

**PLANNING COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, RICHMOND CITY HALL**
450 Civic Center Drive, Richmond, CA
January 18, 2018
6:30 p.m.

COMMISSION MEMBERS

Marilyn Langlois, Chair	Andrew Butt, Vice Chair
Nancy Baer	Jen Loy
Claudia Garcia	Michael Huang
David Tucker	

The regular meeting was called to order by Chair Langlois at 6:30 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Present: Chair Marilyn Langlois; Vice Chair Andrew Butt, Commissioner Nancy Baer, Claudia Garcia, Jen Loy and Yu-Hsiang (Michael) Huang, David Tucker

Absent:

INTRODUCTIONS

Staff Present: Planning Staff: Roberta Feliciano, Jonelyn Whales, Director of Planning & Building Services Richard Mitchell and Attorney Carlos Privat

MINUTES:

December 7, 2017

Commissioner Garcia pointed out that there should be a change to the first sentence and that it was Vice Chair Butt who called the meeting to order, not Chair Langlois.

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Butt/Garcia) to approve the Minutes of December 7, 2017; which was carried by the following vote: 4-0-1-2 (Ayes: Butt, Baer, Loy, Garcia, Huang; Noes: None; Abstention: Langlois; Absent: Tucker)

AGENDA

CONSENT CALENDAR

Chair Langlois gave a brief overview of the Consent Calendar's policies and procedures. If the public wishes to appeal the Commission's motion, they can do so with the City Clerk's Office in writing by Monday, January 29, 2018, by 5:00 p.m.

Ms. Jonelyn Whales told the Commission that the only changes would be some typos that Staff has found and that those would be corrected.

Commissioner Baer requested removal of item#2 from the consent calendar.

1. **PLN17-517: Nico's Wood Fired Pizza CUP Amendment** PUBLIC HEARING to consider a Conditional Use Permit amendment to allow outdoor dining and seating at a restaurant located at 12478 San Pablo Ave. (APN: 519-010-024). CM-3, Commercial Mixed Use, Commercial Emphasis District. Timothy Manhart, owner/applicant; Planner: Roberta Feliciano; Tentative Recommendation: Conditional Approval.
3. **PLN17-604: Hensley Manufacturing LLC Permit** PUBLIC HEARING to consider a request for a Conditional Use Permit to allow medical marijuana manufacturing uses within an industrial building at 953 Hensley St. (APN: 561-322-019). IG, General Industrial Light District. Old Hensley Industrial District, LLC, owner; Adam Bonner, applicant Planner: Jonelyn Whales Tentative Recommendation: Conditional Approval
4. **PLN17-628: New Sprint Wireless Telecommunications Facility** PUBLIC HEARING to consider a request for a Conditional Use Permit to install a new telecommunication facility at 2121 San Joaquin St. (APN: 507-251-018). CG, General Commercial District. Urban Famer Properties LLC, owner; Philip Thomas, applicant; Planner: Jonelyn Whales; Tentative Recommendation: Conditional Approval.
5. **PLN17-637: Lakeridge Athletic Club CUP Modification** PUBLIC HEARING to consider a request to modify an existing Conditional Use Permit (92-34) to renew an expired TYPE 41 Alcoholic Beverage Control (ABC) license for on-sale beer & wine eating place at a private athletic club at 6350 San Pablo Dam Road (APN: 435-172-005). RL2, Single Family Low Density Residential District. Lakeridge Athletic Club Inc, owner; Carl Kadlic, applicant; Planner: Jonelyn Whales; Tentative Recommendation: Conditional Approval.

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Baer, Butt) to approve the Consent Calendar; which was carried by the following vote: 6-0-1 (Ayes: Langlois, Butt, Baer, Loy, Garcia, Huang; Noes: None; Absent: Tucker).

BROWN ACT – Public Forum

CORDELL HINDLER, Richmond, suggested to the Commission that a spa and juice bar would be a great idea for downtown Richmond.

STUDY SESSION

6. **PLN18-001: Point Molate Land Uses** STUDY SESSION to provide and receive comments on the preparation of a budget and proposal for receiving stakeholder and community input on future land use designations for the former Point Molate Naval Fuel Depot at Western Drive (APN: 561-100-008). PR, Parks And Recreation), IL (Industrial, Light), CG (Commercial General), RM1 (Medium Density Multi-Family Residential)/1S-3 (Interim Study Zone -3, Point Molate); City of Richmond, owner/applicant; Staff Contact: Richard Mitchell; Tentative Recommendation: Provide and Receive Comments

Chair Langlois introduced the item to the Commission and the public.

