

RICHMOND, CALIFORNIA, October 24, 2023

Community Services Building
440 Civic Center Plaza
Richmond, CA 94804

A. OPEN SESSION TO HEAR PUBLIC COMMENT BEFORE CLOSED SESSION

The Richmond City Council Evening Open Session was called to order at 4:32 p.m. by Mayor Eduardo Martinez.

B. ROLL CALL

Present: Councilmembers Soheila Bana, Doria Robinson, Melvin Willis, Cesar Zepeda, Vice Mayor Gayle McLaughlin, and Mayor Eduardo Martinez. **Absent:** Councilmember Claudia Jimenez was absent for the entire meeting.

C. CLOSED SESSION

C.1 CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - ANTICIPATED LITIGATION (Significant exposure to litigation pursuant to paragraph (2) or (3) of Subdivision (d) [as applicable] of Government Code Section 54956.9)

- One case

C.2 CONFERENCE WITH LABOR NEGOTIATORS (Government Code Section 54957.6)

- Agency Representatives: Sharrone Taylor and Jack Hughes

Employee organizations:

1. SEIU Local 1021 Full Time Unit and Part Time Unit
2. IFPTE Local 21 Mid-Level Management Unit and Executive Management Units
3. Richmond Police Officers Association RPOA
4. Richmond Police Management Association RPMA
5. IAFF Local 188
6. Richmond Fire Management Association RFMA

C.3 CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - ANTICIPATED LITIGATION (initiation of litigation pursuant to paragraph (4) of Subdivision (d) of Government Code Section 54956.9)

- One Case

C.4 CONFERENCE WITH REAL PROPERTY NEGOTIATOR (Government Code Section 54956.8)

- Property: 222 Marina Way (Nystrom Village)
Agency Negotiators: Nannette Beacham, Gabino Arredondo, Susan Bloch
Negotiating Parties: McCormack Baron Salazar (MBS) and Richmond Neighborhood Housing Services (RNHS)
Under negotiation: Price and terms of payment

D. PUBLIC COMMENT BEFORE CLOSED SESSION (limited to items on the Closed Session agenda only)

There were no public speakers.

E. ADJOURN TO CLOSED SESSION

The Open Session adjourned to Closed Session at 4:35 p.m. Closed Session adjourned at 6:42 p.m.

F. REGULAR MEETING OF THE RICHMOND CITY COUNCIL

The Regular Meeting of the Richmond City Council was called to order at 6:48 p.m. by Mayor Martinez.

G. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Mayor Martinez led the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.

H. ROLL CALL

Present: Councilmembers Bana, Robinson, Willis, Zepeda, Vice Mayor McLaughlin, and Mayor Martinez. **Absent:** Councilmember Jimenez was absent for the entire meeting.

I. STATEMENT OF CONFLICT OF INTEREST

None.

J. AGENDA REVIEW

Items L (city manager's report), M (reports of officers), N (police chief report), Q.1 (budget session), and R.2 (itemized budget for public emergency) were continued to the November 7, 2023, City Council meeting.

K. REPORT FROM THE CITY ATTORNEY OF FINAL DECISIONS MADE DURING CLOSED SESSION

Item C.1 (anticipated litigation, significant exposure) a status report was given and no reportable action was taken.

Item C.2 (labor negotiations) no report was given nor was any action taken.

Item C.3 (anticipated litigation, initiation) a status report was given and the matter was continued to the November 7, 2023, City Council Closed Session agenda. No reportable action was taken.

Item C.4 (real property negotiation) a status report was given and the council gave direction for further negotiations.

L. REPORT FROM THE CITY MANAGER (public comment allowed under Open Forum)

Continued to the November 7, 2023, City Council meeting.

M. REPORTS OF OFFICERS: REFERRALS TO STAFF, AND GENERAL REPORTS (INCLUDING AB 1234 REPORTS)(limited to two minutes per Councilmember)(public comments allowed under Open Forum)

Continued to the November 7, 2023, City Council meeting.

N. CRIME REPORT FROM POLICE CHIEF - 4th Tuesday (public comment allowed under Open Forum)

Continued to the November 7, 2023, City Council meeting.

O. OPEN FORUM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT

(public comment on items that remain on the Consent Calendar or items not on the agenda - limited to 2 minutes unless otherwise specified - Back and forth dialogue with the Council is prohibited)

The following individuals gave comments in person:

Don Gosney gave comments regarding district elections and the role of the council in serving all of the people in Richmond. Mr. Gosney suggested the council speak under the open forum regarding matters that were of their personal beliefs. Mr. Gosney recommended the council reach out further from their core group of supporters to hear disagreements and learn viewpoints.

Antoinette Siguenza stated that she served as the local government liaison for the California Public Utility Commission (CPUC) External Affairs Division for Contra Costa County. Ms. Siguenza gave an overview of the CPUC's commitment, investments, and objectives for a clean and safe utility infrastructure. Ms. Siguenza urged the city to contact her with any questions or concerns at (628) 249-6467.

Mark Wassberg recited verses from the bible regarding the formation of the nation of Israel.

Marcus Faumui and Donnie Rath expressed concerns regarding excessive overtime within the Richmond Fire Department. Mr. Faumui urged the council to make a change in leadership for the Fire Department. Mr. Rath shared how the excessive work hours were unsafe for fire personnel and severely impacted their families.

Courtney Cummings invited the community to the 13th Annual Richmond Contest Pow Wow event on November 11, 2023, at the Veterans Memorial Hall. Ms. Cummings acknowledged the sponsors.

Jamin Pursell gave comments in support of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Queer (LGBTQ) History Month and its origin.

The following individuals gave comments via teleconference:

Mike Velazquez, Kyle Mallinger, and Frank Marin gave comments against the city's leadership, fire chief, and working conditions within the Fire Department. Mr. Mallinger expressed concerns regarding how mandatory overtime was negatively impacting his family life, in addition to the staffing crisis and ineffective leadership. Mr. Marin expressed concerns for the fire personnel's mental and physical health and urged the council to finalize a union side letter to address the mandatory overtime issue.

Philip Rosenthal urged the council to find out where the council meeting's public speakers lived, and if they represented the people of Richmond or were bussed in for political purposes. Mr. Rosenthal expressed concerns that the city's crime and city manager reports were postponed due to international affairs. Mr. Rosenthal suggested that the city's staff time and funds should be spent on city services. Mr. Rosenthal recommended that the councilmembers who wanted to participate in the world's politics, step down and work in international politics.

Yenny Garcia invited the community to the 23rd Street Community Clean-Up Day scheduled for October 26 and the Halloween Trick or Treating event on October 31, 2023. Ms. Garcia advised that volunteers were needed and to contact her if interested.

Carol Johnson expressed concerns that city business was being ignored. Ms. Johnson urged the council to visit the Richmond Bay Area Rescue Mission to see the number of unhoused individuals living on the street. Ms. Johnson advised that mentally ill

unhoused individuals were unable to receive services from the local shelters. Ms. Johnson requested the council to focus more on city business instead of international affairs.

Holli Thier, Tarnel Abbott, and Jonathan advised that members of the public were not allowed inside the Council Chamber to give public comment in person because the maximum capacity was reached. Ms. Thier recommended that Item R.1 (Richmond's support and solidarity with the Palestinians of Gaza) be continued to a future agenda when a larger meeting venue was available. Jonathan recommended the council allow members of the public to enter the Council Chamber to speak one by one, in compliance with the fire marshal.

George Cleveland reported human trafficking in Richmond's North and East residential neighborhood on 24th Street between McBryde and Lincoln Avenues. Mr. Cleveland suggested that the inappropriate activity needed more focus and funding to resolve.

P. CITY COUNCIL CONSENT CALENDAR

(All items placed under the Consent Calendar were considered to be routine and noncontroversial. These items were enacted upon together with a motion and second, without discussion, of any member of the City Council, and each item was deemed to have received the action recommended.)

Motion by Councilmember Willis

Seconded by Councilmember Robinson

To approve all items on the Consent Calendar.

Ayes (6): Councilmember Bana, Councilmember Robinson, Councilmember Willis, Councilmember Zepeda, Vice Mayor McLaughlin, and Mayor Martinez

Absent (1): Councilmember Jimenez

Passed (6 to 1)

P.1 City Clerk's Office

P.1.a Cancellation of November 21, 2023, Regular City Council Meeting

APPROVE the cancellation of the November 21, 2023, Regular City Council meeting - City Clerk's Office (Pamela Christian 510-620-6513).

P.2 City Council

P.2.a Establishing a World Class Arts Corridor in Richmond

DIRECT staff to issue a Request for Proposals (RFP) before the end of the calendar year to consider establishing an Arts District, which includes outreach to businesses, residents, and stakeholders to build community - Councilmembers Claudia Jimenez (510-620-6565), Melvin Willis (510-412-2050), and Cesar Zepeda (510-620-6593).

P.3 Human Resources

P.3.a Resolutions Adopting the City of Richmond Salary Schedule and Position Control

ADOPT a resolution amending the City's salary schedule to implement agreed upon changes from the classification and compensation study; and ADOPT a resolution with corresponding necessary modifications to

position control – Human Resources Department (Sharrone Taylor/Nickie Mastay 510-620-6803).

Adopted Resolution Nos. 114-23 and 115-23

- P.3.b Resolution to Approve Salary Schedules in Accordance with California Code of Regulations 570.5(a) (2 CCR § 570.5)

ADOPT a resolution amending the salary schedules for all unions to comply with California Code of Regulations, Subchapter 1, Employees' Retirement System Regulations section 570.5 (a) (2 CCR § 570.5) for the inclusion of the Richmond Police Management Association salary increase effective January 1, 2023 (13.5%) and Richmond Fire Management Association salary increases that were effective January 1, 2023 (2%) and July 1, 2023 (2%) as required by CalPERS – Human Resources Department (Nickie Mastay/Sharrone Taylor 510-620-6602).

Adopted Resolution No. 116-23

- P.3.c Appropriation of funds for the Fire Department Wellness Program

APPROVE an appropriation of funds in the amount of \$44,000 for Fiscal Year (FY) 2023-24, \$48,000 for FY 2024-25, and \$50,000 for FY 2025-26, for a total amount not to exceed \$142,000 over the next three fiscal years, to establish a Fire Department Wellness Program – Human Resources Department (Nickie Mastay/Sharrone Taylor/Amy Aaronson 510-620-6602).

P.4 Public Works

- P.4.a Contract with Northwest Demolition, Inc. for the Construction of the Santa Rita Road Stabilization Project

ADOPT a resolution authorizing the execution of a construction contract in accordance with the approved plans and specifications with Northwest Demolition, Inc. for the Santa Rita Road Stabilization Project in an amount not to exceed \$715,500; and AUTHORIZE the Director of Public Works to approve change orders, if necessary, for a total twenty percent (20%) contingency amount up to \$143,100 – Public Works Department (Daniel Chavarria 510-620-5478/ Ken Cheng 510-621-1612).

Resolution No. 117-23

Q. BUDGET SESSION

Q.1 FY 2022-23 Q4 Financial Report and Administrative Budget Adjustments

RECEIVE the Fiscal Year 2022-23 Quarter 4 (Q4) report for the period of July 1, 2022, through June 30, 2023; APPROVE proposed administrative year-end budget adjustments; and PROVIDE DIRECTION to staff regarding Estimated Unspent Funds - Finance Department (Andrea Miller 510-620-6790/Mubeen Qader 510-412-2077).

Continued to the November 7, 2023, City Council meeting.

R. STUDY AND ACTION SESSION

R.1 Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza

APPROVE a Resolution affirming Richmond's solidarity with the Palestinian people in Gaza - Mayor's Office (Mayor Eduardo Martinez 510-620-6503) and Vice Mayor Gayle McLaughlin (510-620-6636).

Mayor Martinez introduced the matter and called for a moment of silence. *(At 7:37 p.m., the council adjourned for a recess to restore order in the Council Chamber. The council reconvened at 7:41 p.m.)* Vice Mayor McLaughlin read into the record the following amendments added to the proposed resolution:

"WHEREAS, 1,400 Israelis have been killed by Hamas on October 7th and nearly 6,000 Palestinians have been killed by the state of Israel in this escalated conflict; and"

"WHEREAS, we mourn the loss of all civilian lives lost on both sides from October 7th to the present and also throughout the decades of displacement, occupation, oppression and blockade endured in Gaza and the West Bank";

"BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the City of Richmond calls for an immediate humanitarian ceasefire and the safe passage of substantial humanitarian aid to Gaza; and"

"BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the City of Richmond calls for the immediate release of all Israeli hostages taken by Hamas; and"

"BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the City of Richmond calls for an end to Israeli apartheid and the occupation and blockade of Palestinian land by Israeli military forces; and"

"BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the City of Richmond opposes all existing and any future military aid to Israel; and"

The following individuals gave comments in person: Don Gosney, Payman Amiri, Salahe Bakri, Balih Bakri, Lugman E., Mark Wassberg, Bader B., Jeff Ritterman, and Ed Ramano. *(At 8:18 p.m., the council adjourned for a recess to allow members who had spoken in person to move out to the overflow area in the Richmond Memorial Auditorium and allow members of the public in the overflow area to enter the Council Chamber and speak in person. The council reconvened at 8:28 p.m.)* The following individuals proceeded to give comments in person: Stan Woods, Juan Canman, Emil McDonald, Dhaifallah Mo, Fayza Ayyad, Reza Yazdi, Lucinda Casson, Jane Bragen, Cantor Brian, Dorothyhen Dorenz, Lily Saefong, Faith Meltzer, Clio Soiffer, Morgan Condon, Theresa Russell, Susan Dewitt, Beth Zeitman, Ayesha Aabasi, Keala Uhoa, Khalid Almajjaji, Katherine Lee, Isa Flores-Jones, Elizabeth Ibarra, Alfredo A., Katt, Arnon Oren, Shawn Dunning, Paul Larudee, Luke Pickrell, Deliah Stern, Benny Zanh, Marilyn Langlois, Lucero Rios, Yousef Ayyad, Yitzchok Wagner, Askia Abdullah, Bachir Hadid, Alex Hanna, Izzy Homran, Shabana Shahboz, Dan M., Jamin Pursell, Oren Levy, Tawfic Halaby, Naomi Smoller, Matthew Lewis, Adel Somaha, Elinor Nahmani, Nour Eidy, Karen Duran, Shaun Kozolchyk, Idan Bearman, Lee Goodman-Gorgliano, Debbie Bayer, Nadia Barhoum, David Reinertson, Jessica Mitchell, Jonathan Mitzer, Holli Thier, Yumi Kabayashi, Rebecca Goodman, Jaime Perez, Tarnel Abbott, Amelah El Amin, Hamza Abid, Christina, Michael Tal, Matthew B., Ismail Imran, Raye Kahn, Marisol Cantu,

Sara Cantor, Emily Ross, Yusuf Adam, Gus, Najari Smith, Ashanti Curry, Ly, Mark Khmelnitskiy, Aisha Chabane, Nadya Tanng, and Samir Shrestha.

The following individuals gave comments via teleconference: Sameena Usman, Musa Tariq, Oscar Garcia, Jamilah, David, Shoshana Wechler, Ahmed, Tarek Aris, Sonia Bustamante, G.M., Dejenya Kafele, Karen Franklin, Ralikhhan, Lara Kiswani, Cheryl Davila, Sharon, Safaa, Syed Qadri, Alicia Polak, Paula Lavine, Nuzhat, Maria Galbo, Bissan Abusharar, orlyg0427, Hope Dixon, Level 2A, Aliza Kazmi, Jpolston, Alfa, Arial, Judy Weatherly, Rachel Kertz, Jorge Palacios, Dana Viloría, and Free Palestine. *(At 10:59 p.m., a motion made by Councilmember Willis, seconded by Councilmember Bana, to extend the meeting until 11:30 p.m., passed by the unanimous vote of the City Council).*

The following individuals resumed giving comments via teleconference: Bill, Isaac Resendz, Eileen Lee, Eric P.W., Ella P., Mohamed Shehk, Guilia Fowler, Dena, Michael Nye, Sonya Rifkin, Sophia Sobko, Leisa Johnson, Eunice, Tourmaline, Chris Tarrant, Pathma V., Bex, Pamela Fields, Robert Mandel, Kim Freedman, Zeid, and Walla, Alexis. *(At 11:28 p.m., a motion made by Councilmember Willis, seconded by Councilmember Bana, to suspend the rules and extend the meeting until the end of Item R.1, passed by the unanimous vote of the City Council).*

The following individuals resumed giving public comment via teleconference: Sara Abu-Lebdeh, Kerry Hillis, Abby B., Mya, Hilliary Kliminik, Mujeeb Rahmani, Aya A., David Kafton, Oppressed Voice, Himadri, Sado, Aishah, Tola Asuni, George Lipman, Bitá, Daniel, V.G., Ahmad, Elana Auerbach, Farid Khalafalla, Amina, U, Jena, Prophet Sereah, Nida Khalil, Sabrina E., Shaimaa Wahba, Scott, Mivrette Judeh, Lisa Malul, Isabel, Ana Tellez, Abdul, Jonah Gottlieb, Wassim Hage, Afshan Jlani, Donia, Hajer, Cindy Yob, Danielle, Gheesa, Iman Farajallah, George Cleveland, Tatiana Kerzhner, Nishat, Ali Kalaaf, and Lu. Discussion ensued.

Motion by Vice Mayor McLaughlin

Seconded by Councilmember Robinson

To adopt a resolution affirming Richmond's support and solidarity with the Palestinian people of Gaza along with the amendments as stated.

A friendly amendment made by Councilmember Zepeda to add to the title of the resolution, "and condemning the killings, kidnappings, and torture of all innocent civilians in Israel and Gaza" and "condemn Hamas for the killings on October 7, 2023", was not accepted.

The main motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes (5): Councilmember Bana, Councilmember Robinson, Councilmember Willis, Vice Mayor McLaughlin, and Mayor Martinez

Noes (1): Councilmember Zepeda

Absent (1): Councilmember Jimenez

Passed (5 to 2)

Adopted Resolution No. 118-23

**R.2 Itemize Budget for Public Emergency Preparedness for Public Disasters-
Earthquake and Wildfire**

RECEIVE a presentation from Councilmember Bana; and PROVIDE DIRECTION to City staff to develop a funding plan of \$1.09 million for wildfire and earthquake safety in November 2023, and return with an additional proposal for appropriations during Mid-Year Fiscal Year 2023-24 – Councilmembers Soheila Bana (510-779-7280) and Cesar Zepeda (510-620-6593).

Continued to the November 7, 2023, City Council meeting.

S. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 1:07 a.m., in memory of all the lives that had been lost, to meet again on November 7, 2023, at 6:30 p.m.

Pamela Christian, Clerk of the City of
Richmond

Eduardo Martinez, Mayor

From: [Cordell Hindler](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comments-Open Forum
Date: Thursday, October 19, 2023 3:19:57 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Hello Mayor Martinez, Council Members and Staff,

I AM Submitting the Following Comments Into the Record:

1. For a Future Agenda, The Council Should Consider Inviting Supervisor Gioia and Lisa Motoyama to Present on the Plan To Address Homelessness
2. Also to Have Danny Wan to Present on the Port of Oakland
3. Also to Direct Staff to Work with Chancellor Christ's Office to Schedule a Joint Meeting with UC Berkeley in Spring of 2024

Sincerely
Cordell

From: [Alice LoCicero](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comments or Agenda Item Q-1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 11:18:22 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Council Members,

Over the course of my career, I have met and talked with hundreds of police officers, screened candidates for police jobs, conducted fitness for duty evaluations, and collaborated with law enforcement in disaster situations. In my conversations with police officers I have learned that they are often burdened by their work, which involves dealing with violence and trauma, and breaking bad news to family members..

