

City of Richmond – POINT MOLATE COMMUNITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Multi-Purpose Room
440 CIVIC CENTER PLAZA

MINUTES

MONDAY, September 16, 2013, 6:30 PM

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Whitty called the meeting to order at 6:44 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Committee Members Carman, Gilbert, Hite, Kortz, Martinez, Puleo, Sundance, Whitty.

Absent: Garrett, Rosing, Smith, Stello, Stephenson

Staff Present: Craig K. Murray, Staff Liaison, Development Project Manager II

3. WELCOME AND MEETING PROCEDURES

Whitty welcomed audience. Whitty then explained meeting procedures, and discussed the Speaker Card process.

4. AGENDA REVIEW AND ADOPTION

Whitty reviewed Agenda items and briefed PMCAC on the Agenda order and speakers. Carman moved to go to presentations and then after presentations then decide what items to take on Agenda due to the large number of presentations. Whitty clarified that items 1-7 will be taken first and PMCAC will not need to vote on the action at this time but can reevaluate those remaining items on the Agenda after presentations.

5. ANNOUNCEMENTS THROUGH THE CHAIR

Chair reviewed Cal Trans Notice and indicated that the detour on the bicycle route is no longer needed. Whitty announced that Committee Member Martinez has been reappointed by City Council.

6. OPEN FORUM

No Speakers.

7. PRESENTATIONS, DISCUSSION & ACTION ITEMS

a. Gun Range Improvements Presentation

Whitty introduced the Chevron Richmond Gun Range, partners and Mark Piersante. Piersante introduced himself as an independent environmental consultant working for Chevron for 15 years and provided a narrative of what is developing at the gun range and drawings that were part of the Design Review package submitted to the City in May. Piersante introduced Mark Ayers who Manages Emergency Services for the Refinery, Joe Lorentz who is one of the Public Affairs contacts, and Kevin McMahon who works for HALO, a company that Chevron contracts with to operate the gun range and has guest with him of RPD Sgt.Noonan. Piersante noted that this is a joint effort with the California Maritime Academy to spend some money to improve the gun range. It has been many years since to spend any money to spruce up the gun range that has been there for nearly 60 years. Piersante noted that Cal-FEMA provided a grant to Cal Maritime to improve the gun range. Piersante open it up for questions. Martinez inquired about change in use and if Native Plants will be used. Piersante said no change in use and plan is to remove invasive plants with a standard plan of using Native Plants as planned by Vallier Designs of Pt Richmond. Hite inquired about relationship between refinery and shooting range. Piersante indicated that going back 60 years, it has been Richmond PD and employees that do also use that facility primarily on Saturdays. Whitty inquired if Pt Molate is developed and would that be a problem for the Gun Range. Piersante indicated that he believed there would be no material impact and has looked at gun ranges in Bay Area and some in very exclusive areas and noted that law enforcement in the area should be a benefit to local neighbors. Mark Ayers discussed Cal Maritime involvement and their approaching Gun Range for Hazardous Materials training and Chevron provided the

matching funds. Ayers indicated that Gun Range would be improved to make it safer and cleaner. Ayers said FEMA will come out an audit to make sure government monies are spent wisely. Puleo inquired if range operates on weekend. Piersante indicated yes on weekends for employees and weekdays for agencies. Puleo was concerned about 50 caliber and automatic weapons being fired. Ayers noted that looking at it with RPD that it should be smaller caliber and SWAT teams in limited basis will be there with automatic weapons but it is a small arms range. Whitty expressed thanks to Gun Range team for their presentation.

b. Presentation of California Native Grassland Areas of Point San Pablo Peninsula

Whitty introduced Jim Hanson of the California Native Grasslands Association. Hanson noted that he is a Richmond resident and on the Board of this statewide organization with a mission to restore diversity in the California native grasslands through education, advocacy, research and stewardship. Hanson connected this flash drive to the provided laptop and presented what his organization does and this area is also noted as one of the areas to protect from the East Bay Chapter of the California Native Plant Society. Hanson summarized the variety of uses on the Peninsula but the Native Grassland area near Pt Molate still remains in an area in a coastal bluff area. Hanson noted that there was a survey stake placed recently in this knoll of the southern end of Pt Molate Beach and it is representative of what was here for a long time of approximately 1,000 years and used to show what a native grassland was over the years and noted it is an area with natural wealth. Survey stake, Hanson was relieved to find out, was determined to be for a planned bike route of EBRPD. Hanson noted that this Molate Fescue is drought tolerant, tough erosion-control grass compared to other native grasses and, of course, it is found in and originates in Pt Molate in this coastal prairie. Hanson also noted that this grass is now recognized in the turf trade as Molate Fescue. Hanson further noted that this little knoll is part of a larger Watershed story in the area as found in the US Navy study and in the CEQA process it was pushed to do a larger, detailed accurate grass study in the last development process. Hanson noted that this grass area supports the Eelgrass beds important to the fishing industry, where small fry and herring eggs develop, but it is also important to note that much of the Eelgrass beds in the Bay Area has disappeared. Hanson pointed out some of the old soul antiquity findings such as a large red flowering Toyon shrub that has grown over the years more like a tree.