Richard Mitchell shared that the Council directed the Commission to seek community input on design, content, and budget for three community planning meetings about the site. Council

would like a summary of the citizen input from the Planning Commission to be presented to them for a final decision on the outreach plan.

Mr. Mitchell gave a brief summary of the history of Point Molate including that it was a popular wine distributor until the Navy took it over during World War II. The Navy was in possession of Point Molate until 1997 and it's now listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

Treasure Island, the Concord Naval Weapons Station, Hunter's Point, Alameda NAS, Mare Island NSY, are all included in the Point Molate parcel. The City owns about 400-acres which 300 of those acres are above water.

The staff has proposed to hold public meetings in three locations; Crane Way Pavilion, Richmond Civic Center Auditorium, and Hilltop Mall. The suggested meeting time is between 4 p.m. and 8 p.m. and the meetings would include information, presentations, and lots of public input. Council also directed Staff to publish all reports and activities that relate to Point Molate on the City Manager's page on the website. Any recommendations to the Council about how many meetings, times, and places are welcomed and then Council will take those under advisement.

Chair Langlois announced that Commissioner Tucker has arrived at the meeting.

Commissioner Garcia asked if an Economic Feasibility Study had ever been conducted. Mr. Mitchell stated that there have been a few minor studies but whatever land use possibilities arise, another Economic Feasibility Study will need to be conducted. Mr. Mitchell also addressed Commissioner Garcia's other question that Council wants the public meetings to happen in the late spring, he guessed the results of the meeting would be presented to Council in the summer, and estimated that a possible land use determination might happen during the last quarter of the year.

Mr. Mitchell addressed Commission Baer's question that people need to come up with ideas for the parcel that are economic development related and that these ideas should try to incorporate the existing structures. Chair Langlois said the end product would be to consider and finalize the land use designation and present that to Council for their approval.

Chair Langlois suggests that all the studies that have already been published on the website to possibly be summarized so it's easier to navigate. Then also add maps and other informational things that are not listed on the website be placed on the website. The Chair also believes that site visits would be helpful for the community. Mr. Mitchell states that there is talk about having an open house at the site and that the logistics are still being worked out. Mr. Mitchell advised the Commission and the public that if they have any information on Point Molate, to email or present it to the City so that it can be added to the website.

Commissioner Huang suggests that a digital input platform be established and Mr. Mitchell said the City is looking into it and will further explore it. Vice Chair Butt suggests a virtual tour so that more people can have input who would not be able to come out for a physical site visit. Mr. Mitchell voiced that in terms of Vice Chair Butt's questions, he would ask the Council if they would like Point San Pablo to be included in the discussions.

Public Comment:

CORDELL HINDLER, Richmond, stated that he is excited about this process, he's been attending all the public meetings about Point Molate and that he has stated several times that he would like to see a hotel out there. He also likes Vice Chair Butt's idea of a virtual tour because it would include everyone and not just people who can physically go out to the site.

ANTHONY BRAKE would like more information to be included in the public meetings about the abundant bird life that is located on Point Molate. Ospreys have become more frequent in the Point Molate area and it's a popular hobby to go and observe them. Other types of birds that are popular to view are different types of water birds and terrestrial birds such as raptures, hummingbirds, and songbirds.

SHIRLEY DEAN is attending the meeting on behalf of Citizens for East Shore Parks. The group has been a long-time advocate for a public engagement process for Point Molate that is vigorous and transparent. The group would like the City to put in more effort for better notice of meetings and make them fully accessible to all residents in time and place. Ms. Dean cautions the Commission and City not to rely on the virtual tours entirely and to really encourage the public to have a site visit.

SALLY TOBIN stated that her purpose to speak tonight was to encourage physical site visits for residents. Ms. Tobin suggests sending someone to Neighborhood Council meetings to get their input on which days, times, and which tours, virtual or physical, would work best for them in terms of public meetings.

JIM HANSON, is a resident, landscape architect and past Chair of the Point Molate Community Advisory Committee (PMCAC). Mr. Hanson states there are three components of community meetings which is an overview, a site tour, and then coming back to do planning and design. He states he has attended City planned Saturday meetings that contained these three components in a concise comprehensive way; a tour was included, it was all integrated into one day and he recommends that approach. Mr. Hanson believes that one-and-a-half-month notice is a good amount of time to notify residents of public meetings, to include banners promoting the meetings on major streets and to fund it with the money that has been allocated for City Planning.