Addressing the burdens of the work is important, and it is also important not to add the kind of tasks for which they are not fully prepared, and which can be handled well by others who are specifically trained for those tasks. In other words, people shouldn't be asking the police to solve every single problem in daily life. Some can be solved better by non-police responders.

Richmond has had the foresight and wisdom to create the CCRP. Now it is time to fully fund it, so that it can serve the people of Richmond, and reduce the number of calls that police officers have to respond to, especially calls that do not call on their specific training and skill set.

In order to have a chance for the CCRP to be successful, it needs to be fully funded from the start. It would be sad and ironic if, after all the years of work put into the rollout of this program, it were to be unable to fulfill its mission, thus causing people to be discouraged about it and stop calling.

Best regards,
Alice LoCicero
47 Sandpoint Drive

--

*Alice LoCicero, Ph.D., MBA
Board Certified Clinical Psychologist
Clinical Faculty, The Wright Institute
Past President: Society for the Study of Peace, Conflict, and Violence
2018 Recipient, Anthony J. Marsella Award for Peace and Social Justice*

www.dralicelocicero.com

alicelocicero.substack.com: *Outside Psychology's Overton Window*

From: [Amber Hatfield](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comments for Agenda Item Q-1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 11:16:32 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Mayor Martinez and City Council Members:

My name is Amber Hatfield and I have been a resident of Richmond for 8 years in District 3. I would like to thank you for voting to house the Community Crisis Response Program (CCRP) in the Office of Neighborhood Safety in September. Offering people a way to reach out for help with non-violent incidents and mental health issues without involving armed police is an investment in a better future. I firmly believe that we cannot solve the issues facing our communities with guns, violence and incarceration. We must take immediate action to reverse centuries of harm and invest in humane responses that can promote healing and restoration by de-escalating desperate situations.

In considering the financial report presented this evening and the unspent funds for Fiscal Year 2022-2023, I respectfully urge you to fully embrace the success of the CCRP by allocating \$2M to the program. This funding will be vital to fully support the organization and implementation of the program. Financially supporting this program in a significant way in the beginning will fully pay off as our communities begin to heal and grow stronger.

Thank you for helping our community to take the next step toward a proactive approach to public safety with a significant funding allocation to build a strong program.

Sincerely,

Amber Hatfield

Pronouns: [they/them/theirs](#) | Race: [white](#) | Land: [Ohlone](#)

From: [Cordell Hindler](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comments- Q.1 Budget Session
Date: Thursday, October 19, 2023 3:29:42 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Hello Mayor Martinez, Council Members and Staff,

I AM Requesting That the Council to Adopt The Proposed Year End Adjustments as Presented by Staff

Sincerely
Cordell

From: [Marilyn Alwan](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Agenda item R1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 5:15:52 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Mayor Martinez and Council Members,

I applaud your resolution supporting the caged people of Gaza who are subjected to relentless Israeli bombardment and genocidal policies sadly financed from American tax payers. I'm sure the residents of Richmond would rather keep these billions of dollars used to kill Palestinians at home to finance much needed projects for people here.

That one party (Israel) has the power to cut off water, food, and energy to 2.3 million people should tell people which side has the power to suffocate and wipe out the other. People seems to forget why there is a "Strip" in Gaza. The city of Gaza was a 5,000 -year -old prosperous metropolis but in the 1948 Nakba, Israel forcibly transferred several hundred thousand Palestinians from their homes to Gaza City and a small area around it and created an artificial barrier to cage them into a "Strip." At present 75% of the people in Gaza are refugees. They cannot leave.

I wish to share 2 important videos

(1) An Irish Parliamentarian 5-minutes speech that summarizes the hypocrisy and moral cowardice of

supporters of Apartheid Israel.

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=f7fMYRJpgIM>

(2) A very timely lecture by renowned Israeli historian Ilan Pappé that NorCal Sabeel co-sponsored with several departments and groups at U C Berkeley last Thursday October 19.

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1OcjOP8iUCU>

I appreciate the Richmond City council leadership in passing this important resolution.

Thank you.

Marilyn Alwan
[1420 5th Street](#)
[Alameda, CA 94501](#)

[Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza](#)

From: [Hameed Mohammed](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: public comments agenda item # R. 1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 12:54:11 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Hi, my name is Aleem
and I'm a resident of Woodland CA
I want to thank the Council for this brave and necessary act of solidarity.
Richmond's Asian immigrant and refugee communities stand in solidarity with the people of Palestine. I hope it
inspires other city councils to follow suit.

- o Thank you for your continued commitment Anti-semitism

We believe that all people deserve access to clean air and water, to feel safe walking around their neighborhoods.
This includes the people of Gaza.
Israel's attacks on Gaza are a form of ethnic cleansing and collective punishment of civilians - a war crime.
We have the power to call on our government to put a stop to the war crimes of the Israeli government. The
people of Richmond have to lift our voices together and stand in solidarity with the people of Palestine.

From: [A L M](#)
To: [Eduardo Martinez](#); [Melvin Willis](#); [Gayle McLaughlin](#); [Claudia Jimenez](#); [Doria Robinson](#); [Cesar Zepeda](#); [Soheila Bana](#); [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comment, Agenda Item # R.1 Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 11:22:36 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Mayor Martinez and City Council Members:

I would like to offer my full support for the Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza.

A few days ago, I wrote a short letter in regards to the inhumane situation in Gaza. I would like to include this letter here to explain some of the reasons why I am in support of this Resolution. The letter goes as follows:

In the last 2 weeks:

- In Palestine, over 4,385 people were killed and over 13,500 wounded.
- Over 1000 people were killed in the Al-Ahli hospital airstrike in Gaza.
- Over 2000 children were killed in Gaza by Israeli attacks.
- IDF airstrike hits team of first responders in Gaza.
- IDF strikes 200 targets in Gaza's Al-Furqan neighborhood.
- At least 24 UN humanitarian sites were damaged by Israeli bombing.
- Humanitarian offices of International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC) have been completely destroyed and 5 of their members killed. 11 of UNRWA humanitarian workers were also killed in IDF airstrikes.
- Israel hits UN school on Tuesday, taking the lives of at least 18 civilians who had come to find shelter from the bombings.
- The port of Gaza has also been bombed repeatedly.
- Thursday night, Israel bombed Saint Porphyrius, the Greek orthodox church in Gaza that was sheltering displaced people. We don't have yet the exact number of dead and injured people.
- Israel hits Gaza-Egypt border checkpoints as civilians flee.

On Monday, Russia, China, the UAE, Gabon and Mozambique voted in favor of a cease-fire in Gaza. The US, UK, France and Japan voted against. The US, UK and France are among the

NATO countries arming Israel who is currently bombing 2.5 million people in Gaza, half of whom are children.

Apart from the US and its NATO allies who refuse to call for an international investigation, the whole world has no doubt about who bombed the Al-Ahli hospital in Gaza. All documents presented by IDF have been rebutted by international analysts. In fact, some of them have been studied by experts and they point to IDF, not Hamas, as responsible for the bombing of the hospital.

In Gaza, surgical operations are being done without anesthesia, because there is none left. Doctors and surgeons are performing surgeries on the floor, because there are no spaces left where they can perform surgery. People in Gaza are being bombed everywhere: churches, hospitals, schools. Entire residential areas are completely destroyed. It's beyond imagination.

As of now, only 20 trucks with food and medical supplies were able to enter Gaza. If the hundreds of trucks carrying humanitarian aid and still waiting at the Egyptian border are not let into Gaza now, the level of death and suffering in this already devastated enclave will surpass anything that we've seen in the last several decades. And Western leaders are supposed to provide cover for this? We are supposed to agree to this?

The Israeli Defense Minister proclaimed at the beginning of this "defensive" attack that all rules were out. He lifted all restrictions that might protect what he called "human animals," which basically means that Israel is exempt from international humanitarian law. It's now ok to commit war crimes.

This is personal for Netanyahu, Biden, Hunter and some of their associates, as they might go to jail if Biden doesn't win the next Presidential election. But it's also very personal for the peoples in the Middle East, and they are ready to give their lives. They already have and will continue to do so. Two US carriers are in Lebanon to stop counter-attacks from Hezbollah, but it's not working because, a couple of nights ago was the toughest night for the US military at the border between Palestine and Lebanon. 2 US air bases, Ain al-Asad and al-Harir, in Iraq were bombed, and there are attacks on the oil fields where the US occupation are stationed. In other words, US forces in Syria, Iraq and the Red Sea are increasingly under militant attacks

We can see now that the US is getting weaker in many parts of the world and US hegemony is on the decline. This has a direct impact on the Palestine-Israel conflict—the US being Israel's biggest ally and funding entity in the world. What is happening in Gaza is a direct consequence of this shift in global power dynamics. And the Arab states' response is also a consequence of this shift.

As for the mainstream media and their reporting of the conflict, MSNBC suspended three

Muslim anchors: Mehdi Hasan, Ayman Mohieddine and Ali Velshi. Those three journalists have experience in Middle Eastern affairs and history. Whether or not you agree with Mehdi Hasan, the point is that Western media go to incredible length to silence opposition and misinform the public. It's not ok to have a Palestinian flag in Great Britain but it's ok to applaud a Nazi at the Canadian parliament.

It is appalling that the Western governments are telling the non-Western world that they, the West, are a bulwark against authoritarianism, the great defenders of democracy when in fact, the Western powers with the US as their leader have become the epitome of authoritarian behavior.

When you cut water and electricity, when you constantly bomb civilian neighborhoods, humanitarian shelters, hospitals, schools and other civilian shelters, when you close borders preventing people from fleeing a war zone, this is a genocide under the pretext of self-defense.

For Biden, "This is the opportunity of the century: let's go after Iran." I guess the war in Ukraine, deindustrialization of Europe, and huge mess in Taiwan are not enough for the current US Administration: they also want to go to war against Iran. And on top of the \$112 billion Congress already allocated to Ukraine, Biden wants the US tax payers to agree to an additional \$61.4 billion to Ukraine and \$105 billion aid package for Israel. What kind of a peaceful democratic world are we talking about here?

Thank you,

Alix Mazuet

From: Alyse Bartelstone <alysemarlo@msn.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 4:26 PM
To: Dave Aleshire <daleshire@awattorneys.com>; Karen R. Becker <kbecker@awattorneys.com>
Subject: Fw: Resolution R-1

*** EXTERNAL SENDER ***

From: Alyse Bartelstone
Sent: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 4:21 PM
To: Dave_Aleshire@ci.Richmond.ca.us <Dave_Aleshire@ci.Richmond.ca.us>;
Gayle_McLaughlin@ci.richmond.ca.us <Gayle_McLaughlin@ci.richmond.ca.us>;
trina_jackson@ci.richmond.ca.us <trina_jackson@ci.richmond.ca.us>;
melvin_willis@ci.richmond.ca.us <melvin_willis@ci.richmond.ca.us>;
Claudia_Jimenez@ci.richmond.ca.us <Claudia_Jimenez@ci.richmond.ca.us>;
doria_robinson@ci.richmond.ca.us <doria_robinson@ci.richmond.ca.us>;
cesar_zepeda@ci.richmond.ca.us <cesar_zepeda@ci.richmond.ca.us>;
soheila_bana@ci.richmond.ca.us <soheila_bana@ci.richmond.ca.us>
Subject: Resolution R-1

To accuse Israel of ethnic cleansing is fundamentally untrue and inaccurate. Israel's actions do not fall under the umbrella of expelling or forcibly removing groups of people in order to create a homogenous society. Many Arabs live in Israel, with equal treatment under the law and full rights of citizenship. There is no Israeli movement that is aimed at exterminating or expelling the Palestinian population from Gaza. Israeli's presence in Gaza is for security purposes, for when Israel tried to exit the area and return control of it to the Palestinian people, a terrorist organization was allowed to move in and control it. Israel must be allowed to defend its people from terrorist threats. And to suggest that Israel's response to the deadly terrorist attack by Hamas is ethnic cleansing is again, wildly inaccurate.

The Israeli military gave the Palestinian people days of warning before moving in to Gaza, in the hopes that as many civilians as possible could get out. However, Hamas would not let the Palestinian people leave. Additionally, the neighboring countries would not open their borders to those Palestinians who did get out until very recently. Yet somehow this all adds up to Israel committing ethnic cleansing? Hamas is the group whose sole purpose is to rid the world of Jews. It is in their charter and they do not hide that information. Why are they not being accused of genocide or ethnic cleansing? Why is the fight not to free Palestine from Hamas but instead to punish Israel for fighting back against the most deadly attack on Jewish people since the Holocaust?

This resolution will do nothing but incite the antisemitism that has already grown too loud in this country. This resolution will do nothing but turn more citizens against the Jewish people. This resolution will do nothing but cause Jewish children and families to be frightened that they will be hated, yelled at, and seen as "other" by society.

YOU CANNOT PASS THIS RESOLUTION. IT SIMPLY MAKES NO LOGICAL SENSE WHEN LOOKING AT THE FACTS. IT WILL ONLY HARM THE COMMUNITY, BOTH THE JEWISH COMMUNITY AND THE COMMUNITY AT LARGE.

From: [Anna Henry](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: public comments agenda item #R.1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 8:08:31 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

My name is Anna and I am reaching out to express gratitude and support for Richmond City Council's consideration of the Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza. The ethnic cleansing that is being carried out by the apartheid state of Israel against the people of Gaza will not stop unless people stand up and demand an end to the violence. Too many children, women and men have been murdered and the living are surviving off of a rapidly declining source of water, food and shelter. This is a humanitarian emergency. I urge the City Council to take up this resolution and stand with the people of Gaza. Stand up for life. Stand up for dignity. Stand up to end Islamophobia and anti-semitism. Stand up against apartheid. Stand up and let the US government know that we do not consent to providing military support for ethnic cleansing, and we know those resources could go so far as investments into our communities. As leaders, it is the least you can do.

From: [Beth Painter](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Vote No on Anti-Israel Resolution (Item R-1)
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 8:26:58 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

PLEASE FORWARD TO ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS

Dear Richmond City Council Members,

I am writing in strong opposition to Tuesday's Resolution Item R-1 – an inflammatory and biased statement about the Israel-Hamas conflict. Not only does the resolution lack any factual basis, but it will also deeply exacerbate the trauma and vulnerability of the local Jewish community.

Among its many glaring shortcomings, the proposed resolution fails to mention that this conflict started after Hamas terrorists murdered 1,400 innocent Israeli citizens and foreign nationals. In addition, the resolution text falsely accuses Israel of ethnic cleansing and collective punishment, while offensively referencing the Holocaust to condemn Israel's response to the Hamas attacks.

In the wake of the Hamas terrorist attacks our local Jewish community is feeling unsafe and scared, and this resolution's lack of empathy for Jews will only exacerbate the pain the community is feeling. Instead of sowing division, I am asking City Council to condemn all forms of hate and take steps to support all residents with loved ones in the region.

Beth Painter

From: [Carol Hegstrom](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: ublic Comments, Agenda Item R.1.
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 11:35:01 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

The resolution in item R-1 is problematic for a number of reasons and should not go forward. First, the conflict in the middle east is a foreign policy issue and beyond the city council's realm of expertise or duties. Second, it purports to speak for the residents of Richmond, but it clearly does not. Although I support the Palestinian people, the issue is complicated and many of us have mixed feelings. Resolution R.1 is one-sided and inflammatory, and therefore I cannot support it.

Carol Hegstrom
Richmond Resident

From: [David Kafton](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Cc: [David Kafton](#)
Subject: Agenda Item R-1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 1:00:50 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To: Richmond City Council Members

Agenda Item R-1

RE: Resolution concerning the Current War in Israel, Gaza, the West Bank

I am a Richmond resident, 81 years old, and of Jewish heritage.

I totally oppose this Resolution as it is full of falsehoods and is misdirected.

Passing this Resolution will only incentivize the HAMAS NAZI terrorists and others like them.

Consequently, you will be adding to the suffering of the Palestinians in Gaza & the West Bank for decades.

I have been a strong supporter of the Richmond Progressive Alliance and have been a member since we moved here four years ago.

I assure you I will resign my membership if any councilmember votes for this resolution.

I will also work to defeat the Richmond Progressive Alliance in future elections.

The person or persons who wrote this resolution is not interested in helping Palestinians in Gaza or the West Bank.

They support the goals of the Palestinian Dictatorships to KILL ALL THE JEWS & DESTROY ISRAEL.

The Palestinian Dictators have been systematically causing the suffering of the Palestinian people in Gaza, the West Bank, Lebanon, Syria, and Jordan for 75 years and counting.

But not a word of complaint from anyone.

In contrast, Israel is a thriving diverse pluralistic democracy where everyone has full civil and human rights including 1.6 million Palestinian citizens, 20% of Israel's population. This is the equivalent of 66 million Palestinians living in the United States, more than Blacks, Hispanics, and Asians.

Israel closely adhere to the Geneva Conventions and other International Laws applicable to war.

The HAMAS NAZIS do not conform to the laws of war. They continue to commit WAR CRIMES & CRIMES AGAINST HUMANITY.

The HAMAS NAZIS use children, women, & the elderly as HUMAN SHIELDS. They readily admit it. They place their fighters, their munitions, & rockets inside, underneath, and adjacent to hospitals, schools, mosques, and residential buildings.

I suggest you consider a new resolution directed at the HAMAS NAZIS and their supporters:

1. Stop using the Palestinians as HUMAN SHIELDS
2. Stop shooting missiles at civilians in Israel.
3. Stop killing Israeli civilians.
4. Stop taking for you own use billions of aid dollars meant for the Palestinian people for our food, water, sewage, electricity, medical

supplies, infrastructure, and rebuilding. This has led to
to tremendous suffering for the past 18 years.

5. Stop using these billions of dollars for purchasing weapons and building hundred of miles of tunnels and for enriching yourselves with lavish mansions in Gaza.

6. Let at least all women and children under 12 years old leave Gaza, temporarily, so we'll be safe. (1.8 million people could leave).

Sincerely,

David Kafton

From: [John Henstrand](#)
To: [Eduardo Martinez](#); [Soheila Bana](#); [Claudia Jimenez](#); [Doria Robinson](#); cesar_zapeda@ci.richmond.ca.us; [Gayle McLaughlin](#); [Melvin Willis](#); [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: agenda item R-1: Vote No on the resolution -- draft new language
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 5:09:45 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

I am a Jewish Progressive who resides in Contra Costa and volunteers on equity issues through my interfaith work, service on the Measure X Advisory Board and as an active member of many diverse coalitions. Speaking in my individual capacity, I urge you to vote NO on Resolution 1 and focus your efforts on drafting a unifying message supporting all of Richmond's community members impacted by the war and supporting efforts for peace.

As written, the current Proclamation is completely one-sided, uses controversial and inflammatory language such as references to genocide, the holocaust, ethnic cleansing, apartheid. This type of language is used by Hamas, the terrorist organization who governs Gaza, who raped, tortured, killed and kidnapped Israeli citizens. There is no mention at all of the atrocities committed by Hamas that started this recent conflict, nor the role that others such as Hamas and Egypt, in addition to the far right government in Israel, played in the deplorable conditions those in Gaza now find themselves.

People are not their governments. The Palestinians in Gaza are not Hamas. Nor are Israelis and Jewish Americans their governments. It is not so simple as "Free Palestine" or "I Stand with Israel." The language in the Proclamation sets up false dichotomies that only serve to divide people.

I personally believe that REGARDLESS OF HISTORY Jewish and Arab peoples live in the Middle East NOW and both have the right to their own sovereign government, to enjoy freedom and to live in peace.

As leaders, you have a responsibility to support all members of your community. I was in tears last night reading the words of the proposed proclamation. I have had progressives tell me that the civilians in Israel who were massacred deserved it because they were "settlers" and "colonizers." My 23andMe information was hacked along with others of Jewish heritage

by someone who wants to sell it so now I fear we may be attacked here in our own home. I will not be attending the meeting this afternoon, nor even speak at it because I honestly am too afraid that it would make me a target. I am so anxious and fearful for my community, myself and my family, that I do not sleep at night. Your Jewish community is hurting. We feel alone and abandoned by many people we considered allies. I urge you to support ALL who are hurting right now in your community and not adopt a Proclamation that could even potentially incite more violence.