Hanson noted that Grasslands are important because they are in an area that supports Pollinators with 1,200 species of native bees in California. Bees contribute and are important for preservation of the native grasslands, carbon storage with research in Berkeley and Marin County, they are important for rain water storage and deep roots to take rain water in for ground water recharge. Hanson stated that features in area appear ethereal but are important for water supply, erosion control and biodiversity. Hanson noted that people come to California for this and this is our State's third largest industry and it is important to the economy of the State. Hanson showed picture of yellow flowered shrub, broom, that is a concern because it takes over native areas and it acts as a fuel ladder in connection with blue gum eucalyptus trees in the area. It is called a fuel ladder because it takes the flames up to the crown of the tree and high volatile weeds like broom is an issue. Goal would be a clean sweep of the broom. Hanson noted back in history this area was called in the 1700's as Portrero San Pablo and reason it was called Portrero was the early economic uses of the area as a pasture due to the grasslands. Hanson noted that protection of this area is part of the General Plan.

Sundance questioned if Society has funded for broom removal. Hanson noted that it is done regularly as part of land management and EBRPD uses goats and CCC groups to do that usually under different agencies as part of their budgets. General discussion to coordinate broom pulling areas at Pt Molate. Whitty noted that there is a Community Outreach Committee and may want to coordinate an annual spring clean up.

c. Pt. Molate Security Presentation

Whitty introduced Mr. Michael Davenport, Jr. and noted that there are several months of security reports in the Committee Packet. Mr. Davenport introduced himself and his family owned Richmond based company that has been in business since 1996. Davenport noted that a roving patrol is provided for Pt Molate and covered the areas secured and process of daily entries and monthly reports are provided to RPD Captain Mark Gagan and Craig Murray. Davenport indicated primary concern is trespassers. Davenport explained process of approved Entry Permits and

level of assistance. Hite inquired about Homeland Security and Davenport indicated that they use the Winery. Kortz shared story of DP Staff not knowing what to do when she reported a noxious odor. Davenport indicated that the guard is not there any more and she would have reported it to supervisor to report to Chevron. Davenport introduced his brother Marshall and Operations Manager for the Chevron security contract. DP Security has been Chevron's Security contractor since October, 2012. Carman indicated that two times he visited there was not DP Security that met him but a very accommodating City Staff Member, Caretaker Willie Agnew. Davenport explained Craig would email the approved right of entry and there is a sign in the building that visitors can call DP Security if they are on their rounds. Murray further explained that the Caretaker can and does assist visitors especially when Security is on their rounds. Davenport noted that the guards have radio and cell phone and the sign has the Office phone for radio and the cell number. Carman inquired why security can't be there at the particular time. Davenport noted that Security will wait until a particular time but it does take about 45 minutes to make rounds. Davenport indicated that as long visitors have ID and approved right of entry then security can help with entry. Hite inquired to reduced crime including drugs and prostitution. Davenport shared stories of security coming upon people in past. Murray indicated that it is really helpful for everyone to follow procedures and not to just wander on to the base. Davenport noted good to visit in pairs especially if someone gets hurt. Murray asked Davenport to explain the Deggy system and Davenport indicated how DP Security can track rounds and keeping everyone safe. Carman wanted confirmation of Homeland Security if they can contact visitors directly or go through Security. Murray confirmed that the Security force and point of contact at Point Molate is DP Security. Davenport explained that 70% of their employees are Richmond based and DP can attend any future PMCAC meeting.

d. NCE Contract Scope of Services, Roles and Responsibilities

Whitty summarized that this is a continuation of the item where the PMCAC drafted line by line responsibilities for NCE that Committee would like to see included and advised the City. Whitty noted that a September 17 letter is drafted and left at tables for each Committee member to review. Whitty summarized that there are ten provisions to be included with a new NCE contract that Committee would like to see included but it has been under calendar yet and it stated that it will probably be a six-month temporary contract. Whitty noted that after a six-month contract is approved that the PMCAC requests that a new twelve month contract be drafted for around \$125,000. around these ten items. PMCAC felt that not all items were not getting attention. Murray summarized that additional input from other Committee Members were captured. Whitty agreed and noted that items are there but re-ordered. Whitty called for discussion.

