

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE HPC MEETING ON JUNE 12, 2018

Historic Preservation Commission Meeting
450 Civic Center Plaza, Richmond, CA
1st Floor Lobby
May 8, 2018
4:00 p.m. Tour of Alten Construction Building
5:00 p.m. Regular Meeting

MINUTES

Roll Call:

Chair Cawelti called the meeting to order at 5:10 p.m.

Present: Chair Robin Cawelti; Vice Chair Joann Pavlinec; Commissioners Jonathan Haeber, Michael Hibma, Caitlin Hibma and Paul Scolari

Absent: None

Staff: Jonelyn Whales and Hector Lopez

Approval of Minutes: April 10, 2018

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Scolari/Cawelti) to approve the minutes for April 10, 2018; which carried by the following voice vote: (6-0) Ayes: R. Cawelti, J. Haeber, C. Hibma, M. Hibma, J. Pavlinec, P. Scolari; Noes: None.
--

Meeting Procedures:

Chair Cawelti stated that any decision approved may be appealed in writing to the City Clerk within ten (10) days, or by Monday, May 21, 2018, by 5:00 p.m.

Public Forum: No speakers

Liaison Reports: No liaison reports.

Consent Calendar: None

Public Hearing: No items

- | | |
|---------------------|---|
| 1. PLN18-056 | NEW GARAGE WITH ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT |
| | Study Session for the construction of a two-car garage with an accessory dwelling unit on the upper floor in the Point Richmond Historic District, a National Register Historic District. |
| Location | 50 Nichol Avenue |
| APN | 558-101-012 |
| Zoning | RL-2, Single Family Low Density Residential |
| Owner | Anthony Cassel |
| Applicant | Brad Gunkel |
| Staff Contact | Hector Lopez |
| | Recommendation: Provide Comments |

Senior Planner Lopez summarized the proposed project explaining the removal of existing stucco, new secondary unit constructed over the garage, and modern building style.

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE HPC MEETING ON JUNE 12, 2018

Chair Cawelti asked about regulations prohibiting mimicking a historical structure. Commissioner Pavlinec stated pieces of elements of a historic building could be used in a fake way. It needed to be different from an actual historic building.

Chair Cawelti asked if it was based on the reasonable person standard or expert standard.

Anthony Cassel explained the existing façade of stucco over the original wood lap siding and idea to match the new garage.

Commissioner Hibma asked if there would be any change to the roofline. Mr. Cassel explained that the front façade was not original and was falling apart as work progressed. He stated there were no available photographs of the original roofline.

Commissioner M. Hibma asked if the roofline of the addition would go above the roofline of the house. Mr. Cassel explained that the roofline of the ADU would not be higher than the existing house. He discussed efforts to retain a similar look with the new development and the proposed sea metal roof.

Commissioner M. Hibma stated he had walked past the property. He asked if the house was being elevated and if the property had come before the HPC. Senior Planner Lopez stated a minor alteration was before the Commission in 2017 to increase the height by two-feet. Mr. Cassel explained the idea behind the design for living with parents and to accommodate parking.

Commissioner Scolari stated he did not recall the matter coming before the Commission. He stated he did not have a problem with a secondary unit but expressed concern with the entire project not coming before the Commission.

Commissioner C. Hibma asked if minor permits did not come to the Commission. Senior Planner Lopez explained the infill exemption.

Commissioner M. Hibma suggested additional efforts to find out what the house looked like originally.

Commissioner C. Hibma suggested restoring the existing siding.

Chair Cawelti stated the matter was simply a study session just for the garage. Senior Planner Lopez clarified that the entire house was not to be considered.

Commissioner Haeber discussed the State legislation on ADUs.

Commissioner Haeber Male requested additional information on materials to be used and differentiation. He questioned why raising the house by two feet was a minor alteration.

Anthony Cassel explained that the foundation had to be raised and it was not a noticeable difference.

Commissioner Pavlinec stated it would have been interested in the differentiation. She confirmed that the two-foot change in height had already been approved but changing from parapet to gable roof had not yet been approved. She commented on the proposed ADU and

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE HPC MEETING ON JUNE 12, 2018

indicated the size was not compatible for the neighborhood. She discussed the allowable ADU square footage of other jurisdictions. She questioned why the garage was 9-feet tall.

Mr. Cassel explained that he wanted to have shop space. Commissioner Pavlinec stated she could not make the findings that the project was compatible with the Secretary of the Interior Standards.

Senior Planner Lopez reminded the Commission that the City's regulations allowed 50% of the floor area of the main building.

Commissioner M. Hibma discussed the surrounding properties. He stated he would take materials and scale into consideration.

Senior Planner Lopez stated two story structures with a garage and two story structures were allowed. He indicated concern with the style of the roof looking too modern.

Commissioner Pavlinec opened that a shed roof with a modern design was the key to compatible but differentiated.

Commissioner Haeber discussed similar massing and roofline in the neighborhood. He suggested the ADU be smaller than the primary house.

Mr. Gunkel discussed ADU provisions in surrounding cities. He stated ADUs met housing demands.

Commissioner Scolari stated the City standards and Secretary of the Interior Standards both had to be considered.

Commissioner Scolari stated the addition and raising of the house should have both been considered.

Chair Cawelti discussed the Commission's review of a similar project. She expressed concern with serial projects creating large developments. She suggested tracking square footage changes. She stated it was difficult to determine what the accessory dwelling unit should look like.

Commissioner Haeber discussed case law regarding project splitting.

Mr. Cassel explained that they were not trying to bypass the Commission and process of replacing the foundation leading to the proposed project. He discussed the comments from the Neighborhood Council. He suggested completing the front house and then coming back for the ADU.

Commissioner Pavlinec asked about the use of story poles. She requested the reduction of the appearance of the bulk.

Commissioner M. Haeber agreed and suggested reducing the bulk or breaking up the massing. He stated he liked contemporary but questioned the relationship to the original building.

Commissioner Pavlinec suggested the outdoor space on the ground level or reducing the deck area.

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE HPC MEETING ON JUNE 12, 2018

In response to Chair Cawelti, Mr. Cassel discussed the need for parking and storage.

Chair Cawelti discussed her classic cars and where she stored them. She questioned the need for a lift. Mr. Cassel discussed the proposed storage lift.

Commissioner Pavlinec suggested an exterior lift. Mr. Cassel explained the proposed car storage lift.

Mr. Cassel asked if they could proceed.

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Cawelti/Pavlinec) to approve the front facade; which carried by the following voice vote: (5-1) Ayes: J. Haeber, C. Hibma, M. Hibma, J. Pavlinec, P. Scolari; Noes: R. Cawelti.

RECESS

Chair Cawelti called a recess. The meeting reconvened with all Commissioners present.

Commission Business:

A. Historic Preservation Awards 2018

Senior Planner Whales asked if the Commissioner had contacted their award recipients and if they would be attending.

Commissioner M. Hibma stated he was attempting to get in touch with Rosemary Corbin.

The Commission discussed the program, reception, speaking time, slides and media, beverages, and fundraising opportunities.

B. Commission member reports, requests, or announcements –

Chair Cawelti announced the Annual Point Richmond History Association meeting.

Adjournment - The Commission adjourned at 6:30 p.m. to June 10, 2018.