Diana Honig

From: [E. Hamburger](#)
To: [Eduardo Martinez](#); [Soheila Bana](#); [Claudia Jimenez](#); [Cesar Zepeda](#); [Doria Robinson](#); [Gayle McLaughlin](#); [Melvin Willis](#)
Cc: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comments Agenda Item R-1, Scheduled for October 24, 2023
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 4:00:01 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

I strongly encourage you to Vote Against Resolution R-1

This resolution does NOT advance peace, in fact, it will exacerbate violences against civilian jews and civilian palestinians, alike. I can say this with certainty given the nearby hate violence that has already occurred in the last 3 weeks toward both populations. Neither of these two civilian populations are to blame. The international disorder in Israel and the occupied territories can be blamed on political dogma, politicians' ego, and the belief of radical terrorists and extremists.

I welcome a thoughtful conversation and advancement of a strategy for Peace. This resolution, in blaming and name calling one side of the issue is an act of misinformation and will lead to violence and more bloodshed in Richmond and its neighbors.

I pray that you vote for Peace, NOT for Resolution R-1.

Thank you for your consideration,
Eliron Hamburger

From: [Beth Jerde](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comments Item #R1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 7:22:46 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Please note that I support Mayor Martinez and Vice Mayor McLaughlin in their letter of support for the people of Gaza.

Elizabeth Jerde

Created for Joy

I sometimes forget
that I was created for Joy.

My mind is too busy.
My Heart is too heavy
for me to remember
that I have been
called to dance
the Sacred dance of life.

I was created to smile
To Love
To be lifted up
And to lift others up.

O' Sacred One
Untangle my feet
from all that ensnares.
Free my soul.
That we might
Dance
and that our dancing
might be contagious.

~Hafiz

From: [Eunice Trumble](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Fwd: Agenda R.1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 11:32:54 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Please include this version as I made a grammar correction. Thank you.

Begin forwarded message:

From: Eunice Trumble <etrumble@sbcglobal.net>
Date: October 24, 2023 at 11:24:12 PM PDT
To: cityclerkdept@ci.richmond.ca.us
Subject: Agenda R.1

Hello,

Please include my comments in the supplemental minutes. Thank you.

Accusing Israel of ethnic cleansing and not likewise condemning Hamas, the governing body of Gaza, for torturing, mutilating, killing, and burning alive civilians, including babies, children, and the elderly is divisive. Using the words "Never Again," reminiscent of the Holocaust, when Hamas' charter calls for wiping Jews off the face of the earth is hypocritical, divisive, and offensive. Adding a one-sentence disclaimer that Richmond will fight anti-semitism is simply inadequate. Thank god you finally acknowledged the victims on both sides. You can see by the reaction in the chamber, that you had to shut down, that you have sowed dissension that divides our population. You should not be taking sides. Cesar Zepeda, as far as I know, is the only councilmember working actively to heal the wounds on both sides by working with Muslim and Jewish leaders toward unity. You should take a page from him on how to include all stakeholders. Thank you Cesar as well as Shawn Dunning, John Ritterman, and John Gioia.

From: [Faryal Arif](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: City council meeting resolution R.1 comment
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 6:46:09 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

I write to urge the city council to pass the resolution R.1 to support Palestinian people, to stand up for humanity, peace and justice. No one should have to bear witness to thousands of children being massacred and starved. Please be on the right side of history.

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Gail Eierweiss](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public comments on Agenda Item R-1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 12:39:07 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Richmond City Council Members,

I am writing because I strongly oppose Tuesday's Resolution Item R-1 as written. To me, it is tone deaf, inflammatory and inappropriate for our City to support. Specifically, as written, the resolution characterizes the current situation without ever mentioning the role of Hamas's terrorism against Israeli non combatants as a starting point for this particular wave of injustice and brutality on both sides. This omission, and the inflammatory language, is not only unhelpful, it is triggering to Jewish people because of its intentional lack of empathy to Israeli Jews. As written, it is a call to action to support hate, rather than clearly and urgently supporting a cease fire, a return of the hostages, adequate humanitarian aid and a demand to respect and protect noncombatants on both sides. In my opinion, we should also be speaking up for meaningful work on a political solution that recognizes the rights and the needs of the Palestinian and the Israeli peoples both to be recognized for their right to have a choice to live their lives in States that do not infringe on each other's right to exist.

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Garry Hurlbut](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: City Council Meeting tonight - Public Comment on item R.1 - Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 1:11:34 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This resolution only provides support for the Palestinian people of Gaza and the suffering that they are going through. It should support all the innocent civilians on either side of this conflict that have been or will be impacted by this conflict. This includes the non-terrorist Palestine civilians and the Israeli civilians/families that have been impacted by the horrific acts by Hamas on October 7th.

Garry Hurlbut

--

Garry Hurlbut
President and Executive Director
Richmond Tennis Association (RTA)
510-547-8111

Check out "news and events" on <http://www.rta-ca.org>
Like us on <https://facebook.com/richmondtennisca>

From: [Hameed Mohammed](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Re: public comments agenda item # R. 1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 2:31:26 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

*thank you for your continued commitment against Anti-semitism

On Tue, Oct 24, 2023 at 12:53 PM Hameed Mohammed <trinighuraba@gmail.com> wrote:

Hi, my name is Aleem

and I'm a resident of Woodland CA

I want to thank the Council for this brave and necessary act of solidarity.

Richmond's Asian immigrant and refugee communities stand in solidarity with the people of Palestine. I hope it inspires other city councils to follow suit.

- o Thank you for your continued commitment Anti-semitism

We believe that all people deserve access to clean air and water, to feel safe walking around their neighborhoods. This includes the people of Gaza.

Israel's attacks on Gaza are a form of ethnic cleansing and collective punishment of civilians - a war crime.

We have the power to call on our government to put a stop to the war crimes of the Israeli government. The people of Richmond have to lift our voices together and stand in solidarity with the people of Palestine.

From: [Iris Karsh](#)
To: [Soheila Bana](#); [Claudia Jimenez](#); [Cesar Zepeda](#); [Doria Robinson](#); [Gayle McLaughlin](#); [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: No on anti Israel proposition
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 12:58:00 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

[You don't often get email from ikarsh@ymail.com. Learn why this is important at <https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification>]

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To the Richmond City Officials -

I am a resident of Contra Costa County and have come to learn about the resolution affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity of Gaza and the Palestinian people.

Hamas is the government running Gaza. If you stand with Gaza and the Palestinian people you are standing with a government of terrorists. This is the same thing as backing ISIS after 9/11. We can not and must not stand behind terrorist organizations in this county and country. As we are the UNITED States of America we need to be UnIted in our stance.

Please kindly reject this propaganda resolution.

Thank you,

Iris Karsh

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Isabella Silverman](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comment - Agenda Item R.1, 10/24/23
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 3:02:19 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear City Clerk,

Can you please include this in the public comment for Agenda Item R.1?

Thank you.

Isabella

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Isabella Silverman** <isilverman2003@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, Oct 24, 2023 at 2:57 PM
Subject: Vote No on Anti-Israel Resolution (Item R-1)
To: Eduardo Martinez <eduardo_martinez@ci.richmond.ca.us>, <soheila_bana@ci.richmond.ca.us>, <Claudia_Jimenez@ci.richmond.ca.us>, <doria_robinson@ci.richmond.ca.us>, <cesar_zepeda@ci.richmond.ca.us>, <gayle_mclaughlin@ci.richmond.ca.us>, Melvin Willis <melvin_willis@ci.richmond.ca.us>

Dear Richmond City Council Members,

I am a Richmond resident and writing in strong opposition to Tuesday's Resolution Item R-1 – an inflammatory and biased statement about the Israel-Hamas conflict. Not only does the resolution lack any factual basis, but it will also deeply exacerbate the trauma and vulnerability of the local Jewish community.

Among its many glaring shortcomings, the proposed resolution fails to mention that this conflict started after Hamas terrorists murdered 1,400 innocent Israeli citizens and foreign nationals. In addition, the resolution text falsely accuses Israel of ethnic cleansing and collective punishment, while offensively referencing the Holocaust to condemn Israel's response to the Hamas attacks.

This is a biased and antisemitic resolution at its very core. No one is fooled by the disclaimer at the end vowing to condemn antisemitism when it is complete contrary to the statements in the resolution. And the reference to the holocaust is completely disrespectful. Israel is not committed to ethnic cleansing and trying to eradicate Palestinians; they are trying to end the terror inflicted on Israel's and Jews by their government - the terrorist group, Hamas. Those are two very different things and you are conflating them and the very definition of ethnic cleansing.

Why does Israel have to constantly defend defending itself from ethnic cleansing — the stated goal of Hamas?

The attack by Hamas on October 7th was the largest ethnic cleansing of Jews since the Holocaust. And you don't even recognize it?

In the wake of the Hamas terrorist attacks our local Jewish community is feeling unsafe and scared, and this resolution's lack of empathy for Jews will only exacerbate the pain the community is feeling. Instead of sowing division, I am asking the City Council to condemn all forms of hate and take steps to support all residents with loved ones in the region.

Please table this item and if you feel compelled to write something, please have the Human Rights Commission take the time to write a statement that promotes unity, inclusivity and peace. This council will not solve any aspect of this crisis and as such a resolution (which calls for solutions) is wholly inappropriate.

Thank you.

Isabella

From: [James Rowen](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: e comment for 10/24
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 10:40:45 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

You don't often get email from jcrownblog@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

My name is James Rowen, 766 7th St.

i am writing with a number of concerns about this resolution in support of the "Palestinian Peoples in Gaza"

Israel was established by a resolution of the United States and the Soviet Union. Since then, it has been attacked, terrorized, suffered the slaughter of its Olympic Team.

The latest surprise attack resulted in the loss of thousands. 9/11 was carried out as punishment for American support for Israel. Israel has complied with all international conferences. Where is the resolution in support of the people of Israel?

There is no group that has suffered organized government holocausts to such magnitude as the Jews.

It goes on and on.

Consider the fact Israel is a democracy.

Thank you.

From: [Jane Kemp](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Response to the Mayor and Vice Mayor's Antisemitic Manifesto
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 10:58:09 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

My name is Jane Kemp. I am a former resident of East Richmond Heights, now living in El Cerrito. My family and I are members of Temple Beth Hillel, and I serve on their board. My family volunteers at GRIP during the holidays.

Eduardo Martinez and Gayle McLaughlin are the mayor and vice mayor of Richmond, a lovely and vibrant city with a long history of domestic issues that should be first and foremost in these elected official's agendas. Instead, they have instead chosen to squander their constituents valuable time and tax dollars by co-writing an ignorant, vile, one-sided, incendiary "Pro-Palestinian" proclamation condemning Israel, never once mentioning Hamas and all their atrocities, that is riddled with so much misinformation I'm not sure it would get a passing grade from a high school history teacher.

In writing this "vanity project" they did not consider if it would benefit the citizens of Richmond, the very people who elected them. They did not seek out expert information, except maybe from Tik Tock, Instagram, Facebook, and a few memes. They have never once reached out to Rabbi Dean Kertesz, at Temple Beth Hillel, the only synagogue in Richmond. They certainly didn't consider the safety ramifications of publishing something this hateful would have on Richmond's Jewish and Israeli constituents, Jewish colleagues, Jewish business owners, and Jewish synagogues. My family shops in Richmond. Our doctors and dentist are in Richmond. I buy my coffee and gas in Richmond. Do I now need to hide my star of David necklace for my own safety when I go to the grocery store or get my teeth cleaned? Or visit our favorite Richmond restaurants? It makes me so angry because this is now something I have to consider!

Most telling to me was that Eduardo Martinez and Gayle McLaughlin never shared their hate filled vanity piece on any of their social media platforms. Instead they chose to hide behind the city of Richmond's government seal and preach this new "woke" form of antisemitism, or as Gayle calls it Progressive Politics.

Eduardo Martinez and Gayle McLaughlin are welcome to their own opinions - I'm certainly not going to challenge that - but this hate needs to stay away from Richmond's municipal government and stop diverting valuable time and attention from what they were actually

elected to do by the citizens of Richmond - city government, not foreign policy! Or, they can go back to grad school, get the proper degree and effect actual change at the diplomatic level.

Richmond deserves focused leadership that is willing to serve the entire community, not just their own special interests. I am so disgusted that this is happening in our community!

Thank you for reading this.

Jane Kemp

From: Jason Jurgeles
To: City Clerk, Dept User
Subject: Please circulate this email to each member of the City Council -- Thanks!
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 11:25:03 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Richmond City Council Members,

I am not a Richmond resident but I am a concerned Bay Area resident and writing in strong opposition to Tuesday's Resolution Item R-1 – an inflammatory and biased statement about the Israel-Hamas conflict. Not only does the resolution lack any factual basis, but it will also deeply exacerbate the trauma and vulnerability of the local Jewish community.

Among its many glaring shortcomings, the proposed resolution fails to mention that this conflict started after Hamas terrorists murdered 1,400 innocent Israeli citizens and foreign nationals. In addition, the resolution text falsely accuses Israel of ethnic cleansing and collective punishment, while offensively referencing the Holocaust to condemn Israel's response to the Hamas attacks.

In the wake of the Hamas terrorist attacks our local Jewish community is feeling unsafe and scared, and this resolution's lack of empathy for Jews will only exacerbate the pain the community is feeling. Instead of sowing division, I am asking the City Council to condemn all forms of hate and take steps to support all residents with loved ones in the region.

For a necessary historical context, consider the following:

100 years ago, with 2 billion people living in the world, there were 15 million Jews, and no Jewish country. Today, in part because the Holocaust wiped out 40% of the entire Jewish population and led to the depopulation of Jews from virtually all of Europe and all of the Middle East where they'd lived for millennia, there is one Jewish country, Israel. The land of Israel is the ancestral home of Jews, and retains a permanent Jewish presence dating back thousands of years. But moreover, it had already become the new home of hundreds of thousands of Jews who began returning there starting in the 1870s, to a then-sparsely populated, undesirable locale. Israel was in the process of becoming a Jewish state prior to the Holocaust.

Today, there are still only 15 million Jews in the world. Half of them live in Israel. For context, there are now 8 billion people in the world, including 2 billion Muslims and 50 Muslim-majority countries (31 cite Islam as their national religion), and there are 2.4 billion Christians and 108 Christian-majority countries (34 cite Christianity as their national religion).^[1]

For generations, Jews and Arabs lived in the area widely known as Gaza. The Gaza Strip is 25 miles north-south and about 6 miles east-west, running along the Mediterranean Sea, bordering Egypt and Israel. It was long controlled by Egypt, but was ceded by Egypt to Israel after the 1967 War. In 1993, pursuant to the Oslo Accords and its promise of a two-state permanent peace plan, Israel granted its governance to the Palestinian Authority (which has always been led by the Fatah party).^[2]

In 1967, the population of Gaza was 394,000. Today, its population is 2.1 million. That population growth rate is among the highest in the world. Half of its population is under 20, which is also among the highest rate in the world. About half of the population is unemployed.^[3]

The Jews of Gaza regularly suffered terrorist attacks. But beginning in the 1980s and continuing for decades, attacks by Palestinians against Jews in Gaza rose to become a massive issue. In a huge gamble unilaterally taken by Israel in 2005, Israel forcibly removed all Jews from Gaza, with the hope that the Palestinians, without the presence of Jews as a catalyst for unrest, would shift their focus to improving their lives. In furtherance of its hope for better neighbors, Israel allowed tens of thousands of Gazans into Israel to work, and allowed Gazans into Israel for medical treatment.

Yet, rather than inducing peace, Israel's gamble led to the opposite result. In 2006, a democratic election was conducted. The majority of Gazans voted not for Fatah, the mainstream Palestinian political party, but instead voted for Hamas. Hamas' position, since its founding in the 1980s, at the time of the 2006 election, and today, is solely focused on the death of all Israelis, and the death of all Jews everywhere, through Palestinian martyrdom.^[4]

Since 2006, Hamas has been the aggressor in mass terrorist assaults against the Israeli people – not the Israeli military, but the Israeli people – on a nonstop basis. Not one year has passed without rockets fired from Gaza at Israeli civilians. Identified wars, involving hundreds and thousands of rockets and infiltrations into Israel, occurred in 2006, 2008, 2010, 2012, 2014, 2018, and 2022, but at no time has there been any substantial period of more than a few months when Hamas did not work to murder Israeli civilians.^[5]

Hamas is financially, militarily, and logistically supported by Iran. It is financially supported by Qatar. It receives support from Turkey.^[6] But while Hamas is often viewed as a proxy for Iran, it is its own entity, and representative of the majority of Gazans.

The wars between Hamas and Israel are known as "asymmetrical." This is because Hamas operates without rules and expressly aims to murder civilians, while Israel has thus far constrained itself to operate at a higher standard than the rules of war require. Digging deeper into this asymmetrical warfare necessitates a fuller understanding of the realities.

In order to understand the situation, four subjects must be addressed: Israel's efforts to make peace with the Palestinians; the Geneva Conventions' description of legitimate military (versus terrorist) operations; the Hamas Charter; and, Israel's military responses to date.

Regarding efforts at peace between Israel and the Palestinians, solely Israel has made efforts at peace, has made difficult compromises for peace, and has suffered for having made efforts at peace. Israel has offered a two-state solution, and the Palestinians have rejected those offers, without counteroffer, on ten occasions:

- 1947: UN General Assembly partition proposal (UNGAR 181) -- rejected.
- 1949: Israel's offer for peace (UNGAR 194) -- rejected.
- 1967: Israel's offer for peace (UNSCR 242) -- rejected.
- 1978: Begin/Sadat peace proposal -- rejected (except by Egypt).
- 1994: Rabin/Husseini peace agreement -- rejected (except by Egypt).
- 1995: Rabin's Contour-for-Peace plan -- rejected.
- 2000: Barak/Clinton peace offer -- rejected.
- 2001: Barak's Taba peace offer -- rejected.
- 2008: Olmert/Bush peace offer -- rejected.
- 2014: Kerry's Contour-for-Peace plan -- rejected.

In the interests of peace, Israel has withdrawn from Egypt, from Lebanon, from Gaza, and from parts of the West Bank. Despite promises, the Palestinians have never made similar efforts. With little exception, Israel has abided by the 1993 Oslo Accords, which granted Palestinian autonomy over Gaza and the majority of the West Bank.^[7] The Palestinians have done virtually nothing to abide by the Oslo Accords. In fact, the Palestinians responded to the Oslo Accords by launching an Intifada that murdered over 1000 Israeli civilians throughout Israel, often through suicide bombings of public buses.

Regarding the 1949 Geneva Conventions, Part II, Article 28 states "The presence of a protected person (i.e., a civilian) may not be used to render certain points or areas immune from military operations." The Geneva Conventions First Protocol, Article 51, states "The civilian population shall not be the object of attack. Acts or threats of violence the primary purpose of which is to spread terror among the civilian population are prohibited. Indiscriminate attacks are prohibited (including) those which are not directed at a specific military objective [ex: against civilians] [and] those which employ a method or means of combat which cannot be directed at a specific military objective [ex: untargeted rockets]. The presence of the civilian population shall not be used to render certain points or areas immune from military operations, in particular in attempts to shield military objectives from attacks or to shield, favor or impede military operations."^[8]

Regarding the Hamas charter, as part of the Muslim Brotherhood, it states the following: the Koran is its Constitution; it seeks to conquer every inch of Palestine; all Jews are to be killed; it advocates death for the sake of Allah; it expressly denies the possibility of negotiated settlement; it demands every Palestinian fight and die seeking to conquer Palestine; it expressly makes no difference between enemies that are men, women, children, or old people; it casts many horrible slanders against all Jews; and, it calls on all Muslims to liberate Palestine. To be clear, Palestine is always referred to by Hamas as the land between the Jordan River and the Mediterranean Sea, which is a general description of Israel. Hamas has always expressly rejected a two-state solution with Israel.^[9]

Regarding Israel's response to date, it has consistently tried to only attack Hamas leaders and terrorists, despite the fact that they hide in, attack from, and store weapons in populated areas. Hamas primarily operates out of the densely-populated Gaza City. Despite extraordinary efforts that eclipse those ever seen in any other military engagement, it is unavoidable that Israel strikes against Hamas sometimes hits Gazans. Israeli forces call off attacks when there are civilians in the area. When there are terrorists in a populated building, they "knock" on the building by hitting it with non-explosives in order to alert civilians. The Israeli army has literally called people on the phone in buildings where there are terrorists in order to encourage them to escape.^[10] All of these actions are over and above the requirements found in the Geneva Conventions.