Carman asked if there was a vote in the prior month. Whitty stated that there were two motions but it has been put all into one letter. Carman noted that last month he was the Committee Member that abstained and Whitty asked if Carman would like to change the letter. Carman indicated that he would not like to change the letter. Carman asked Murray if this is appropriate to forward to the Mayor. Murray noted that the PMCAC Staff Liaison is the Mayor but letter may want to be addressed to Mayor and Council to capture the full body. Whitty noted that the correct letter version does show Mayor and City Council. Whitty called for motion. Martinez noted that Mayor is in Ecuador and if this goes to Council. Whitty noted that this is not on tomorrow's City Council meeting. Murray noted that this will be considered at a future date. Hite motioned to approve letter as drafted, seconded by Martinez. All voted in favor with Carman noted as an Abstension. Whitty inquired who will forward to Mayor. Murray indicated that once final is approved by Whitty and forwarded to him that he would forward to entire PMCAC and to Mayor.

Kortz inquired as to why Carman abstained. Carman noted that he is not informed enough with the Request for Proposals and noted that heard Murray's discussion at last meeting regarding problems that could come from this and therefore feels not informed enough to support it or not.

e. Rename Western Drive North of I-580 Stenmark Drive

Whitty noted that this item is informational and no action is needed and this is not related to clean-up and restoration but because there has been so much discussion then the Committee wanted to be informed. Murray noted that Committee Garrett provided alternative suggestions for naming, it came late, and copies are available at desk for review. Hite noted that Stenmark Landing is a great idea but personally is against getting involved in the renaming and does not feel it is the PMCAC responsibility. Whitty noted to PMCAC that it will be heard at City Council tomorrow night as Item H-1.

Carman noted that it is a strange moment to rename a street and believed that many other street names should be done in the future in one fell swoop. Carman noted that the Spanish era of State are well recognized but something that is 20th Century is not as well noted. Carman noted that all eras of history should be noted. Martinez noted that he felt idea is premature and perhaps when Western Drive is reconstructed then it should be considered for renaming.

Whitty reviewed balance of Agenda. Carman noted to keep charging through the Agenda. Whitty inquired when the Consent Calendar can be approved. Murray noted that when the Agenda is approved then the Consent Calendar is approved unless anyone wants to pull an item off the Consent Calendar and then there would be discussion. Whitty called if anyone wanted to pull off the minutes. Whitty moved to adopt Agenda, Martinez seconded. Item approved unanimously.

8. STAFF REPORTS

PROJECT MANAGER'S STAFF REPORT INCLUDING

- a. Report on results from US Navy Escrow Fund Agent RFP
- b. Review of fund balances for Pt Molate General Fund budget and Navy Escrow Account
- c. Report on Nichols Consulting Engineers Contract Status Remediation Activities

Murray reported on five items in board packet for this item. Murray noted that there is a new fiscal agent Union Bank and reported on the balance summary forwarded today from First American to Union Bank. Murray reported on Beach Park progress and meeting with Caretaker on City areas under use in Pt Molate. Whitty noted that a flyer regarding PMCAC Outreach would be helpful. Murray summarized that fund balance prepared by LaShonda White and summarized the NCE costing sheet. Murray also noted that Committee Garrett forwarded out some additional items late and Committee may want to consider carrying this item over since she could not make the meeting. Carman agreed that NCE's Mike Leacox can attend next meeting with Garrett and Carson, attending tonight, can also reattend the next meeting.

General discussion on NCE, Terraphase process regarding IR Site 3 and City proceeding with the FS RAP process on IR Site 3. Carman and Carson discussed process for bidding and how to get to a complete clean-up. Whitty noted that discussion on this will continue to the next meeting.

9. CONSENT CALENDAR

- a. APPROVE – PMCAC meeting minutes of July 15, 2013
- b. APPROVE – PMCAC meeting minutes of August 19, 2013

Whitty moved item previously with Agenda, Martinez seconded. Item approved unanimously.

10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Whitty discussed future items such as All One Ocean, Rosenberg Rules and possible Homeland Security briefing. Sundance inquired about a Grand Opening of Pt Molate Beach. Murray indicated that it is

with Parks Supt. Chamberlain, but since there is a lot of prior help from this Committee, then a proposed date could come from PMCAC. Whitty asked if this could be a future Agenda item. Sundance noted that it could be open prior to next meeting. Hite noted that it would be in early October. Murray noted that he would email PMCAC information from Chamberlain on opening.

11. CITY COUNCIL LIAISON REPORTS

- a. Report by Councilmember/Mayor McLaughlin regarding recent issues in Richmond relevant to the Advisory Committee

Whitty reported that Mayor could not attend.

- b. PMCAC appointment status

Whitty indicated no report but a flyer would be great.

