented to the Commission for review.

Chair Pavlinec stated the interpretive panel closest to the project was very good but was recently vandalized and should be replaced. She agreed with Commissioner M. Hibma about having a Secretary of Interior's Standards analysis done for the gantry. She strongly recommended a Condition of Approval that the applicant prepare a technical condition assessment to evaluate for appropriate maintenance and/or repairs to ensure the long-term preservation of the structures. Also, that maintenance and/or repairs be implemented in a phased-in approach.

Vice Chair C. Hibma reminded the Commission that recently it required a draft preservation plan for future maintenance for a different project and encouraged that to happen for this project as well.

Chair Pavlinec recommended the Commission establish a timeline for a preservation plan for the gantry and the car apron. Also, that maintenance and preventive measure be taken to avoid future deterioration.

Vice Chair C. Hibma suggested that Condition of Approval #6 be changed to read that the interpretative panels be reviewed by the Commission. Chair Pavlinec agreed and added that any

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE HPC MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 13, 2022

repairs to existing panels be reviewed by the Commission. Ms. Guerrero noted that all of the interpretive panels could be found on the Park District's website.

Commissioner M. Hibma requested there be a hard copy of the final HAER recommendations be placed at the Richmond Museum of History. He shared that on a recent HAER project he was involved with, the local agency required 3-D recordation of the historic resource and he encouraged that recordation happens as well for the project. Ms. Guerrero believed that type of recordation and data could be accomplished with a drone.

Chair Pavlinec asked if the rails falling in the water from the car apron were the only rails or where their others. Ms. Guerrero believed those were the only rails that would be removed. Chair Pavlinec suggested keeping the rails and exploring with the Public Art Commission if those rails could be used for public art. Ms. Whales confirmed she would share the applicant's contact information with the staff liaison for the Public Art Commission. Commissioner M. Hibma mentioned that the Golden State Railroad Museum had a collection yard behind it and suggested that the rails be stored there for a length of time.

Commissioner M. Hibma proposed a motion.

Chair Pavlinec proposed a friendly amendment.

Mr. Reiff asked if the conditions in the motion were in addition to the proposed Conditions of Approval in the staff report and Vice Chair C. Hibma answered yes.

Lisa Goorjian, Chief of Design and Construction, appreciated the proposed conditions recommended in the motion. She expressed concern about placing a timeline on the restoration of the project because of funding and time constraints.

Chair Pavlinec asked what a reasonable timeframe was to seek out funding. Ms. Goorjian confirmed the Park District could begin the assessment immediately but was concerned about preservation work, the cost for the work, and regulations associated with preservation. Ms. Guerrero suggested after the assessment was complete, the Park District and the Commission reconvene in a year to discuss a timeline for implementation.

Vice Chair C. Hibma supported Ms. Guerrero's suggestion.

Chair Pavlinec wanted to see a shorter timeline for implementation and Commissioner M. Hibma requested monthly updates. Chair Pavlinec recommended the Park District return in 6-months with an update and the maximum time to complete the technical condition assessment was 8-months.

Chair Pavlinec requested that a liaison from the Public Art Commission come to a future Historic Preservation Commission.

ACTION: It was M/S/C (M. Hibma, C. Hibma) to adopt the staff's findings for the partial demolition of the Ferry Point structure with the following Conditions of Approval appended to the existing Conditions of Approval in the staff report: a technical condition assessment of the gantry structure be prepared to prevent the further deterioration of the structure and that a tentative implementation plan be carried out to ensure its long term preservation. The Commission would like to see the technical condition assessment be prepared in 6-months and then come before the Commission in 8-months. Secondly, that the Historic Preservation Commission have the

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE HPC MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 13, 2022

opportunity to review the draft interpretive panels for the project. Third, the replacement of damaged or missing interpretive panels related to the resource is installed. Fourth, that the rails on the car apron structure that are hanging or falling off be identified, salvaged, and either stored at the Golden State Railroad Museum property or at a suitable location on the project site and that the rails be made available for a public art project; which carried by voice vote: 4-0-3 Ayes: Pavlinec, C. Hibma, Hemmila, M. Hibma; Noes: None; Absent: Crane, Haeber, Stromberg.

Commissioner Hemmila reported that several text passages had been approved for the Rooted in Richmond App and encouraged other Commissioners to send her information for more text passages.

Chair Pavlinec mentioned that some of the photos proposed for the Nystrom neighborhood were referenced as not being taken in the Nystrom neighborhood. Ms. Whales commented she would ask Commissioner Haeber. Chair Pavlinec inquired how she could submit pictures and Vice Chair C. Hibma answered they should be uploaded to Google drive.

Commissioner M. Hibma shared he sent a text passage to Commissioner Haeber about environmental justice.

Adjournment - The Commission adjourned at 7:00 p.m. to September 13, 2022.