In the 2023 attack against Israeli civilians, Hamas terrorists murdered over 1400 Israelis. They murdered hundreds at a dance party. They murdered hundreds in small communities, where they shot, burnt, and beheaded their victims, including babies in their cribs. They simultaneously fired thousands of rockets into dozens of Israeli cities, including Israel's major cities of Tel Aviv and Jerusalem.^[11]

Since the formation of Israel, approximately 5,000 Israeli civilians have been murdered by Palestinian terrorists.^[12] For the population of the U.S., that is equivalent to having approximately 200,000 American civilians murdered by terrorists. While Israel is a modern society with no interest in a war because it understands that almost anything is better than war and it has focused its energies on its amazing self-improvement in the fields of agriculture, technology, biology, and the arts, Israel has no alternative but to defend itself.

We know that Hamas won the sole popular election in Gaza. But how do Gazans feel about Hamas? On the one hand, we know from some first-person accounts that there is anger and frustration at Hamas.^[14] Palestinians have received vastly more money than any other group in the world, totaling well over \$25 billion,^[15] and Gaza has received billions in aid, much of which Hamas is demonstrated to have stolen.^[16] Many Gazans would like to leave Gaza.^[17]

But what do the majority of Gazans think about Hamas? In 2006, Gazans elected Hamas 76-43 over Fatah.^[18] There have been no elections in Gaza since that time.

Yet, we know how Gazans feel through regular polling (as well as polling of West Bank Palestinians and of Arab-Israelis). In the most recent poll conducted July 2023, a 57% majority of Gazans expressed a positive opinion of Hamas (along with a 52% of West Bank Palestinians, and a very worrying 64% of Arab-Israelis).^[19] These figures are consistent with long-term polling (specific polling questions are sometimes different from poll to poll).

Going back over the course of Hamas' reign, it has always received the positive opinion of Gazans, and for the terrorism it perpetrates: in the past ten years, we find the following:

- 2014: A majority of Gazans support Hamas, support terrorism against Israel, and support firing rockets into Israel from populated areas.^[20]
- 2016: A majority of Gazans support Hamas, support terrorism against Israel, and support terrorism over peace negotiations.^[21]
- 2018: A majority of Gazans support Hamas, support terrorism against Israel, and believe a two-state solution is dead.^[22]
- 2020: A wide majority of Gazans support Hamas over any other faction.^[23]
- 2022: A wide majority of Gazans support Hamas over any other faction, and a wide majority believe that the Koran prophesizes the near-term demise of Israel.^[24]

Each time Hamas has launched a major attack on Israel, there are three results. First, Gazans appear sympathetically on camera at the sites of Israel's self-defense strikes where Hamas maintains and fires its weapons in the midst of civilian population centers (importantly, unlike in Israel where journalists are able move unfettered, the journalists in Gaza are escorted and can only go where Hamas takes them, and Hamas takes them to either real or staged scenes of civilian distress, so as to exploit this for the world's journalists.^[25] This is widely known as the "CNN Effect"). Second, after each such major Hamas attack on Israel, Gazan polling demonstrates increased support for Hamas, regardless of the outcome of the attack. Third, after each such major attack on Israel, international aid pours into Gaza, which is asserted to be for the reconstruction of civilian infrastructure, but which aid is significantly controlled by and diverted to Hamas.^[26]

Some have suggested that Gazans support Hamas because the next largest rival, Fatah (which governs the West Bank and which Hamas forced out of Gaza) is corrupt. First, that view is dehumanizing and infantilizing because it says that Gazans have no agency and can't help but support an abject terrorist organization. Second, it is ridiculous, because Hamas is equally if not more corrupt. Third, that argument is undercut by the reality that Hamas is a growing force in the West Bank and polls indicate it would win elections there.^[27]

[1] https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_religious_populations; https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Growth_of_religion.

[2] https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Gaza_Strip#Demographics

[3] <https://www.ft.com/content/7b618433-ba5f-4e92-a3e0-d5d41d6d17f8>

[4] <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hamas>

[5] https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Gaza%E2%80%93Israel_conflict

[6]

- <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hamas>
- [7] https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Oslo_Accords
- [8] <https://www.icrc.org/en/war-and-law/treaties-customary-law/geneva-conventions>
- [9] https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hamas_Charter
- [10] https://stratcomcoe.org/cuploads/pfiles/hamas_human_shields.pdf
- [11] https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/2023_Israel%E2%80%93 Hamas_war; https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Re%27im_music_festival_massacre; https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_massacres_during_the_2023_Israel%E2%80%93 Hamas_war
- [12] https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Israeli_casualties_of_war#Terror_and_other_attacks_1948-1967
- [13] <https://apnews.com/article/lifestyle-middle-east-hamas-152644963f4249a7a21154446649910a>; <https://www.reuters.com/world/middle-east/israel-accuses-hamas-hiding-weapons-depots-near-civilian-buildings-2022-07-27/>; <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/morning-mix/wp/2014/07/31/why-hamas-stores-its-weapons-inside-hospitals-mosques-and-schools/>
- [14] <https://www.youtube.com/@PeaceComms/videos>
- [15] https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/International_aid_to_Palestinians
- [16] <https://www.jpost.com/arab-israeli-conflict/hamas-infiltrated-international-gazan-aid-group-stole-tens-of-millions-of-dollars-463211>; <https://www.un.org/unispal/document/auto-insert-208885/>; <https://www.cfr.org/blog/foreign-aid-hamas>
- [17] <https://www.israelnationalnews.com/news/196500>
- [18] <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2006/jan/26/israel1>
- [19] <https://www.washingtoninstitute.org/policy-analysis/polls-show-majority-gazans-were-against-breaking-ceasefire-hamas-and-hezbollah>
- [20] <https://www.pcpsr.org/en/node/498>
- [21] <http://www.pcpsr.org/en/node/636>
- [22] <http://pcpsr.org/en/node/740>
- [23] <http://pcpsr.org/en/node/813>
- [24] <https://pcpsr.org/en/node/906>
- [25] <https://www.hrw.org/news/2016/08/30/palestine-crackdown-journalists-activists>
- [26] https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/International_aid_to_Palestinians
- [27] <https://www.cfr.org/background/what-hamas>

Thank you for your continued education and understanding.

Jason Jungreis
San Francisco

John Gioia (say "Joy-a")
District One
Chair, Board of Supervisors

Contra Costa County

11780 San Pablo Avenue, Suite D
El Cerrito, CA 94530
Phone: (510) 231-8686
Fax: (510) 374-3429

October 24, 2023



Dear Richmond Mayor and Councilmembers:

I am saddened and angered by the recent immense and tragic loss of life of innocent Israeli and Palestinian citizens.

Israelis and Palestinians deserve the opportunity to live free of warfare and violence.

I support the Palestinian people's right to self-determination and a sovereign and safe homeland. Hamas' brutal killing of innocent Israelis does not take away this right. I also support Israel's right to exist in a safe environment for its citizens. This does not justify the killing of innocent Palestinians.

The proposed resolution fails to condemn the terrorist Hamas' killing of innocent Israeli men, women and children, which unfortunately started this recent brutal warfare.

I believe it is important at times like these to bring our community together rather than create divisiveness. The passage of any resolution, regardless of attempts to amend it, will only contribute to the divisiveness.

Instead of voting on the proposed resolution tonight, I strongly recommend that the Council can play a leadership role to bring together our Muslim and Jewish communities in Richmond to work together to develop a resolution that acknowledges and validates the voices of both communities.

Thank you for your consideration of this suggestion.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "John Gioia".

John Gioia
Supervisor, District One

Email: John_Gioia@bos.cccounty.us • Website: www.cocobos.org/gioia

EAST RICHMOND HEIGHTS ♦ EL CERRITO ♦ EL SOBRANTE ♦ KENSINGTON ♦ MONTALVIN MANOR
NORTH RICHMOND ♦ PINOLE ♦ RICHMOND ♦ ROLLINGWOOD ♦ SAN PABLO ♦ TARA HILLS

From: [Julia](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Agenda item R-1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 12:17:10 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

My comment: I strongly oppose this very one-sided approach to an incredibly complex situation across the globe. Why do you feel the need to weigh in so one-sidedly? What will be gained? Fuel antisemitism? Promote anti Israel? Look at the Bay Area companies and the Israeli influence. Do you really want to lose all of that? People will leave. Please educate yourselves about the situation, from both sides. Not from social media, but from well-respected media who have journalists on the ground. Read the accounts of the American politicians who have toured the area. Please do better, please do not pass this resolution! Please be a leader for peace in the Bay Area. This is not the way.

On October 7, Hamas leadership sent over 1,000 armed terrorists into Israeli villages and a music festival with the goal of butchering, maiming, burning, pillaging, and kidnapping as many innocent civilians as possible. They took over 200 hostages and killed over 1,300 people. Where is the resolution condemning that? If the city is passing this resolution without making any references to that, or for the right of Israeli civilians to live in peace, then it is clear how blatantly one-sided the City stands. It is shameful that the city is not denouncing terrorism.

In addition, the resolution has points that are not factual at all. There was never " an ethnic cleansing campaign by explicitly requiring two million Palestinians to leave Gaza immediately or risk being bombed in their homes by the Israeli army." In fact, the Israeli military did announce that it would be striking Hamas strategic targets in northern Gaza and gave civilians a choice to leave in 24 hours if they did not want to get caught in the crossfire -- an option that the Hamas terrorists never gave to the civilians it killed. They would not have had to do this had they not had their villages attacked and innocent citizens slaughtered in horrific ways. Who will govern in the interim during a cease-fire? Hamas? The same organization that has taken most of the aid money and instead of building a port and infrastructure, built sophisticated tunnels and military installments stationed in neighborhoods, many under hospitals. They tortured Druse to get information about Israelis. Druse are Arab. They took hostages, a couple were transporting people from Gaza to Israeli hospitals for medical services. The Israelis let them come in to work, to help the situation, what did they get in return? These same people spied and provided whereabouts of where the unarmed elderly slept and where was the young soldier with a gun, to avoid. Despicable. Also, it won't happen again. So, the Arab world has to step up and help the Palestinians, because Israel will no longer be able to provide them aid. How they have done it up until now is a mystery to me. Hamas, the governing terrorist organization's manifesto is for the destruction of Israel and Jews around the world. But, Israel still cared for the people. Yes, there are some radical extremists in Israel and the West Bank (they should be called out for the terrorist they are), but they comprise a very small percentage of the population. Please check your facts.

Thank you for including my comment, even though I do not reside in Richmond.

Julia Freda-Eskenazi
Los Altos

From: [Julie Freestone](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comments Agenda Item # R.1 Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 7:15:53 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Richmond City Council Members:

I am a longtime Richmond resident and am writing in opposition to Resolution Item R-1 on the October 24 Council agenda. It is a one-sided and misleading statement about the Israel-Hamas conflict. I do not want the City Council to use the language in this resolution to speak for me on this very sad and complicated issue.

Most disturbing is the failure to mention that Hamas was the aggressor in this conflict and that Hamas has a stated mission to destroy Jews and the Jewish nation - a blatant commitment to ethnic cleansing.

This resolution fails to reflect the complexity of the issue and the pain and distress of both Jews and Palestinians.

I ask my City Council to represent me by condemning all forms of hate and support Bay Area organizations working together in this effort.

Julie Freestone
Richmond CA

From: [Kathleen Wimer](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: R.1 Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 2:13:52 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

My name is Kathleen Wimer. I am a Richmond resident.

I find this resolution loaded with inflammatory language, blame, and accusations. Israel, a U.S. ally and a democracy in the Middle East, was attacked on October 7 by the terrorist Hamas. Proportionately, fifteen times the number of people killed in the U.S. on 9/11 died in Israel October 7. Israel seeks to defend itself against any such further attacks. It's all just awful. Adding more incendiary language to the discourse does no good. Instead, I urge substitution - if there must be a Richmond City Council resolution on this matter - of the following:

Whereas, while many historic and largely awful circumstances manifest between the Israeli and Palestinian people from claims each holds to the same land,

And whereas the reason for any resolution now is generated by the October 7 Hamas attack on Israel that killed 1,400 civilians, and by Israel's subsequent attempts to defend itself from further such attacks,

Be it resolved that the City of Richmond CA urges U.S. and U.N. diplomatic efforts to insist

1. that Israel be sanctioned for any collective punishment of Palestinians for the acts of terrorist Hamas, as collective punishment is a war crime under the Geneva Convention, and
2. that humanitarian treatment be afforded citizens injured in the October 7 attack against Israel and in the Israeli defense mounted against Hamas since.

Thank you for your consideration of this suggestion.

Kathleen Wimer
518 Tremont Ave.
Richmond, CA 94801
(510) 230-4600

From: ka.hardy@yahoo.com
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Fw: Vote No on Anti-Israel Resolution (Item R-1)
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 4:23:05 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Begin forwarded message:

From: ka hardy <kabbetthardy@gmail.com>
Date: October 23, 2023 at 2:18:27 PM PDT
To: eduardo_martinez@ci.richmond.ca.us, soheila_bana@ci.richmond.ca.us,
Claudia_Jimenez@ci.richmond.ca.us, doria_robinson@ci.richmond.ca.us,
cesar_zepeda@ci.richmond.ca.us, gayle_mclaughlin@ci.richmond.ca.us,
melvin_willis@ci.richmond.ca.us
Subject: **Vote No on Anti-Israel Resolution (Item R-1)**

Dear Richmond City Council Members,

I am a West County resident, and I write in strong opposition to Tuesday's Resolution Item R-1. My family stands in solidarity with our Jewish brothers and sisters against this dangerous, one-sided, unwise, and unhelpful resolution.

I've never had to worry that my kid would be attacked at school because of Hamas' recent call for a "day of rage" against Jews worldwide. I have a very good imagination though, and I know that would be absolutely terrifying all by itself even without the millennia of anti-semitism that accompanies it. I also know the very real fear that my friends and neighbors feel, both Jewish-American and Palestinian-American.

Resolution R-1 inflames a complicated and painful issue, rather than providing any actual thoughtfulness or support to Palestinians, Jews, or Israelis. It's political point-making for its own sake, without any regard for the very real impact that may ensue for residents of West County. We urge you to reject this resolution unanimously.

Kelly, Joe, & Jackson Hardy

From: [Kerry Hillis](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Fwd: Vote No on Item R-1 - Anti-israel Resolution
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 8:36:47 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: Kerry Hillis <kerry@kerryhillis.com>
Date: October 22, 2023 at 8:44:41 PM PDT
To: eduardo_martinez@ci.richmond.ca.us, Claudia_Jimenez@ci.richmond.ca.us, doria_robinson@ci.richmond.ca.us, cesar_zepeda@ci.richmond.ca.us, gayle_mclaughlin@ci.richmond.ca.us, melvin_willis@ci.richmond.ca.us, soheila_bana@ci.richmond.ca.us
Subject: **Vote No on Item R-1 - Anti-israel Resolution**

Dear Richmond City Council Members,

I am a member of the Moraga Town Council and my Jewish family members have lived in Richmond since 1987.

I am writing in strong opposition to Tuesday's Resolution Item R-1 – an inflammatory and biased statement about the Israel-Hamas conflict. Not only does the resolution lack any factual basis, but it will also deeply exacerbate the trauma and vulnerability of the local Jewish community.

Among its many glaring shortcomings, the proposed resolution fails to mention that this conflict started after Hamas terrorists murdered 1,400 innocent Israeli citizens and foreign nationals. In addition, the resolution text falsely accuses Israel of ethnic cleansing and collective punishment, while offensively referencing the Holocaust to condemn Israel's response to the Hamas attacks.

In the wake of the Hamas terrorist attacks our local Jewish community is feeling unsafe and scared, and this resolution's lack of empathy for Jews will only exacerbate the pain the community is feeling. Instead of sowing division, I am asking City Council to condemn all forms of hate and take steps to support all residents with loved ones in the region.

Kerry Hillis
Moraga Town Councilmember

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Shasa Curl](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept](#); [Dave Aleshire](#); [Shannon Moore](#)
Subject: Fwd: Please Pull Item R-1 Resolution
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 6:45:06 AM

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: Kevin Wilk <kevinwilk@hotmail.com>
Date: October 23, 2023 at 6:05:50 PM PDT
To: Eduardo Martinez <Eduardo_Martinez@ci.richmond.ca.us>, Soheila Bana <Soheila_Bana@ci.richmond.ca.us>, Claudia Jimenez <Claudia_Jimenez@ci.richmond.ca.us>, Doria Robinson <Doria_Robinson@ci.richmond.ca.us>, Cesar Zepeda <Cesar_Zepeda@ci.richmond.ca.us>, Gayle McLaughlin <Gayle_McLaughlin@ci.richmond.ca.us>, Melvin Willis <melvin_willis@ci.richmond.ca.us>
Cc: Shasa Curl <Shasa_Curl@ci.richmond.ca.us>
Subject: Please Pull Item R-1 Resolution

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Mayor Martinez, and Honorable Richmond City Council Members,

As a Walnut Creek City Councilmember and former Mayor, I know the importance of Resolutions and Proclamations to a community. Most are straight-forward without any grievance to members of the community who aren't included in the Resolution. The Resolution on Item R-1 is not one of these. It is highly disturbing to members of the Jewish Community, who already feel in danger following the attack in Israel. As the only Jewish Councilmember in Walnut Creek (and only one of two Jewish council members in Contra Costa County), I can tell you that the Jewish community is on edge. Many Jewish people even in Walnut Creek have written to me about the Richmond Resolution standing in solidarity with Gaza (and by implication, not Israel). There have been threats to the Jewish Community, and Walnut Creek was among the first cities to be bombarded by heinous antisemitic calls beginning last June.

I fear that the Resolution as worded, is highly biased about the Israel-Hamas conflict, and will only further enflame tensions locally, which I'm sure you don't want to see. Without getting into all the inflammatory statements, using phrases like "ethnic cleansing" and "genocide" are highly offensive and not agreed upon by any means. Furthermore, the Resolution doesn't recognize the right of Israel to defend itself or that this recent conflict began with the murder of 1,400 innocent Israeli citizens... many women, children, and grandparents. It also fails to mention over 200 kidnapped hostages being held in Gaza.

I am respectfully asking that you pull this Resolution from consideration. The pressure from the

community to vote one way or the other will be immense, and whichever way you vote, you will upset many Richmond residents who you have the responsibility of representing. Rather, by taking a minute to recognize the tragedy of loss of lives among innocents, and that we abhor hate in all its form against anyone... Palestinian or Israeli... people will feel recognized and stand by the councils comments. Even a replacement resolution affirming the sanctity of innocent lives and standing united against hate and violence is preferable. This is important, as opposed to dividing the community.

As a Jew, I preach peace and acceptance. I was in Israel in March, 2023 and visited Kfar Aza at the Gaza Border. This Kibbutz was the site of over hundred murders and kidnappings on October 7th. I still can't believe I met people a few months ago, who no longer are alive.