12. CHAIR AND SUB-COMMITTEE REPORT

- a. Clean-Up and Restoration:
 1. Summarization of wet season groundwater monitoring report covering period 1/1/13 to 6/30/13
 2. Report out on 7/23/13 Meeting with NER, NCE, Terraphase, PMCAC & City Staff
 3. Report out on 2nd Qtr SMR for PGWTP
 4. Report out on August Monthly Status Report
 5. Report on 8/15/13 2nd Qtr 2013 UST Monitoring Report

Kortz noted that she did not prepare any report. Carman noted that Garrett wanted item 1 to be on the Agenda and Carson noted that he can report on it. Whitty noted that only Garrett and Kortz are on this Committee and it is important. Carman noted that PMCAC should hold over item 1 for Garrett next month and hear item 2. Carman inquired if anyone attended the July 23 meeting. Hite noted that he attended and had a concern about NER with a pre-established price and foresees a cost overrun just like the SF Bay Bridge project. Whitty asked if there was any further report out on this meeting. Carman asked about NER maintaining a bond for work cost overage and a waste management unit affecting property values. Carson summarized primary items of discussion. Carman noted his concern and any discount for a complete clean up of the site such as Scenario four with excavation without desorption. Carson explained budget and process based on data project has obtained and noted that there could be an option during the bid process and recommends that get Water Board approval first with option prior to bidding. Carman noted he has no objection to Waste Management Unit in theory. Carson agreed that ideal would be nothing out there but there is budget constraint and noted that the US Navy when it allocated money never considered complete removal. Carman motioned that City Staff should consider to complete clean up, consider thermal desorption at the new price, and bidding in clean up in a modulated form as Mr. Carson has described and make a decision on complete clean up after the bids are in. Carson agreed but Thermal thrown in will delay project at least a year. Kortz inquired why one year. Carson indicated CEQA will need to be re-opened and Green House Gas will need to be considered. Carman noted that he visited Pt Molate with three different people and that with Sea level rise IR Site 3 will be under 10 feet of water so what is the difference. Carson noted that the elevation of Site 3 is between 15 to about 20 feet and projection for next 100 years is 3.5 feet so it is unlikely the site will go underwater. Carson noted that the groundwater rise will make it wet in the clean layer above the waste and there should not be a concern. Whitty noted that there was a motion, there was discussion and called for a second. Kortz seconded. Item passed unanimously with Martinez abstained.

Hite inquired about a project permit. Carson noted that only permit is from City after the FS RAP is finished and the Water Board reviews and puts out for formal public comment. Hite inquired about costs. Carson noted that Water Board bills by the hour but does not see those invoices. Martinez inquired what is the Water Board process of approval. Carson noted that approval is sought first from the Water Board for the Waste

Management Unit and then the alternative for complete cleanup such as in Alternative 6. Carson noted that it is important that Water Board knows that it is about Budget and if we can afford it then we can proceed rather than Water Board stating if you thinking about full clean up then just do it without any necessary budget recourse. Carman said the FS RAP should move forward including all alternatives. Carman requested Murray to inform City Manager of motion just made by PMCAC and movement forward on FS RAP. Murray noted that he could summarize and forward out to Chair, PMCAC as well as City Manager.

Whitty inquired about Item 3. Carson noted that this is this is just normal NPDES report. Carman indicated that this was seen already last month. Whitty asked about Item 4 August Monthly Report. Carson noted nothing special really other than Terraphase is waiting for direction on IR Site 3. Whitty noted a good report on the UST Monitoring and all normal and this report was very clear. General questions on the report regarding terminology. Carson noted that we need to get moving on IR Site 3 to get action for next summer.

b. Community Outreach:

Hite reported that there is a new brochure being prepared. A draft of the Committee Brochure was provided at each Committee Members desk. Brochure was prepared by Richmond Resident and Photographer Ellen Gailing. General discussion about proposed changes. Carman noted that there was a lot of people at table at the Solano Stroll. Kortz reported that it was staffed by Citizens for a Sustainable Pt Molate and that there was a lot of interest and a lot of people coming to the table. Kortz noted that Stello, Smith, and Garrett are on the Citizens for a Sustainable Pt Molate group and she could talk to them about input and future events. Whitty mentioned that Richmond Chamber is doing the upcoming tour of Richmond Shoreline and brochures could be made available for that event.

c. Grant Development: Grant App.Status

No report.

d. Pt Molate Beach: Baykeeper Cleanup Completion and current rehabilitation status

No report.

e. Chair: Identification of pending schedule conflicts

No report.

13. ADJOURNMENT

Hite moved to adjourn the meeting at 9:08 pm, seconded by Carman. Passed unanimously.

14. Assemblage of PMCAC Standing Sub-Committees

Adjourned to Sub-Committee Meetings.

15. SCHEDULED MEETINGS

Committee Meeting – .

Monday, October 21, 2013, 6:30 p.m., Multi-Purpose Room, 440 Civic Center Plaza

Minutes respectfully submitted by:



Craig K. Murray, PMCAC Staff Liaison