CONNIE PORTERO, a resident of Richmond, she served on the Recreation and Parks Commission for nine years and then was appointed to the Point Molate Committee. While on the Parks and Recreation Commission a lot of feedback was heard that the citizens need economic development sites; housing and open spaces were not voiced as an option for this land. Ms. Portero also reiterated that it's critical to get people to do a site visit and that improved access to the site has to be included in the plan.

KAREN WHITESTONE is a Conservation Analyst for the East Bay Chapter of California Native Plant Society. Point Molate is considered a botanical priority protection area for the group. Ms. Whitestone suggests that the City take all the maps that show the plant species and where they are located, summarize them and make them available to the public to help inform them of the plants that exist at Point Molate.

CAROL TELTSCHICK states that she thinks maps and overlays of how past land uses fit on the site would be useful for the public. Also, to provide detailed information about the natural resources that are located on the Point and how they benefit the area. Ms. Teltschick suggests to include Terminal Four into the information because it is adjacent to Point Molate and that physical site visits are important for the community.

PAM STELLO, is a Richmond resident, a past member of the Point Molate Advisory Committee and tonight she is speaking for Citizens for Sustainable Point Molate. The group supports community input that is inclusive and very accessible. That is what's most important to them and they suggest the City hire a consultant to help facilitate those efforts. They also think site visits are essential, outreach for public meetings needs to reach as many people as possible, Saturdays are good days to hold meetings and site visits, and a well thought out website that is easy to navigate but holds all the information needed for them to review and come to some idea of what to do with the land.

CHARLES T. SMITH has been a Richmond resident for 44-years and he works out at Point Molate cleaning up the beach and removing species that shouldn't be there. Mr. Smith states that it is extremely difficult to get in and out of Point Molate and to put public housing there would be extremely dangerous. Residents could not get out of the site fast enough in an emergency. He also states that the Chevron tanks are right above the road and could explode, causing the road to be covered and blocking in and outbound traffic.

DIEGO GARCIA has been a Richmond resident for 40-years and has only visited Point Molate once. Mr. Garcia states that community events need to be exciting and important and that will attract the biggest crowds. If it's not noticed as it being important for the community, nobody will show up. He also reiterated that it's important for an on-site visit, that the community needs sports fields and he would like to see sports fields out on the site.

PAUL CARMEN, who is the past Chair of PMCAC and a member of the subcommittee which was charged with formulating the workshops. Mr. Carmen urges the Planning Commission to adopt the proposal framework that Connie Portero and Jim Hanson put together for the workshops. Mr. Carmen suggests looking into grant money after a plan has been set in place and also stated that on-site visits are crucial in these workshops.

ANGELA VOTTO would like to see a bait and tackle shop located on Point Molate and possibly a fish market. Also, for the website to have a survey of where people live in the City who are looking at the website so that the City can see what section of the City is not being reached for community input. Ms. Votto suggests reaching out to adjacent cities in terms of traffic to Point Molate and what they suggest might help ease traffic congestion.

The public hearing was closed.

Chair Langlois stated that some Planning Commissioners did not receive Mr. Hanson's suggested framework but that most of the details in the framework were voiced during the public comment period. She asked Mr. Hanson to email his proposal to staff so that staff can email it to the rest of the Commission.

Commissioner Garcia voiced that it was important for her that the workshops are purposeful and that any information gathered during the workshops do not get lost among all the other documents that have been published. She believes that this location would serve as a gateway to the City from the west and it needs to be a good representative of the Richmond community. It's important to have the meetings at places that are accessible to everyone, the notices need to be in different languages, physical site visits, more than three events, and that ideas for the site need to be guided. A last thought would be to involve local schools and have local children attend the workshops and get their input as well.

Commissioner Baer thinks that technology could play a key role in reaching everyone in the City and she believes there needs to be physical site visits. In terms of hiring a consultant, Mr. Mitchell states the City would put a request for proposals and Council would make a choice. Commission Baer also hopes for a meaningful purpose for the process and that there can be forward momentum in determining what happens to Point Molate. Also, if Staff could bring back an RFP draft that the Commission could review before it's sent out to possible consultants.

Commissioner Huang stated that it's important to establish a digital framework to allow individuals who can't make the meetings or visit the site and be able to input their opinions digitally.