I implore you not to further enflame tensions, and to pull this Resolution in favor of speaking out for all innocent people and against hate and violence.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Kevin Wilk
Walnut Creek City Councilmember
(Mayor 2021)

From: [Larry Fox](#)
To: [Eduardo Martinez](#); [Soheila Bana](#); [Claudia Jimenez](#); [Cesar Zepeda](#); [Doria Robinson](#); [Gayle McLaughlin](#); [Melvin Willis](#)
Cc: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comments – R-1 - Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 10:28:57 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Richmond City Council Members:

As a lifetime resident of Richmond, I am appalled by the language and sentiments in your Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza. On the surface, this all sounds well and good, but rather misplaced given the plethora of issues that the City of Richmond currently faces. The same time and resources should be applied to issues within our city and its citizens. Take your pick there are hundreds of them.

With that obvious notion mentioned, I will address one of the most egregious statements in the resolution. The one I take the greatest exception to is the statement that "Israel is now engaged in an ethnic cleansing campaign by explicitly requiring two million Palestinians to leave Gaza immediately or risk being bombed in their homes by the Israeli army." While that may have been defined in the line above that does not make it true. Ethnic Cleansing is a highly inaccurate depiction. While I do believe it may be an overreaction to a vicious attack, the kidnapping and killing of civilians (many children) - it is not ethnic cleansing. Israel, unlike Hamas, did give Palestinians a warning and time to leave to minimize casualties. That is not an act of Ethnic Cleansing or genocide. However, Hamas' manifesto does call for the destruction of Israel, which seems a lot closer to genocide to me.

There are so many ways this resolution could have been positive - calling for calm and peaceful ways to address this "war." and support both peoples. Instead, statements were made that were inflammatory and could only heighten tensions in our Richmond community, essentially giving antisemites the excuse to attack the Jews in our community. This is dangerous and condones poor behavior at the very least, if not indicating that violence is okay against members of our community. That is not the Richmond I know and not one that I want to be a part of.

My Community, that of the good people of Richmond, which the Jewish community is a vital part of, stands with its brothers and sisters for its call for peace and dignity of all people here and around the world. Demonizing does not help anyone, especially when it is not accurate.

I believe that Council Member Zepeda has alternative language for the Resolution, that would be far more appropriate for our city.

Do not pass this resolution as it stands. It only invites hate and provides nothing positive for anyone who needs it.

Sincerely,

Larry Fox
Richmond Resident for over 51 years
Richmond, CA 94805
larrydafox@gmail.com

From: [Lauren Schiffman](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public comments agenda item R-1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 3:12:30 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Sorry this is late, but I hope you'll include it in the public record; I emailed this to the mayor and council members yesterday evening but didn't see the agenda document with instructions to submit comment until now:

Dear Mayor and Members of the Richmond City Council,

I am a resident and business owner in Richmond and have been a longtime supporter of the agenda of the RPA and of Mayor Martinez, even going door-to-door with flyers for his mayoral campaign. But today I am emailing you to urge you to vote no on the current Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity With the People of Gaza.

You are issuing this resolution at a time of great geopolitical strife in Israel/Gaza, yet you never define Hamas or mention the goal of Hamas (per the Hamas Charter) to eliminate Israel. You do not mention the Hamas attack of October 7, in which Hamas militants massacred more than 1,400 Israeli citizens, including children, women, and elders. You do not mention that Hamas currently holds more than 200 hostages, including Israeli civilians—even children--and citizens of other nations.

This is not to disagree with the point that the people of Gaza have been mistreated for decades and are currently suffering a tragedy. I hope for a ceasefire, for Gazan civilians to get the aid they need, and for a solution leading to peace in the region-- because the people of Gaza and the people of Israel deserve to live in peace. I wonder why in your resolution you talk about the people and population of Gaza but only about the state of Israel. Just as the brutal Hamas attack doesn't reflect the hearts of all Gazan people, the actions of the current right-wing Israeli government don't reflect all the people of Israel. That is evident by the hundreds of thousands of Israelis who were protesting the current government before the Hamas attack earlier this month.

Language demonizing the "state of Israel" gets interpreted as reflecting on Israelis and all Jewish people and can lead to antisemitism. My daughter is a student at El Cerrito High and has seen photos of classmates giving Nazi salutes and graffitied swastikas during her time there. Earlier in the school year, the school held its fair to introduce student clubs. She

described how a group of boys were shouting "Free Palestine" at a lone girl staffing the Jewish Student Union table. My daughter said she felt uncomfortable seeing the girl alone but felt too intimidated to approach her. So if you think antisemitism is not currently happening here in Contra Costa County and making people feel unsafe, that's not accurate. And I want to express that on reading this resolution, I felt alone—as if I'm not part of a constituency that matters to the City of Richmond.

If you hope for a speedy resolution to this current conflict and for peace in the region, as I do, I hope you'll vote no on Item R-1. If you feel that you need to register your thoughts on this issue, I urge you to author a resolution offering sympathy for both innocent Palestinians and innocent Israelis, perhaps engaging local Palestinian and Jewish leaders to help draft a more inclusive message.

Sincerely,

Lauren Schiffman
Richmond, CA

From: [Leisa Johnson](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Cc: [Leisa Johnson](#)
Subject: Public Comment, Agenda Item R.1 on 10/24/2023
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 11:18:32 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear City Clerk,

Can you please incorporate my comments below into the supplementary minutes?

Thank you.

Warmly,
Leisa

Good evening, Mayor & Councilmembers.

It is deeply distressing that the Mayor, his chief of staff, and Vice Mayor intentionally wrote such a one-sided, antisemitic and divisive resolution without any outreach to Richmond's diverse community, when you could have welcomed a unique opportunity to try and do something based on finding common ground and unification.

Interestingly, many speakers in support of this resolution are not from Richmond. Many, in fact, were bussed in from afar.

In contrast, many residents are afraid to come and speak tonight. Please do not take their silence as support for this resolution.

You had a speaker this evening proudly yell out the Hamas rallying cry to arms, erasing the State of Israel and its people.

And you did nothing Mr. Mayor.

And you wonder why they are afraid?

You claim you are listening, but are you?

The authors once again bring division to Richmond and for that you will also be remembered.

The current resolution does not speak for Richmond and it is an abuse of the elected office you

hold.

The amendments tonight are woefully inadequate.

There is no Solution in this Resolution.

Please table this item and propose an alternative and healing path that is inclusive & unifying.

Thank you.

Leisa

From: [Dr. Leslie Jacoby](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Fwd: Wish to Oppose R.1 Resolution for the Palestinians at City Council Meeting Today
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 11:04:15 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Dr. Leslie Jacoby** <dr.lesliejacoby@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, Oct 24, 2023 at 10:56 AM
Subject: Wish to Oppose R.1 Resolution for the Palestinians at City Council Meeting Today
To: <cityclerkdept@ci.richmond.ca.us>, <Mary_marable@ci.richmond.ca.us>

Dear Mary, Please forward my words to all the council members before the meeting today at 4:30 p.m. Thank you for doing this for me. Best wishes, Dr. Jacoby

My Response and Request to speak at the Meeting:

R. STUDY AND ACTION SESSION

R.1 Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza (514)

AGENDA(s)

REGULAR MEETING OF THE RICHMOND CITY COUNCIL

Tuesday, October 24, 2023, 4:30 p.m.

Community Services Building

440 Civic Center Plaza Richmond, CA 94804

Members:

Eduardo Martinez, Mayor at Large

Melvin Willis, Councilmember District 1

Cesar Zepeda, Councilmember District 2

Doria Robinson, Councilmember District 3

Soheila Bana, Councilmember District 4

Gayle McLaughlin, Vice Mayor, District 5

Claudia Jimenez, Councilmember District 6

Dear Mayor Martinez; Councilmember Willis (D1); Councilmember Zepeda (D2); Councilmember Robinson (D3); Councilmember Bana (D4); Vice Mayor McLaughlin (D5); and, Councilmember Jimenez (D6):

I would like to voice my heartfelt and **firm opposition** to your proposed,
“R.1 **Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza.**”

First, this resolution seems to be outside the normal purview of the legislative and policy-making obligations of a city council, which is elected to maintain and promote solid economic, fiscal, and personal safety and security policies; that is, to facilitate a city to function well for all its citizens.

This proposed resolution not only goes outside these functions, but also inflames and will potentially lead to increased antisemitic atrocities and promote greater friction amongst the citizens of Richmond and outer cities in Contra Costa County and beyond.

Second, this resolution does nothing to address the heinous and barbarous acts (actually filmed on GoPro cameras by the Hamas militia) that precipitated the most recent war between Israel (a legitimized democratic government) and Hamas (an acknowledged feckless and corrupt terrorist group that was voted in by the Palestinian people to act as their proxies). The recent acts on October 7, 2023 have been repeatedly acknowledged as reminiscent of the horrific crimes of the Nazis and Fascists in World War II. To ignore any wording to condemn these events shows the same complicity that prevailed in the 1930s and 1940s, which has been analyzed for decades and “virtue signaled” as corroborative silence on the Holocaust and its inhumane atrocities.

This resolution is prejudicial at best and antisemitic at worst without acknowledgement of both sides of the complicated geopolitical situation. If passed, it will be held historically in the same light as those of the World War II acts of complicity with genocide and inexcusable war crimes.

Third, this resolution does not boldly condemn the barbary monstrous charter of the Hamas organization, which actually calls for the complete destruction and eradication of Israel and the Jewish people. This resolution does not hold

accountable the Palestinian government and its officials for its repeated outright refusal over the past 20 years to work with Israeli officials (and global entities) towards peace and a safe and secure two-country solution. Instead, it reeks of blind bias towards current politically correct rhetoric.

This resolution does nothing to educate and inform Richmond's citizens of the complicated history of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict that goes back hundreds if not thousands of years. It only jumps on the current bandwagon of misinformed propaganda, which is dangerous.

Fourth, it is unclear why this resolution is being proposed in the first place. Is this for some political capital for the upcoming elections? Is it to appease the 1% Muslim population? Or the .5% Jewish population? Or the 30% Catholic population.

Whichever reason, if this resolution is approved, I will personally do everything in my power to campaign against the individuals who vote for this misaligned resolution.

Thank you for reading and hearing my opinion on the R.1 Resolution.

Best regards,
Dr. Jacoby

--

Leslie Jacoby, M.F.A., Ph.D.
Comparative Literature and Medieval Studies
Dr.LeslieJacoby@gmail.com

--

Leslie Jacoby, M.F.A., Ph.D.
Comparative Literature and Medieval Studies
Dr.LeslieJacoby@gmail.com

From: [Leslie Ross](#)
To: [Cesar Zepeda](#); [Claudia Jimenez](#); [Doria Robinson](#); [Eduardo Martinez](#); [Gayle McLaughlin](#); [Melvin Willis](#); [Soheila Bana](#); [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Vote No on Anti-Israel Resolution (Item R-1)
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 8:12:01 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Richmond City Council Members,

VOTE NO or all be voting NO for you!

Why are you not concentrating on all the issues here in Richmond?! The city is turning into a cesspool. Only areas doing their job are police and fire and you don't even support them.

I am a Richmond resident and writing in strong opposition to Tuesday's Resolution Item R-1 – an inflammatory and biased statement about the Israel-Hamas conflict. Not only does the resolution lack any factual basis, but it will also deeply exacerbate the trauma and vulnerability of the local Jewish community.

Among its many glaring shortcomings, the proposed resolution fails to mention that this conflict started after Hamas terrorists murdered 1,400 innocent Israeli citizens and foreign nationals. In addition, the resolution text falsely accuses Israel of ethnic cleansing and collective punishment, while offensively referencing the Holocaust to condemn Israel's response to the Hamas attacks.

In the wake of the Hamas terrorist attacks our local Jewish community is feeling unsafe and scared, and this resolution's lack of empathy for Jews will only exacerbate the pain the community is feeling. Instead of sowing division, I am asking City Council to condemn all forms of hate and take steps to support all residents with loved ones in the region.

Sent from my iPhone

From: [M. Semler](#)
To: [Eduardo Martinez](#); [Soheila Bana](#); [Claudia Jimenez](#); [Doria Robinson](#); [Cesar Zepeda](#); [Gayle McLaughlin](#); [Melvin Willis](#)
Cc: [City Clerk Dept User](#); [Shasa Curl](#); [Dave Aleshire](#)
Subject: Vote No on Anti-Israel Resolution, Item R.1
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 2:48:48 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Richmond City Council Members,

I am a Richmond resident and writing in strong opposition to Tuesday's Resolution Item R-1 – an inflammatory and biased statement about the Israel-Hamas conflict. Not only does the resolution lack any factual basis, but it will also deeply exacerbate the trauma and vulnerability of the local Jewish community.

Among its many glaring shortcomings, the proposed resolution fails to mention that this conflict started after Hamas terrorists murdered 1,400 innocent Israeli citizens and foreign nationals. In addition, the resolution text falsely accuses Israel of ethnic cleansing and collective punishment, while offensively referencing the Holocaust to condemn Israel's response to the Hamas attacks.

In the wake of the Hamas terrorist attacks our local Jewish community is feeling unsafe and scared, and this resolution's lack of empathy for Jews will only exacerbate the pain the community is feeling. Instead of sowing division, I am asking the City Council to condemn all forms of hate and take steps to support all residents with loved ones in the region.

Please table this item and find an alternative avenue(s) to promote healing and peace in Richmond, one that is inclusive of all Jews, Israelis, Muslims and Palestinians.

Madison

From: [Maggie Jacobs](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Resolution R-1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 4:50:18 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

You don't often get email from maggie.jacobs@sbcglobal.net. [Learn why this is important](#)

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

As a long-time Richmond resident and member of the Jewish community, I wish to register my strong opposition to Resolution R-1.

Sincerely,

Maggie Jacobs

From: [Marilyn Alwan](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Fwd: Agenda item R1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 5:59:02 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Begin forwarded message:

From: Marilyn Alwan <gogomarilyn1@yahoo.com>
Date: October 24, 2023 at 5:14:55 PM PDT
To: cityclerkdept@ci.richmond.ca.us
Subject: Agenda item R1

Dear Mayor Martinez and Council Members,

I applaud your resolution supporting the caged people of Gaza who are subjected to relentless Israeli bombardment and genocidal policies sadly financed from American tax payers. I'm sure the residents of Richmond would rather keep these billions of dollars used to kill Palestinians at home to finance much needed projects for people here.

That one party (Israel) has the power to cut off water, food, and energy to 2.3 million people should tell people which side has the power to suffocate and wipe out the other. People

seems to forget why there is a “Strip” in Gaza. The city of Gaza was a 5,000 -year -old prosperous metropolis but in the 1948 Nakba, Israel forcibly transferred several hundred thousand Palestinians from their homes to Gaza City and a small area around it and created an artificial barrier to cage them into a “Strip.” At present 75% of the people in Gaza are refugees. They cannot leave.

I wish to share 2 important videos

(1) An Irish Parliamentarian 5-minutes speech that summarizes the hypocrisy and moral cowardice of supporters of Apartheid Israel.

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=f7fMYRJpgIM>

(2) A very timely lecture by renowned Israeli historian Ilan Pappé that NorCal Sabeel co-sponsored with several departments and groups at U C Berkeley last Thursday October 19.

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1OcjOP8iUCU>

I appreciate the Richmond City council leadership in passing this important resolution.

Thank you.

Marilyn Alwan
1420 5th Street
Alameda, CA 94501

Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza

From: [Marisol Cantú](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comments for Agenda Item R-1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 12:59:21 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Hello City Clerk,

I am writing in support of R-1. As a 3rd generation Richmond resident and a Reimagining Public Safety Taskforce Member, I stand with Palestine and ask our city council members to support the resolution.

Thanks,
Marisol

From: [Maryn Hurlbut](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#); [Phil Ginsburg](#)
Subject: Richmond,CA City Council Meeting 10-24-23 item R.1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 1:03:13 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

The proposed resolution wording implies siding with one group within an international conflict.

More correctly, I propose a resolution should read:
Richmond condemns terrorism or any acts of war against innocent civilians EVERYWHERE. Kidnapping, killing, torturing or hurting any innocent civilian is a war crime and will never be condoned by rational civilized humans.

Please read this into the public record at the appropriate time.

Thank you for this and all your good work.

Sincerely,

Maryn Hurlbut

Maryn Hurlbut, Former Chair, Rec. & Parks Commission
RTA Board Vice President, Secretary, Treasurer
510 237-6880
510 596-8880 cell
richmondtennis.ca@gmail.com

Check out "news and events" on <http://www.rta-ca.org>
Like us on <https://facebook.com/richmondtennisca>

Your RTA membership helps buy balls and new tennis courts and park facilities. Please sign up on above website, choose "join/donate", today.

From: [Olga Paredes](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comments Agenda Item # R.1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 12:58:24 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

As a long-time resident of Richmond (23 years) I am writing to express my strong opposition to Resolution R.1. It contains factual errors and allegations and uses inflammatory language that shuts down civil discourse and widens the divide between those on opposite side of this issue. Most importantly, it places us all in danger. This resolution is not about human rights, it is about advancing a political ideology.

Both Palestinians and Israelis have endured suffering at the hands of other for many, many years. Neither side is blameless and R.1 does not recognize that fact. Hamas launched a brutal attack targeted specifically at innocent Israeli civilians. R.1, in effect, endorses that action.

As we all know, there has been an uptick in hate crimes against Jews and Palestinians (and Muslims in general). Demonizing Israel feeds the narrative that only one side is to blame and carries the very real possibility of inciting more violence against Jews and Muslims alike. This resolution is objectively dangerous to us all.

War has no winners. If we value peace and want to stop hate we must take an unbiased look at the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. I strongly urge the Council to vote down this resolution and replace it with one that creates an environment for civil, impartial discourse.

Salaam, Shalom

Olga Paredes

Este mensaje es enviado por mi iPhone

From: [Paula H](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: public comment about condemning Israel (don't)
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 1:05:23 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

I have been a Richmond resident for decades. I voted for most if not all of you, that said I am both a strong supporter of Israel's right to exist as well as a supporter of all people to live a healthy and decent life.

I'd like to see a diplomatic resolution to the current conflict but I wonder who Israel or the US could negotiate with. Have you read the Hamas charter, if you haven't I suggest that you do.

I hope that Netan-YaHoo will be gone soon, replaced by a saner and more left-wing leader. I also hope that the Palestinian people can get an intelligent and decent leader who will bring her people into the 21st century.

The Israel of 1948 was very small with a strong social justice doctrine. After attack, after regular attack, Israel got larger. Was that righteous? Spoils of war are often the result of war. Hamas cannot be negotiated with. That makes me very sad. I want a two-state solution.

What I do not want is my city weighing-in in a way that will only inflame anti-semitism or anti-Arab sentiments or worse, violence. We can say we support the human rights of all people and that we encourage decent leadership on both sides and a two-state solution with both sides respecting the right of both states to exist and flourish.

Sincerely,
Paula Helene
Richmond, CA 94801

From: [paula.rainey](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: PUBLIC COMMENT Agenda Item #R1
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 4:35:00 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Madam Clerk

I wish to submit my comments to the Mayor and Richmond City Council members on Agenda Item #R1, that will be heard on October 24.

I strongly urge the Mayor and City Council to approve tonight's Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza.

The people of Richmond are good people and see the humanity in other people around the globe. This resolution brings some measure of support to the beleaguered people of Gaza and sends a message to the world that we will not stand by as a world community to watch horror systematically inflicted on others. All parties suffer with this insanity unleashed on what has already become a hell scape.

As a resident of a neighboring community and having worked the issue of Palestine for more than half of my lifetime, I applaud the city for bringing this resolution forward.

This is a humanitarian crisis such as we have never known. Ceasefire now! Open a humanitarian cooridor! Solve this crisis with negotiations and stop the war now! The US is complicit in these war crimes and the people call these crimes out.

Approve the resolution before you tonight.

Sincerely,

Paula Rainey

556 Palace Court, Alameda CA 94501

From: [Rachel Kertz](#)
To: [Eduardo Martinez](#); [+soheila_bana@ci.richmond.ca.us](#); [+Claudia Jimenez@ci.richmond.ca.us](#); [+doria_robinson@ci.richmond.ca.us](#); [+cesar_zepeda@ci.richmond.ca.us](#); [+gayle_mclaughlin@ci.richmond.ca.us](#); [+melvin_willis@ci.richmond.ca.us](#); [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Vote No on Anti-Israel Resolution (Item R-1)
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 8:46:48 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Richmond City Council Members,

I am a Councilmember of San Rafael, and the North Bay Chair of the Bay Area Network of Jewish Officials (BANJO), and I'm writing in strong opposition to **Tuesday's Resolution Item R-1 – an inflammatory and biased statement about the Israel-Hamas conflict**. Not only does the resolution lack any factual basis, but it will also deeply exacerbate the trauma and vulnerability of the local Jewish community.

Among its many glaring shortcomings, the proposed resolution fails to mention that this conflict started after Hamas terrorists murdered 1,400 innocent Israeli citizens and foreign nationals. In addition, the resolution text falsely accuses Israel of ethnic cleansing and collective punishment, while offensively referencing the Holocaust to condemn Israel's response to the Hamas attacks.

In the wake of the Hamas terrorist attacks our local Jewish community is feeling unsafe and scared, and this resolution's lack of empathy for Jews will only exacerbate the pain the community is feeling. Instead of sowing division, I am asking the City Council to condemn all forms of hate and take steps to support all residents with loved ones in the region.

Rachel Kertz
Councilmember City of San Rafael
415-299-7008

From: [Rachel Sommovilla](#)
To: [Claudia Jimenez](#); [Soheila Bana](#); [Cesar Zepeda](#); [Doria Robinson](#); [Eduardo Martinez](#); [Gayle McLaughlin](#); [Melvin Willis](#)
Cc: [Shasa Curl](#); [Lina Velasco](#); [Shannon Moore](#); John_Gioia@bos.cccounty.us; [Pamela Christian](#); [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: My thoughts on Resolution R-1 (please vote no)
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 4:46:35 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Richmond City Council Members,

I served for approximately nine years as your assistant city attorney, senior assistant city attorney, and acting and interim city attorney, and I am a West Contra Costa County resident. My children attend WCCUSD schools and I am actively involved in Richmond non-profits, serving on the Board of the Richmond Art Center. I love the City of Richmond, which is why I am taking time to reach out in strong opposition to Resolution R-1. This inflammatory and biased statement about the Israel-Hamas conflict will deeply exacerbate the trauma and vulnerability of Richmond's local Jewish community.

I hope you will take the time to read this to understand the incredible pain and suffering felt right now by your local Jewish community. On October 7th, during Shabbat and the Jewish High Holiday Simchat Torah, Hamas gunmen entered Israel with maps of daycare centers and preschools to find children to murder and take hostage. They ruthlessly murdered 1,400 people, burning families alive, raping women next to their dead friends and family, killing children in front of their parents, beheading children, and kidnapping at least 200 Israelis and taking them hostage. **More Jews were killed on this day than on any day since the Holocaust.** Since that time, I have spent countless hours checking on my friends in Israel, trying to find housing for my displaced Israeli friends, learning that a friend's cousin was one of those murdered, learning that another friend's family was nearly murdered and miraculously saved, receiving emails from my synagogue about security enhancements and grief support, wondering if it is safe to send my sons to Hebrew school there, and wondering if I should send my sons to school when Hamas called for a "day of rage" against Jews worldwide. It has been incredibly traumatic. The Richmond City Council was silent when these Jews were murdered. **The proposed resolution remains silent as to the murder of these Jews, and, if it is adopted, will send a strong signal that the Richmond City Council does not value Jewish life, including my life, and that of my children.**

Resolution R-1 fails to mention that this conflict started after Hamas terrorists murdered 1,400 innocent Israeli citizens and foreign nationals. Hamas is a terrorist organization dedicated to the destruction of Jews and Israel: The Hamas covenant, produced at its founding in 1988, states: "Israel will exist . . . until Islam will obliterate it. [Preamble]". "The Day of Judgment will not come about until Muslims fight Jews and kill them. Then the Jews will hide behind rocks and trees, and the rocks and trees will cry out. . . there is a Jew hiding behind me, come kill them. [Article 7]" "Palestine is an Islamic land . . . peaceful solutions . . . are in contradiction to the principles of the Islamic Resistance Movement." In 2019, Fathi Hamad, **a senior member of Hamas leadership, was recorded making a speech during which he urged followers across the globe to "attack every Jew**

possible in all the world and kill them." This includes your Jewish community here. Hamas has been the elected government in Gaza since 2006, after Israel withdrew from Gaza in 2005. Is it not a legitimate goal of Israel to seek to weaken Hamas and bring back its grandmothers, children, and citizens held hostage? Resolution R-1 is notably silent regarding Hamas's plan for Jewish genocide.

Both Jews and Palestinians are suffering greatly. **Both Jews and Palestinians deserve to be seen in their full humanity, in their pain and in their goodness.** The resolution does not see the humanity of Israelis and Jews. I also stand in solidarity with the Palestinians and the violence in Gaza breaks my heart. But this resolution does not recognize both sides of the conflict, contains many unsupported statements, and strongly implies that Hamas's violence against Jews is acceptable. When I got a message from WCCUSD about this issue, it recognized suffering on both sides and made trauma resources available for all of its students. This stands in stark contrast to Resolution R-1 which devalues Jewish life and chooses a side. The token conclusory sentence that the resolution "vows to combat anti-semitism" does not make this so.

If you pass this resolution, you will put your Jewish residents at further risk. Whether or not you see it, the physical threat to Jews in Richmond and around the world is real. The Anti-Defamation League has reported that anti-semitic incidents in the U.S. reached an all-time high last year with a total of 3,697 incidents of assault, harassment, and vandalism, which represents the largest number of incidents against Jews in the U.S. in my lifetime. Hundreds of these attacks involve references to Israel and Zionism. At least 70 incidents were perpetrated by individuals associated with anti-Zionist activist groups, some of whom praised Hamas's terrorist attack on Israel on October 7th, and another 50 were perpetrated by white supremacist groups as part of efforts to foment anti-Israel and anti-semitic beliefs. The threat to Muslims is real too. Recently, a 6 year-old Palestinian-American boy was stabbed to death in a hate crime, and this week, a young Jewish woman in Detroit, president of her synagogue, was stabbed to death. I believe your council meetings themselves have been zoom bombed by antisemitic and racist hate speech this month, as has been common in cities all across California. Finger-pointing and stoking hate will only increase these incidents.

Resolution R-1 relies on an inapposite model of colonialism to explain what is happening, falsely accusing Israel of ethnic cleansing while offensively referencing the Holocaust to condemn Israel's response to the Hamas attacks. The problem is that the model does not fit -- it maps onto anti-semitic tropes, leading to a cruel and dehumanizing view of Israeli and Jewish lives. Colonizers do not have thousands of years of history in the land they colonize as the Jews do in Israel. Colonizers have a country they can be decolonized to. (In fact, the term Palestine comes from the Romans -- around 135 C.E., the Romans killed Bar Kokhba, murdered and/or exiled the Jews from Judea, and the Romans renamed the land Syria Palaestina.) I ask those who call Shabbat and Simchat Torah's pogrom a step towards decolonization -- where are the Jews who fled from Iraq, Yemen, Iran, Russia, Ethiopia, and from Europe after surviving the Holocaust supposed to go?

In the wake of the Hamas terrorist attacks, our local Jewish community is feeling unsafe and scared, and this resolution's lack of empathy for Jews will only exacerbate the pain the community is feeling. We live haunted by the six million Jews who perished in the Holocaust, having grown up studying this history and the accounts of Primo Levi, Elie Wiesel, Anne Frank, Hannah Arendt and more, in an attempt to ensure "Never Again." The many attempted genocides of the Jewish people over the years have made us especially vulnerable and afraid right now. I feel compelled to write -- as Rabbi Hillel said, "If I am not for myself, who will be for me? If I am not for others, what am I? And if not now when?" Please stand for all of us. The City Council should not adopt Resolution R-1 and should instead condemn all forms of hate and consider how to more positively support both its Jewish and Palestinian residents who are greatly suffering right now.

Rachel Sommovilla

From: [Rita Barouch](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Fw: Public Comments Item #R1
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 10:12:27 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear esteemed Mayor Martinez, Vice Mayor McLaughlin, City Councilpersons Willis, Bana, Zepeda, Robinson and Jimenez,

Our shared values for human life compel us to respond to this crisis impacting innocent civilians in Palestine and Israel. As a Jewish American living in Richmond, I sincerely believe that the current violence against Palestinians in Gaza; especially the denial of food, medicines, water, electricity are unconscionable, war crimes, and detrimental, reducing the safety of all in the region and beyond.

I reject the terrible attacks by Hamas on Israeli civilians, war crimes, but do not in turn justify policies of ethnic cleansing, and anti- human treatment. We must rise above and demand a ceasefire to end this horrible bloodshed before more lives are lost.

I therefore support the Resolution #1, Please focus on these crucial and inclusive commitments! Be It Resolved;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the City of Richmond takes seriously the entreaty of "Never Again," and that the historical memory of the Holocaust means fighting ethnic cleansing and apartheid everywhere;

and BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the City of Richmond vows to combat antisemitism and ethno-nationalism in all its forms;

and FINALLY, BE IT RESOLVED that the City of Richmond advocates for the dignity and safety of residents in every community, regardless of what crimes its leadership may commit, and that peaceful diplomacy is the only way to achieve this safety and dignity.

Shalom, Salaam,
Rita Barouch

From: [Salma Farukhi](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Support for resolution
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 6:58:39 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

I was not able to comment on the website

Thank you for supporting the people of Gaza who have been dehumanized by most leaders of the US and western world. You are standing with the likes of Nelson Mandela, Malcom X, Ghandi, and other great humanitarian leaders of the past.

I fully support this resolution and commend those responsible for its formation.

NOTICE OF CONFIDENTIALITY:

The information contained in this transmission is confidential and may be privileged and/or contain confidential health information that is legally protected from disclosure by state and federal law, including the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 and related regulations. This information is intended only for the use of the individual or organization to whom it is addressed. Use, disclosure, distribution or copying of documents transmitted to you in error is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately and destroy the original message and all copies.

From: [Sharon Decker](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Vote No on Anti-Israel Resolution (Item R-1)
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 8:57:19 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Richmond City Council Members,

I am a Richmond resident and writing in strong opposition to Tuesday's Resolution Item R-1 – an inflammatory and biased statement about the Israel-Hamas conflict. Not only does the resolution lack any factual basis, but it will also deeply exacerbate the trauma and vulnerability of the local Jewish community.

I believe we should be compassionate to all, and this resolution would most likely promote anti-semitism in our community. Our goal should be inclusiveness and to understand all.

Among its many glaring shortcomings, the proposed resolution fails to mention that this conflict started after Hamas terrorists murdered 1,400 innocent Israeli citizens and foreign nationals. In addition, the resolution text falsely accuses Israel of ethnic cleansing and collective punishment, while offensively referencing the Holocaust to condemn Israel's response to the Hamas attacks.

In the wake of the Hamas terrorist attacks our local Jewish community is feeling unsafe and scared, and this resolution's lack of empathy for Jews will only exacerbate the pain the community is feeling. Instead of sowing division, I am asking City Council to condemn all forms of hate and take steps to support all residents with loved ones in the region.

Sincerely,

Sharon Decker

Sent from my iPad

From: [Sharon Decker](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Vote No on Anti-Israel Resolution (Item R-1)
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 5:54:35 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Richmond City Council Members,

I sent an earlier email about this issue. I believe that the way this resolution is worded will be detrimental to the Jewish people in Richmond. I think it would better serve everyone if the wording was such that we are concerned about the Middle East Crisis and support the people of Gaza and of Israel. We would like there to be a resolution in which the people can come together and work for a solution that will bring an end to this futile war, and work towards a peace treaty.

Please do not vote Yes on this Anti-Israel Resolution as it is written. It will not help anyone and will only bring more hatred towards people.

Thank you.

Sharon Decker

Sent from my iPad

From: [Shawn Dunning](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comment RE: R.1 Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 12:26:13 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Richmond City Council,

Having worked closely with Palestinian and Israeli leaders since 2008 as a conflict resolution specialist, including living in East Jerusalem for over a year, I have deep ties and understanding to the people who live there, and my heart breaks for the unfolding tragedy in the Gaza region and beyond.

No statement by the Richmond, CA city council can possibly make a difference in the Middle East, but it could make a difference here in Richmond. A statement by your body could help unify Richmond around shared values.

Nevertheless, despite the best intentions that may have led to this item (R.1 Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza), the EFFECT is that a wedge is being driven into the very community you have been entrusted to serve.

Social media and mainstream media is currently being flooded with anecdotes of fear and perceived antisemitism due to text within the proposed resolution. There is no way to undo what is currently being perceived, but you can stop it from getting worse.

Please abstain from this item and get back to the job of taking care of Richmond.

Furthermore, if anyone has a genuine desire to bring people together from various perspectives in order to develop a common ground statement, I would gladly offer my support. Just let me know.

Respectfully,
Shawn Dunning
Richmond Resident
Former Global Director of Leadership & Training, Search for Common Ground

From: [Susan Wengraf](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Resolution R-1 10/24/2023 Agenda
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 11:41:24 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Richmond City Council Members,

I am a former teacher in the City of Richmond. I am writing to you today to request that you remove the proposed Resolution Item R-1 from your agenda.

As a teacher, it is clear to me that this Resolution displays a misunderstanding of the facts.... not only the history of Israel and Gaza, but also of the history of World War II.

The co opting of the word "Holocaust" and the phrase "Never again" is an insult to the 6 million Jews who were murdered at the hands of Hitler. Please remove these insulting and offensive references.

The proposed resolution is unbalanced: it fails to mention that this conflict was initiated by Hamas terrorists who, in a surprise attack, brutally tortured, raped and murdered 1,400 innocent Israeli babies, children, and elders in addition to many innocent foreign nationals and kidnapped 220 hostages.

I have nothing good to say about this war and I fear for the future of the entire Middle East.

As the leaders in your community your main job is to keep everyone safe. This proposed Resolution will result in more antagonism, more tension, and more insecurity for your residents. Our local Jewish community and Muslim communities are feeling unsafe and scared with antisemitism and Islamophobia reaching new heights.

Taking sides and pointing fingers will lead to nothing productive. This resolution's lack of empathy for Jews will only exacerbate the pain the community is feeling.

I am asking each of you, as members of the City Council, to vote to remove this Resolution from consideration and instead come forward with a resolution to condemn all forms of hate and take steps to support all residents with loved ones in the region who are suffering. At times like these, your leadership can make a difference.

Please do the best thing for your community and withdraw Resolution R-1.

Susan Wengraf

From: [TARNEL ABBOTT](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public comment Item# R1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 11:04:47 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Subject: Public Comment Item # R 1

Mayor Martinez, Council members McLaughlin, Bana, Jimenez, Robinson, Willis and Zepeda: I support the resolution and courage in standing strong for what is right in the face of vociferous opposition.

In the name of humanity we must do whatever we can to end the massacre of innocent civilians in Gaza: The call is for immediate ceasefire, end the bombing. Immediate and massive humanitarian aid, no ground invasion of Gaza.

Israel's relentless bombing and total blockade of Gaza is more than collective punishment: it is genocide. Silence in the face of genocide is complicity.

The Hamas attacks on Israeli civilians which left 1,300 (?) dead was horrific but does not justify the carpet bombing of Gaza by the Israeli military. The bombing of Schools, ambulances, churches, residences and yes, hospitals, has left 5,800 dead so far in Gaza, 2,000 of them children. This is not self-defense it is bloodlust revenge, it is slaughter. Telling millions of civilians to evacuate their indigenous land when there is no safe place for them to go or they will be considered enemy combatants and targeted as such is ethnic cleansing.

There is no fuel to power emergency generators to pump water. For lack of safe drinking water, cholera looms. The limited amount of humanitarian aid allowed into Gaza and its delay is a cynical attempt at diplomatic appeasement: 20 truckloads of aid a day is a drop in the sea for 2 plus million people who have had nothing but ceaseless bombardment.

It is obscene that President Biden considers "investing" in war something which will pay us a "dividend". The more our U.S. dollars are used to bomb the world, the less safe the world is, the less safe we are. The dividend of war is death and destruction for us all. The war in Gaza could very easily turn into a much wider regional war.

Now another \$105 BILLION in military spending is proposed, our tax money should instead be used to house the houseless, end hunger, fund health care, eliminate student loan debt instead it is making profits for the military industrial complex. All the wars are an attempt to distract us from our domestic problems. Our government's policy of global domination is putting the entire world at risk- One planet, one humanity: Co-existence or non-existence.

Tarnel Abbott
Richmond CA

From: [Tessa Rudnick](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Tessa Rudnick - Resolution R-1
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 7:48:24 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To the Richmond Mayor and City Council,

I am your West County colleague on the El Cerrito City Council, and have served with many of you on RecycleMore. I am coming to you in recognition of our shared humanity during a time of crisis.

I ask you to vote NO on R-1.

This language endangers the local Jewish community. I am the only Jewish municipal elected official in West Contra Costa County, and the language in the resolution does not promote peace. It only serves to create more harm.

When people say "ethnic cleansing" or "genocide" as descriptors, it perpetuates antisemitic tropes rooted in blood libel. A notion that Jewish people are blood-thirsty and want to kill Palestinians. I believe good and well-intentioned people use these descriptors to try to demonstrate their passion for the humanitarian treatment of Palestinians (as we ALL should), but it serves to dehumanize Jewish people around the world. This is why it's so dangerous, and why the Jewish community here in Richmond and West County feel so unsafe by this harmful resolution. Why you are most likely being flooded with public comment. Jewish people already know what happens when whole groups of people are dehumanized, and we do not want history to repeat itself. Another reason why the Jewish community is so united in this moment against Islamophobia. No more hate. This has to stop.

What is happening right now is: war. War is in itself a terrible word filled with much weight. However in this moment, war is the correct and accurate word to use. We can talk about the impacts of war and its extreme trauma, violence, loss of innocent life, and the corporate profiteering which comes from war.... but to say "ethnic cleansing" directly assigns a trope-filled blame, endangering your Jewish community members. Your neighbors. This is not OK.

I am a product of ethnic cleansing. My Grandpa's Mother, Father, and four younger siblings were killed at Auschwitz. These are not stories for me, it's my real life. I got 33 amazing years of Grandpa before he passed, and now I am the steward of his survival stories. I would not

wish ethnic cleansing or genocide on ANYONE. To appropriate my family's lived experience in order to weaponize it, feels acutely painful.

Every human is deserving of self-determination and dignity. Let peace start with us. Do not fan the flames of hate.

Either we uphold the equal worth of all humans, or we don't. Creating a false dichotomy of sides, then choosing a side, is morally wrong and politically self-defeating.

Here in West County, everyone should feel welcome. Period. When a minority community is screaming that this makes them feel unsafe, please listen.

Mayor Pro Tem Tessa Rudnick

Tessa Rudnick, MPA
Mayor Pro Tem - City of El Cerrito
10890 San Pablo Ave.
El Cerrito, CA 94530
(510) 215-4305
www.el-cerrito.org

From: [Theresa Russell](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comments Agenda Item # R-1
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 12:08:30 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

My name is Theresa Russell and I am a resident of Richmond.

I'm asking you to reject resolution R-1 on tonight's city council agenda. The resolution as proposed is not inclusive, and is causing fear among some of our residents. If you must have a resolution, I would ask that you introduce a resolution that condemns terrorism, mourns the death of innocent civilians in Israel and Gaza, and supports all residents impacted by the Israel-Hamas conflict, as I understand Councilmember Zepeda is working on.