Vice Chair Butt wants to make sure that there is some clear consensus at the end of the process on what should be done, that it's a concept that is feasible and is financially viable. Vice Chair Butt voiced that he fears this will be a big exercise but nothing will come of it. Also, he would like to know what the scope of vision is and to include possibly some site-specific plan aspects to it; Commission Garcia concurs.

Chair Langlois voiced that there needs to be a range of financing options for Point Molate and present those to the public as well. She would like site visits to be included in this process. A possible layout for a day workshop is a brief meeting at a gathering location, a site visit including visits to each section of the area that is being looked at and then regather back at a central location to talk about possible ideas. Also, she concurs with a lot of what's been stated from other Commissioners and the public including maps, more than three events, different ways to do public outreach and to review and publicize the constraints that are on the site.

Commissioner Loy suggests a hybrid for outreach including technology, site visits and open houses, different events on different days and at different times, etc.

Mr. Mitchell voiced that all the ideas from this meeting would be compiled in the form of a draft recommendation. It will be brought back to the Commission to review before sending up to the Council.

2. **PLN17-572: Anaviv Restaurant CUP Amendment PUBLIC HEARING** to consider a request for a Conditional Use Permit amendment to establish a restaurant with a Type-47 Alcoholic Beverage Control (ABC) license for the on-sale general at an existing commercial kitchen at 600 Hoffman Blvd. (APN: 550-271-002). IL, Industrial Light District. Tapo Holding LLC, owner; Arnon Oren, applicant; Planner: Roberta Feliciano; Tentative Recommendation: Conditional Approval.

Ms. Feliciano gave a brief background on the item and then gave a brief update on the new proposed ABC license and to include a small dining establishment.

Commissioner Baer states the reason she wished to pull this item from the Consent Calendar is that based off the letters from the Council of Industry and Sims Metal, she would like to know what the land use conflicts are and she is also concerned about the parking issue. Ms. Feliciano states that restaurant is a designated use for the parcel and that the restaurant does meet the parking requirements as well.

Mr. Arnon Oren, applicant, states that he owns a catering business mainly and that's the main business on this site. The main reason for the upgrade to the dining and liquor license is so that

clients can come and dine on the food instead of wait for an event. There is already a restaurant across the street so he doesn't wish to make this one very large.

Chair Langlois opened the public hearing.

Mr. Oren responded to Commission Baer's question that he believes the companies that sent the letters to the Commission have a problem with him specifically and it doesn't have anything to do with this proposal. Mr. Oren voiced that he raised his concerns to Sims Metal in that they make a lot of dust and it blankets the neighborhood. Mr. Mitchell voiced that staff doesn't feel there needs to be any modification to the proposal and that the letters don't hold any merit.

Chair Langlois voiced that she interrupted the letters in that the companies feel they have a liability issue with the patrons coming to the restaurant and getting injured because it is such an industrial area. Mr. Oren responded that there is a Burger King that is much closer to them and he isn't bringing in something new to the area because there are already restaurants there.

Mr. Oren voiced to Vice Chair Butt that they are the ones that have reported the dumping to the police that has occurred across the street and they are the ones that asked the police to mark the curb red for no parking. Also, that he is willing to upgrade the landscaping and that he had already planned to do that. Vice Chair Butt believes the restaurant will help the City and approves of this use being added to the area.

Commissioner Tucker is in support of this project, he knows the applicant and how he does business.

The public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Baer moved to approve the project for the Conditional Use Permit so they can proceed to add a Type-47 ABC license. Vice Chair Butt offered a friendly amendment to include landscape enhancements along the Hoffman Blvd. frontage and bicycle parking. Commissioner Baer accepted the friendly amendment.

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Baer/Loy) to approve PLN17-572 the Conditional Use Permit for Anaviv Restaurant so they can proceed to add a Type-47 ABC license. Also, to add conditions that they will enhance the landscaping along Hoffman Blvd. and include bicycle parking; which was carried by a vote: 7-0 (Ayes: Langlois, Butt, Baer, Loy, Garcia, Huang, Tucker; Noes: None).

COMMISSION BUSINESS

- 7. **Reports of Officers, Commissioners, and Staff** – It was stated that because of the land use designation for Point Molate, there may be a second meeting in February.
- 8. **Adjournment** - The meeting was adjourned in memory of Richard Boyd, a beloved community member, at 9:35 p.m. to the next regular meeting on February 1, 2018.