It is very disturbing that in a post on Facebook by Asian Pacific Environmental Network (@apen4aj on IG), they talk about how huge Resolution R-1 is for Richmond because we would be the first city in the country to pass a resolution like this. Reading their post, it seems to me like the City Council members that wrote the resolution are using the tragic situation in Palestine and Israel to politically gain from it, because they would be credited as the ones who wrote the first resolution like this in the United States. This is so wrong. Our city council members should not be trying to use this tragedy thousands of miles away from Richmond to advance politically.

Additionally, residents of Richmond should not take the blame or face negative impacts for events taking place thousands of miles away. Richmond has more than enough going on locally, and does not need to be involved in international affairs. This will take much-needed time away from matters pertaining to Richmond.

I urge you to vote "No" on this resolution, or to consider an alternative resolution that is inclusive, and does not divide our community.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Theresa Russell

From: [Vered Cohen](#)
To: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public comments agenda item R-1. Vote No on Anti-Israel Resolution (Item R-1)
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 9:55:44 AM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Richmond City Council Members,

I am a Richmond resident and writing in strong opposition to Tuesday's Resolution Item R-1 – an inflammatory and biased statement about the Israel-Hamas conflict. Not only does the resolution lack any factual basis, but it will also deeply exacerbate the trauma and vulnerability of the local Jewish community.

Among its many glaring shortcomings, the proposed resolution fails to mention that this conflict started after Hamas terrorists murdered 1,400 innocent Israeli citizens and foreign nationals. In addition, the resolution text falsely accuses Israel of ethnic cleansing and collective punishment, while offensively referencing the Holocaust to condemn Israel's response to the Hamas attacks.

In the wake of the Hamas terrorist attacks our local Jewish community is feeling unsafe and scared, and this resolution's lack of empathy for Jews will only exacerbate the pain the community is feeling. Instead of sowing division, I am asking City Council to condemn all forms of hate and take steps to support all residents with loved ones in the region.

Vered Cohen

From: [Jim Hanson](#)
To: [Eduardo Martinez](#); [Soheila Bana](#); [Claudia Jimenez](#); [Gayle McLaughlin](#); [Doria Robinson](#); [Melvin Willis](#); [Cesar Zepeda](#)
Cc: [City Clerk Dept User](#)
Subject: Public Comments_Item R.2 - Public Safety in emergencies funding
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 2:12:54 PM

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

This email originated from outside of the City's email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Mayor Martinez and Members of the Council,

As a resident who promotes emergency preparedness education in east Richmond and participates in our region's wildfire risk response policies, both as an advocate for natural areas and our diverse and valuable native flora, and as a homeowner, I'm requesting that the Council include the following elements in any follow up to Item R.2:

SUMMARY REQUEST:

- Earthquakes, potential industrial accidents, and wildfire risk prevention and response each get attention; fill an emergency services coordinator position to address each of these potential threats, increase CERT budget, and address neighborhood ham radio connection and overall communications capabilities in an emergency.
- For wildfire risk prevention and response, maintain a comprehensive (or three-legged stool) approach: 1) home hardening and defensible space "from the house out" 2) building communications, alerts, and evacuation capability, and 3) and ecologically-based vegetation management.
- Include a staff or standing consulting position in ecologically-sound vegetation management to work with fire personnel for maximum wildfire risk prevention and natural area conservation outcomes.

DISCUSSION:

I appreciate the keen interest in developing Richmond's response to earthquake, wildfire, and industrial emergencies for all of Richmond's residents. The inevitable next earthquake(s), potential industrial accidents, and wildfire risk prevention and response affect the entire city population.

In that regard I'm requesting that the Council emphasize *all three issues equally*, starting by filling the citywide Emergency Services Coordinator with a policy mandate to work on these three high, and often overlapping, priorities. Additional staff support, as recommended by proposed WUI staff position, could be beneficial, but I believe another staff person needs to address all these threats, especially since development of evacuation, communications, alerts and public education programs overlap. Also, since we know that neighborhoods must be prepared as the first response in an emergency, I recommend increasing the CERT budget to make it easier and rewarding to participate in neighborhood emergency response training, to

connect via radio to a city emergency center, and to assure overall emergency responder capabilities.

With regard to *wildfire risk prevention and response*, the one core principle I've discovered is that a comprehensive, or a three-legged stool, approach works best - 1) home hardening/defensible space, 2) communications/alert/evacuation planning, and 3) ecologically-based vegetation management.

Without one of the legs, the program falls down, sometimes tragically. From the work you've both done in this area, the fire service has also stressed making a home more wildfire resilient by closing gaps where embers can enter a structure. One of the recommended measures - significantly lowering, reducing, or removing vegetation around the first 5' around homes in the WUI - is a difficult change that will take time. With this in mind, the request is that Council policy support wildfire prevention "from the house out" with home hardening and defensible space, equally build communications, alerts, and evacuation capabilities (for all three major threats), and align with what other communities are smartly-calling "ecologically-based vegetation management."

In regard to *vegetation treatment*, what I've found, and am seeing locally, is that involving people trained in ecological land management as co-partners with fire suppression professionals results in a treatment program with the highest return and results long term. The unique vegetation fuel load on a site is reduced in a way that conserves the site's natural beauty, plant diversity, and wildlife, avian, and pollinator habitat. Both science and post-project monitoring indicate that overly-severe removal of intact native plant communities often leads to colonization by invasive weeds, many of which can result in a long-term and expensive removal or liability costs due to their high flammability.

From experience working in natural lands management, and in my current role as volunteer Conservation Chair for the East Bay Chapter of the California Native Plant Society, I've seen how ecologically-based vegetation treatment principles have begun to make headway with other local agencies with wildfire prevention plans and ordinances who are currently implementing wildfire risk reduction strategies. For this reason, I recommend that one high priority element in an expanded public emergency safety budget is to do as others have and include a *staff position or standing consulting contract* skilled in ecologically-sound vegetation management to assist fire professionals.

Thank you Council member Bana and Council member Zepeda for bringing this proposal to the Council, and for the Council's keen interest and work on this important matter. I'm requesting that these recommendations be represented in any Council follow up action on public emergency safety programming and funding.

Sincerely,

Jim Hanson
Richmond



Portal



Search...



Meeting Date	Agenda Item	Name	Email	Comment	Position	Status
<input type="checkbox"/> City Council						
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Juli Lasselle	jclasselle@me.com	I'm deeply disturbed by this proposed resolution. In a time when antisemitism is on the rise around the world, and Hamas' recent attack on Israel was the worst attack on the Jewish people since the Holocaust, your proposed resolution is incredibly irresponsible. Nowhere in the proposed resolution do you condemn the terrorist organization of Hamas nor make a clear distinction between Hamas and the Palestinian people. Instead, you have added fuel to the fire of antisemitism, jeopardizing the lives and well-being of your	Against	Appro

Jewish constituents and their children. Your proposed resolution does nothing for the Palestinian people but does erode American democracy and decency. Since Yale historian and fascism expert Timothy Snyder points to antisemitism as a stepping stone to fascism, your proposed resolution puts you personally and the city of Richmond in the same corner as an antisemitic terrorist organization and rising fascism. This proposed resolution is divisive, antisemitic, and quite frankly, not the business of the city of Richmond. Stick to helping ALL of your constituents, to helping the Richmond improve and grow, rather

than wasting time and energy sowing seeds of hatred. Those who remember the Holocaust often say "never forget". I will never forget who brought this resolution forward. Shame on you.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Heather Green	This resolution contains untruths and partial truths that ignore the catalyzing act of terror carried out by Hamas on Israelis and unnecessarily trivialize the suffering of the Jewish people in this moment. It is not true that no aid is being admitted into Gaza. The characterization of Israel's military action as ethnic cleansing is highly disputed and ignores the stronghold that Hamas has built in Gaza. Hamas controls the government in Gaza; they are the	Against	Appro
--------------------	--	---------------	---	---------	-------

state. And, Hamas is committed to eradicating Jews. Hamas' covenant includes this language setting out Jews as the enemy: "Our struggle against the Jews is very great and very serious. It needs all sincere efforts...The Movement is but one squadron that should be supported by more and more squadrons from this vast Arab and Islamic world, until the enemy is vanquished." International law allows for armed force in cases of aggression like the horrific terrorist attacks by Hamas on October 7. To ignore this context subverts the resolution's stated aim to fight antisemitism. If terrorism is an acceptable tool of resistance in

political arenas as this resolution seems to state, I am afraid for our shared future. I pray every minute for lasting peace, that the people of Israel and Palestine can learn to tolerate and trust and respect each other. This resolution will only push us further apart.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Sigalle Michael	sigalle@gmail.com	Dear Council, I understand the need for taking a stand on the horrors of the Israel-Hamas war; however, I urge you to take an inclusive and peaceful approach. As it stands now, the resolution for consideration is divisive and ignores the instigator of the war. The attack on Israeli civilians on October 7th and the holding of over 200 hostages, including babies and children, is	Against	Appro
--------------------	--	-----------------	-------------------	---	---------	-------

heartbreaking to any decent human. To ignore this fact and sway the resolution to a single side demonstrates that the Council cares about certain people sometimes, and ignores others. Especially now when Islamophobia and Antisemitism is skyrocketing around the world and especially in the US, is the time to show compassion for ALL those suffering. Jewish communities are feeling unsafe, scared, and alone - please make an effort to showcase unity and empathy for all.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM

Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza

michael sholinbeck

I agree that the situation in Gaza is terrible, and Israel's actions are untenable. However, I also believe that having this resolution, without

No Position

Appro

mentioning the attack by Hamas on October 7, minimizes our valuing of Jewish and Israeli lives. In 2001, we could condemn the US response to 9/11, and yet also state unequivocally that what Al Qaeda did was wrong. Is this not a similar situation? Can we also declare our desire for a cease-fire here too? Thank you.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Daryl Henline	daryl.henline@gmail.com	I'm writing to voice my vehement opposition to the City Council's proposed resolution; Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza. Not only do I feel that it is a slight to the citizens of Richmond to have the precious time of our representatives occupied in global	Against	Appro
--------------------	--	---------------	-------------------------	--	---------	-------

politics, but more troubling, I believe that a resolution stating support for the Palestinians in Gaza without stridently condemning the Hamas attacks and reiterating support for Israel signals acceptance of the growing tide of antisemitism that has been given voice in recent years. The actions of Hamas terrorists, the elected government of Gaza, were unprovoked and savage, and were committed against civilians; women, children and the aged alike. The rocketing of Israel from Gaza, the West Bank and Lebanon continues. I believe that those who express solidarity with Hamas and the Palestinians without vehemently and

unequivocally denouncing the barbaric attacks— and without affirming the right of the Jewish people to live in peace and security — have aligned themselves with those who would destroy Israel and Jews wherever they may be. The Jewish people have survived genocide within living memory. They have not forgotten, and must never again cower defenseless against their enemies.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	David M	davidpmarias@gmail.com	I agree that the treatment of Palestinians is terrible. However, demonizing Israel and placing sole blame for their stateless and disenfranchised position is bluntly wrong, immoral, and accurate. The resolution claims Israel is an apartheid when it	Against	Appro
--------------------	--	---------	------------------------	--	---------	-------

is the only democracy in the middle east that guarantees safety and freedom for all citizens, regardless of their race, religion, sexual orientation ethnicity, national origin, or other factors. Additionally, Israel unilaterally left Gaza in 2006, forcibly relocating all Israelis and Jews from the area in a good faith effort to give the Palestinian people more space and land to develop an independent Palestinian country. This move has been met with rocket fire and terrorism, most recently Hamas murdering over 1400 civilians and kidnapping over 200 people into Gaza. Hamas, the US designated terror organization that is the governing body for

Gaza, also uses resources from the international community to build and fire rockets at Israel. Since October 7, 2023, they have fired over 6000 of them targeting Israeli civilians indiscriminately. I, like all sane and rational humans, want to see an independent Palestinian state existing and thriving alongside a Jewish Democratic State of Israel. However, resolutions like this which demonize Israel, place all blame for the conditions on Israel, and blame Israel for Hamas's terrorism against her WITHOUT even acknowledging that Hamas currently holds over 200 hostages and is still firing rockets at Israel (it seems they've run out of everything in Gaza

except rockets), is beyond tone deaf. I expect better from my fellow californians and people who claim to be supporting the oppressed. supporting this resolution is buying into propaganda from a recognized terror organization that is the true enemy of the palestinian people.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Lea C	In the wake of a massive terrorist attack on innocent Israelis and foreigners, this resolution is disgusting and insulting. Why are you not proposing a resolution to stand against terrorism and stand by Israel's right to existence and self-defense? This resolution will encourage anti-semitism and make Richmond's Jewish residents feel even more unsafe, as we have	Against	Appro
--------------------	--	-------	--	---------	-------

already seen anti-semitic attacks increase in the Bay Area in response to statements such as those in your misguided, harmful resolution. If you want to promote peace and unity in the Middle East, passing resolutions such as this one are harmful to everyone.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Alyssa Gill	aggooseag@gmail.com	Thank you City of Richmond for acknowledging the need for liberation in Palestine. I see so many comments against this resolution- but US aid for the Israeli Military is funding the ethnic cleansing of the Palestinian people. This is unjustified on all accounts. I mourn the people who died in the attacks by Hamas, but I also mourn the continuously rising numbers of Palestinian people killed as a result of	For	Appro
--------------------	--	-------------	---------------------	--	-----	-------

Israel's retaliation. I do not want my taxes to support the military. I want to support my community, including standing with my Palestinian neighbors in the US and in Gaza. You have a chance to stand for the liberation of all people. I hope you take it.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM

Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza

Maya

I am disappointed by the one sidedness of this . This war started with Hamas butchering hundreds of innocent babies , children , women and men and destroying everything in their path. The retaliation is to that . And that is hard to measure as there are so much destruction to both sides. I think it would be best to leave these topics to the people of the region . If you wanted to help -

Against

Appro

make a donation to both relief for both people who are suffering right now

10/24/2023 4:30 PM

Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza

Mike Swanson

I strongly oppose this very one-sided approach to an incredibly complex situation across the globe. On October 7, Hamas leadership sent over 1,000 armed terrorists into Israeli villages and a music festival with the goal of butchering, maiming, burning, pillaging, and kidnapping as many innocent civilians as possible. They took over 200 hostages and killed over 1,300 people. Where is the resolution condemning that? If the city is passing this resolution without making any references to that, or for the right of Israeli civilians to live in peace, then it is

Against

Appro

clear how blatantly one-sided the City stands. It is shameful that the city is not denouncing terrorism. In addition, the resolution has points that are not factual at all. There was never " an ethnic cleansing campaign by explicitly requiring two million Palestinians to leave Gaza immediately or risk being bombed in their homes by the Israeli army." In fact, the Israeli military did announce that it would be striking Hamas strategic targets in northern Gaza and gave civilians a choice to leave in 24 hours if they did not want to get caught in the crossfire -- an option that the Hamas terrorists never gave to the civilians it killed. Check your facts.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Lee Porter	To the City of Richmond- Yes, I support peace for Palestinians and Israelis. That is why I call on you to denounce Hamas, a terrorist organization that preys on the disenfranchised and hunts the innocent. A terrorist organization that proudly claims responsibility for the ongoing murders of Jewish people across the globe, and actively condemns peace agreements in favor of jihad and kidnapping. As a city in the Bay Area, within a region that prides itself on informed and actionable justice, do better in representing your citizens and our collective values. It is inflammatory and dangerous to refer to domestic defense as "ethnic cleaning". The	Against	Appro
--------------------	--	------------	---	---------	-------

representatives of the city of Richmond should know how important it is to seriously consider the impact of these terms as we stand to repair right relation with our First People. We want the world to know that we support accurate representation of our values and desire skillful governance in our most troubling times. Dismiss this hasty, careless, reactive resolution for what it is; a short-sighted and inflammatory collection of sound bytes in the face of a painful conflict, reflecting thousands of years of history outside the American lens of experience.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the	Ethan Pearson	ethanp123@yahoo.com	I stand with Israel! I refuse to stand with terrorists and people with revisionist history. The Jews own	Against	Appro
--------------------	---	---------------	---------------------	--	---------	-------

Palestinian People
of Gaza

Israel and thank
God they do!

10/24/2023 4:30
PM

Resolution
Affirming
Richmond's
Support and
Solidarity with the
Palestinian People
of Gaza

Rose F

No human being should live in fear of their life. NO HUMAN BEING. Your resolution does not mention once the terrorist organization that was democratically voted to govern Gaza, The international (specifically UN) complacency to rid Gaza of Hamas, nor the 220 hostages (of various nationalities) currently being held captive in Gaza by Hamas. You accuse Israel of collective punishment of a people who call for the end of Israel. You accuse Israel of withholding resources which are used to create bombs. Where is the cry and anger towards the international community to hold Hamas

Against

Appro

accountable?!? Oh, there isn't any, because they are terrorists!! So what should Israel do? Allow terrorists access to further kill their innocent citizens? My heart breaks for the innocent lives that are lost on both sides of the border. I cry every single day for EVERY innocent life lost. Instead of this superficial document, act! Get rid of Hamas! Help the Palestinian people establish a country of their own with a government that does not call for the demise of Israel. Israel will not cease to exist. War will continue as long as her neighbors do not accept her existence and continue to call for the death of innocent Israelis. Lastly, you mention the

Holocaust. As the granddaughter of a survivor of Auschwitz, I vowed Never Again. And today we see the world turning against us. We see the city of Richmond turning against the Jewish people. We live here too. Our lives matter too. Our right to a homeland that is internationally recognized matters and is valid just as the United States is valid. You are turning your backs on us, just as my grandmother's neighbors did to her in 1944 and you should be ashamed.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM

Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza

Rachel

● On October 7, Hamas terrorists invaded Israel, slaughtering hundreds of young people attending a music festival, murdering entire families, raping countless women, beheading Israeli

Against

Appro

soldiers, and killing children. • In addition to spilling the blood of innocent Israeli civilians, Hamas kidnapped approximately 200 people, some American citizens. These victims also include Jewish children and babies. • Rape is not resistance. Murdering children is not resistance. Hamas's actions cannot be justified as a legitimate response to the Israeli and Egyptian blockade of the Gaza Strip. • Israel disengaged from Gaza in 2005 to give Palestinians an opportunity to build a state, but Hamas, a terrorist organization, has been governing them. Israel knew the evil Hamas was capable of, but even so, it gave Gaza clean water, electricity, food, and humanitarian

aid. • The Israeli & Egypt blockaded Gaza in response to Hamas's brutality. In recent years, Egypt has kept its shared borders with Gaza strictly controlled over the years and today refuses to open the borders for Gazan civilians fleeing Gaza City. • Israel has an obligation to rescue the 200 hostages that were taken to the Gaza Strip by Hamas. Israel cannot stand by and make no effort to rescue the men, women, children, and babies taken captive. According to President Biden, these hostages also include American citizens. • Israel will go to great lengths to return the hostages to their families, but also to great lengths to avoid harming Palestinian civilians

in the Gaza Strip by warning them to evacuate to Southern Gaza. These warnings inadvertently warn Hamas operatives and harm Israel's efforts This resolution places sole blame on Israel for the actions of a terrorist organization that attacked Israeli civilians. This is victim blaming and appalling

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Savitri K Khalsa	savitrikaurkhalsa@gmail.com	I oppose this resolution. I do not believe it represents the opinions of Richmond residents and is not focused on the City of Richmond's management. Please table this item.	Against	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Shawn Dunning	shawn@dunningforrichmond.com	Having worked closely with Palestinian and Israeli leaders since 2008 as a conflict resolution specialist, including	Against	Appro

living in East Jerusalem for over a year, I have deep ties and understanding to the people who live there, and my heart breaks for the unfolding tragedy in the Gaza region and beyond. No statement by the Richmond, CA city council can possibly make a difference in the Middle East, but it could make a difference here in Richmond. A statement by your body could help unify Richmond around shared values. Nevertheless, despite the best intentions that may have led to this item (R.1 Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza), the EFFECT is that a wedge is being

driven into the very community you have been entrusted to serve. Social media and mainstream media is currently being flooded with anecdotes of fear and perceived antisemitism due to text within the proposed resolution. There is no way to undo what is currently being perceived, but you can stop it from getting worse. Please abstain from this item and get back to the job of taking care of Richmond. Furthermore, if anyone has a genuine desire to bring people together from various perspectives in order to develop a common ground statement, I would gladly offer my support. Just let me know.
Respectfully,
Shawn Dunning

Richmond Resident
Former Global
Director of
Leadership &
Training, Search
for Common
Ground

10/24/2023 4:30
PM

Resolution
Affirming
Richmond's
Support and
Solidarity with the
Palestinian People
of Gaza

Harvey Cohen

The Council is
wrong in proposing
this action as it is
one-sided and
does not mention
the atrocities
perpetrated by
 Hamas on
innocent Israelis,
with the intention
of killing them and
taking them
hostage. The death
of Gaza
Palestinians is not
due to a desire to
kill them, but due
to the fact that
 Hamas terrorists
insert themselves
and their arms in
civilian areas.
There is no moral
equivalence
between atrocious
terrorism and an
attempt to punish
the terrorists.

Against

Appro

10/24/2023 4:30
PM

Resolution
Affirming
Richmond's

Anonymous

I would not like to
list my position as
"Against" as that

No Position

Appro

Support and
Solidarity with the
Palestinian People
of Gaza

would make it look like I am against declaring support for the Palestinian people, but that is not the message I wish to convey. In fact I and many Jews like myself care deeply for the Palestinian people. Our shared history in this conflict fueled by our leaders deserves the attention it always gets. However, I have many issues with the way this resolution is written and feel that it has been specifically designed to leave out key information which when omitted paints a one sided picture of an extremely nuanced conflict. To start off, this resolution makes no mention of the brutal attack on Oct 7 in which Hamas, a known terrorist organization and

democratically
elected
“government” of
Gaza, invaded
Israel and
indiscriminately
slaughtered 1400
people, including
260 at a music
festival as well as
many others in
their homes as
 Hamas went to
various towns and
villages, raping and
murdering along
the way. It also fails
to mention the
over 200 hostages
of many
nationalities that
were abducted and
taken into Gaza. If
you know the
history of this
conflict as well as I
do, there is only
one cause for this
attack and it has
nothing to do with
wanting safety and
security for the
Palestinian people.
 Hamas was
founded with a
stated purpose to
eliminated the
State of Israel, and
all Jews with it, and

this event is just another example of how they are willing to accomplish their goals. On top of this omission, the resolution goes on to place blame for the conditions of Gaza solely on the Israeli government, and does not acknowledge the millions of dollars that we and other countries provide to Gaza which ultimately ends up in the hands of Hamas to be used for rockets which they launch towards Israeli civilians, rather than for humanitarian purposes to help their own people. Even now while they claim to have no food, water, and electricity in Gaza, Hamas has continually launched rockets from civilian outposts such as hospitals and

schools, which in itself is a war crime of using human shields. And to top it all off, this resolution has decided to co-opt language such as "Never Again" to describe what the author claims is happening in Gaza, where the Israeli government has placed a blockade due to a long history of invasions, suicide bombings, and more indiscriminate civilian murdering. And even during this blockade, they have provided water and electricity to the people of Gaza, a people who largely cheered on the Oct 7 slaughter, not because they have to, but because they care a lot more for the Palestinian people than even their own leadership

does. By not acknowledging the history as to why these conditions exist in the first place, the author is only furthering the lies that Israel is somehow the only one to blame in this conflict, and using our language is just a means of minimizing what happened to the Jewish people not even 100 years ago. I'll end with one final remark, as the resolution claims at the end that the aim is to combat ethno-nationalism in all its forms, however this resolution only seems concerned with the Jewish one, and not that of the countless others in existence, many of whom are committing atrocities far worse than anything Israel has ever done. It's time for an end to the narrative that

Israel and the Jewish people are responsible for everything bad happening in the world, and instead take a look at the broader picture and see how all sides have contributed to the situation we have today.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM

Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza

Nate L

landry.nathaniel@gmail.com

I urge the city council to pass this resolution. Anti-Zionism is not anti-Semitism. Criticism of Israel and its settler-colonial project is not anti-Semitic. If anything, the conflation of Jewish people worldwide, and of Judaism, with the state of Israel is anti-Semitic. I stand with antizionist Jews in Richmond and across the Bay Area in support of Resolution R-1, and echo the resolution's call for an end to the collective punishment of the

For

Appro

people of Gaza and to Israel's ethnic cleansing campaign against the Palestinian people. Moreover, our tax dollars enable Israeli apartheid and the collective punishment of Gazans. Both the 17 year blockade of Gaza, whose devastating effects are outlined in Resolution R-1, and the current siege, would not be possible without the billions of dollars in military and economic aid the federal government sends Israel every year. This is money freed up by years' worth of divestment from American communities like those the Richmond City Council represents, money that should instead go to meeting the urgent needs of those

communities. Elected officials at every level of American society - including the Richmond City Council - have a responsibility to stand in solidarity with the people of Gaza and to stand against Israel's brutal repression of the Palestinian people and the US aid that enables it. Richmond has the opportunity to become the first city in the country to pass a resolution supporting the people of Gaza and the right of all people to safety, dignity, . I urge the council to make history, and to stand on the right side of it, by passing Resolution R-1 and offering a model for cities across the US to follow.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM

Resolution Affirming Richmond's

Matthew Lewis

As a Jew - and more importantly, as a fellow human

For

Appro

Support and
Solidarity with the
Palestinian People
of Gaza

being - I urge you
to PASS this
resolution
UNAMENDED.
Israe is currently
engaging in ethnic
cleansing and
indiscriminately
bombing
Palestinian
civilians. The
President of Israel
has literally said
that all Gazans are
guilty and
deserved to be
bombed, and
Israel's official
twitter account is
explicitly attacking
the idea that killing
civilians constitutes
war crimes. What
more proof do you
need that this is
ethnic cleansing
and war crimes.
Stand up for
human rights -
PASS this
resolution
UNAMENDED. In
passing this
resolution
unamended, the
Richmond City
Council will be in
good company. For
example,

approximately two years ago Berkeley's elected Rent Board UNANIMOUSLY passed a resolution condemning Israel's ethnic cleansing of Palestinians. The Richmond City Council should join the Berkeley Rent Board and the greater community in standing up for human rights and against ethnic cleaning. PASS THE RESOLUTION AS WRITTEN.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM

Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza

Lauren Schiffman

crackmagazine@hotmail.com

I urge you to vote no on Item R-1. You are issuing this resolution at a time of great geopolitical strife in Israel/Gaza, yet you never define Hamas or mention the goal of Hamas (per the Hamas Charter) to eliminate Israel. You do not mention the Hamas attack of October 7, in which

Against

Appro

Hamas militants massacred more than 1,400 Israeli citizens, including children, women, and elders. You do not mention that Hamas currently holds more than 200 hostages, including Israeli civilians—even children--and citizens of other nations. I agree with the point that the people of Gaza have been mistreated for decades and are currently suffering a tragedy. I hope for a ceasefire, for Gazan civilians to get the aid they need, and for a solution leading to peace in the region-- because the people of Gaza and the people of Israel deserve to live in peace. I wonder why in your resolution you talk about the people and population of Gaza but only about the

state of Israel. Just as the brutal Hamas attack doesn't reflect the hearts of all Gazan people, the actions of the current right-wing Israeli government don't reflect all the people of Israel. That is evident by the hundreds of thousands of Israelis who were protesting the current government before the Hamas attack earlier this month. If you hope for a speedy resolution to this current conflict and for peace in the region, as I do, I hope you'll vote no on Item R-1. If you feel that you need to register your thoughts on this issue, I urge you to author a resolution offering sympathy for both innocent Palestinians and innocent Israelis, perhaps engaging local Palestinian

and Jewish leaders to help draft a more inclusive message.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	HALLIE FRIEDMAN	hallief@yahoo.com	This resolution is ill advised and filled with falsehoods. The city has so much work that it needs to do that this is a distraction. I am a 35 yr resident of Richmond and member of Temple Beth Hillel, i have lost family of family in the recent attack by Hamas on Israel (including 2 young children who were murdered with their mother). Please consider that you are not actually representing the wishes of the people you represent. VOTE NO	Against	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Carl Nelson	cpanelson@gmail.com	I am against the resolution that appears in Item R-1 of the Agenda for tonight's meeting for the reasons set forth in my 11:41	Against	Appro

e-mail sent to Council Members today. As I stated in small part, "If the Council feels a need to adopt a resolution, " Council Members were elected to solve local problems and thereby improve the lives of Richmond residents, not to dabble in international affairs. They certainly were not elected to incite violence against Richmond residents based on their ethnicity or religious background. I agree with Sara Cleveland that it should address the pain and distress of both Jews and Palestinians, condemn all forms of terrorism, mourn the death of innocent civilians in Israel and Gaza, and express its support

				for all residents impacted by the Israel-Hamas conflict." I also reference the correspondence sent by Rabbi Dean Kertesz, Larry Fox & Sara Cleveland.		
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Linda Rose	linda@sandy-dog.com	the resolution is very one-sided, promoting dissonance rather than peace and working together.	Against	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Larry Fox	larrydafox@gmail.com	As a lifetime resident of Richmond, I am appalled by the language and sentiments in your Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza. On the surface, this all sounds well and good, but rather misplaced given the plethora of issues that the City of Richmond currently faces. The same time and	Against	Appro

resources should be applied to issues within our city and its citizens. Take your pick there are hundreds of them. With that obvious notion mentioned, I will address one of the most egregious statements in the resolution. The one I take the greatest exception to is the statement that "Israel is now engaged in an ethnic cleansing campaign by explicitly requiring two million Palestinians to leave Gaza immediately or risk being bombed in their homes by the Israeli army." While that may have been defined in the line above that does not make it true. Ethnic Cleansing is a highly inaccurate depiction. While I do believe it may be an overreaction to a vicious attack,

the kidnapping and killing of civilians (many children) - it is not ethnic cleansing. Israel, unlike Hamas, did give Palestinians a warning and time to leave to minimize casualties. That is not an act of Ethnic Cleansing or genocide. However, Hamas' manifesto does call for the destruction of Israel, which seems a lot closer to genocide to me. There are so many ways this resolution could have been positive - calling for calm and peaceful ways to address this "war." and support both peoples. Instead, statements were made that were inflammatory and could only heighten tensions in our Richmond community, essentially giving antisemites the

excuse to attack the Jews in our community. This is dangerous and condones poor behavior at the very least, if not indicating that violence is okay against members of our community. That is not the Richmond I know and not one that I want to be a part of. My Community, that of the good people of Richmond, which the Jewish community is a vital part of, stands with its brothers and sisters for its call for peace and dignity of all people here and around the world. Demonizing does not help anyone, especially when it is not accurate. I believe that Council Member Zepeda has alternative language for the Resolution, that would be far more

				appropriate for our city. Do not pass this resolution as it stands. It only invites hate and provides nothing positive for anyone who needs it.		
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Michelle Husby	michelle.husby@gmail.com	The whereas's in this resolution are ridiculously one-sided and antisemitic. Why not pass a resolution for peace instead?	Against	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	JANE DURANGO	jane_durango@hotmail.com	The City of Richmond should not pass this vile, antisemitic resolution. The City Council should be in favor of peace. This resolution should be defeated.	Against	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Mitra Z		I am for Richmond City Council to PASS R.1 and stand in solidarity with the Palestinian people. International solidarity is, above all, a key component of what makes a city	For	Appro

vital to live in-- it represents a community that is unwavering. More than ever in the midst of Western media propaganda, we need cities in the U.S. to take a stand against ethnic cleansing, especially if the U.S. plays a large role in supporting Israel. Above all and what must be repeated over and over again, anti-zionism is fundamentally not anti-semitism! I respect that this resolution is committed to combatting both zionism and anti-semitism. As a Bay Area resident, this resolution must pass!

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Alan Marks	alanbmarks1920@gmail.com	Divisive and one sided. Stick to local issues.	Against	Appro
--------------------	--	------------	--------------------------	--	---------	-------

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Sarah K		Please pass this resolution and stop genocide happening right before our eyes!! End the occupation!	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Jane Kemp	jckemp5674@gmail.com	One-sided and hateful. A waste of Richmond taxpayers money, especially when there are so many other worthy issues here in Richmond that need attention.	Against	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Anna Stein		This resolution does not promote peace, it does nothing to benefit the Palestinian people. This resolution promotes divisiveness and hatred. This is not the way to fight terror and war.	Against	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Susanna		Resolution R-1 is divisive, biased, imbalanced, spreads falsehoods and misinformation, and speaks	Against	Appro

volumes in its glaring omission of any acknowledgment that Hamas, in a vicious act of terrorism, initiated this unspeakable violence and murdered over 1400 innocent Israelis and others (including many Americans), and inflicted trauma on millions. This one-sided resolution amounts to an approval of those acts of terrorism against Jews and Hamas' determination to eradicate Israel and the Jewish people (which you should, but do not, recognize as a real example of a pure motive of "ethnic cleansing"); and reflects a barely disguised antisemitism that will prove very hurtful in our own community, while doing absolutely nothing to relieve

the suffering of innocent Palestinians. Attend to your business home, and vote NO on R-1 if you care about justice and the wellbeing of your own community here in Richmond.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Anonymous	Honored City Council members, thank you for introducing this Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza. The people of Gaza are suffering a humanitarian catastrophe and are at risk of ethnic cleansing. This resolution from the City of Richmond sends an important message that Palestinians, just like Israeli Jewish people, are suffering enormous losses in this conflict. I extend my deepest	For	Appro
--------------------	--	-----------	--	-----	-------

sympathies to the many losses of Jewish people in Israel and the same I extend the same sympathies to Palestinians who are also suffering staggering losses. I would like to express my strong support with the resolution and urge you to vote in its favor.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Luke Pickrell	lukepickrell@yahoo.com	As a Richmond resident, I know this city stands for rights and freedoms for all people. By passing this resolution, we affirm our belief that all people have the right to a good life. We stand against oppression and for the power of the people.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Andy McCoy	awbmccoy@gmail.com	I am strongly in favor of this resolution. The resolution recognizes the inhumanity of the ongoing, collective punishment of civilians in Gaza	For	Appro

whose only crime is living in what many international human rights organizations refer to as the world's largest open-air prison. Even relatively small actions like this one can reverberate beyond the confines of this City Council Meeting and beyond Richmond, and can help build the movements and consensus needed to finally bring this war to a halt.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM

Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza

Lila S

Thank you for being on the right side of history. The bravery in making this statement makes me proud to be a Richmond resident. The Palestinian people have been deprived of dignity, the right to sovereignty, and self-determination for too long. As JFK said, "Those who

For

Appro

make peaceful revolution impossible will make violent revolution inevitable." The loss of life, both Israeli and Palestinian, is completely unacceptable and we must move forward with a cease-fire and a peaceful addressing of Palestinian rights and needs PEACEFULLY.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM

Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza

Theresa Bostic

I'm for this resolution as it is the first one I've seen brought by a city to outright affirm Palestinians and Pro-Palestine supporters as well as validate the harm and atrocities committed by the Israeli government and military onto the Palestinian people. I also appreciate that the resolution "vows to combat antisemitism" as it

For

Appro

demonstrates support and solidarity with Jewish people.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM

Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza

Anne M

amferruzzi@gmail.com

I'm a public K-12 educator living in Richmond and commend you for considering this resolution in support of the Palestinian people. This is a brave and necessary act of solidarity. As an educator and Filipina American who has experienced the generational harms of colonialism, I can't stand to see one more child die as a result of this ethnic cleansing campaign, and of those who do survive, to imagine the physical and psychological torment they will undergo over the course of their lives, and for generations. There is no excuse not to do everything we can to put a stop to

For

Appro

the ethnic cleansing and subjugation of the people in Palestine immediately, and there is no excuse to not pass this resolution and stand in solidarity with them. This will also serve as a statement of support to our own residents who have experienced and continue to experience the harms of colonialism, oppression, and subjugation, and serve as a model and inspiration for other cities to do the same. I stand with you in pride and purpose in passing this resolution.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM

Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza

David Zimring

I urge the council to vote against this resolution. It only refers to one side of a tense situation and our community needs to seek balance and support. This resolution will not

Against

Appro

				accomplish that and could instead divide our community.		
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Mark L.		Most of us want peace. We realize this is a tragic situation, but it is not solely caused by Israel as clearly demonstrated by the Hamas attack. This resolution is one-sided and will lead to increased divisiveness and antisemitism in the city of Richmond.	Against	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Elizabeth Ibarra	elyibarra1@gmail.com	The Palestinian people have face unimaginable hardships and oppression for decades, I support standing in solidarity with the Palestinian people.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Danielle Kerr	danielle17dk@gmail.com	No human being should live in fear of their life. Your resolution does not mention once the terrorist organization that was democratically voted to govern Gaza, The	Against	Appro

international
(specifically UN)
complacency to rid
Gaza of Hamas,
nor the 220
hostages (of
various
nationalities)
currently being
held captive in
Gaza by Hamas.
You accuse Israel
of collective
punishment of a
people who call for
the end of Israel.
You accuse Israel
of withholding
resources which
are used to create
bombs. Where is
the cry and anger
towards the
international
community to hold
Hamas
accountable?!? Oh,
there isn't any,
because they are
terrorists!! So what
should Israel do?
Allow terrorists
access to further
kill their innocent
citizens? My heart
breaks for the
innocent lives that
are lost on both
sides of the

border. I cry every single day for EVERY innocent life lost. Instead of this superficial document, act! Get rid of Hamas! Help the Palestinian people establish a country of their own with a government that does not call for the demise of Israel. Israel will not cease to exist. War will continue as long as her neighbors do not accept her existence and continue to call for the death of innocent Israelis. Lastly, you mention the Holocaust. As the granddaughter of a survivor of Auschwitz, I vowed Never Again. And today we see the world turning against us. We see the city of Richmond turning against the Jewish people. We live here too. Our lives

matter too. Our right to a homeland that is internationally recognized matters and is valid just as the United States is valid. You are turning your backs on us, just as my grandmother's neighbors did to her in 1944 and you should be ashamed.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM

Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza

Ian F.

I write to urge the City Council to pass Resolution R.1 as it affirms the sanctity of the lives of Arabs by recognizing the scope and nature of Palestinian suffering. As following 9/11 (to which the attack of October 7 has been compared), the response from the federal government has been to dehumanize Arabs as a block and to ignore decades of oppression to justify collective punishment on a

For

Appro

massive scale.
Resolution R.1
sends an
important message
to Arab residents
of Richmond,
including my in-
laws who have
lived and owned a
grocery store in
Richmond for
decades, that their
elected
representatives
value them as
equal members of
the human race,
whose claims to
life and dignity are
equal to those of
non-Arabs. The
message being
sent to them at
every other level of
the American
government is
uniform: your
suffering and your
life are less
important to us
and we will fund
the slaughter of
you and your
children and
buttress your
oppressors and
there's nothing you
can do about it. I
urge the City

Council to pass
Resolution R.1.

10/24/2023 4:30
PM

Resolution
Affirming
Richmond's
Support and
Solidarity with the
Palestinian People
of Gaza

Henry

Please pass this resolution. What Israel is doing to Palestinians is nothing short of ethnic cleansing. Gaza is an open air prison currently without access to clean water, food and electricity, and the people are currently being bombed by one of the most well-equipped militaries on the world. Many call the resolution one-sided, but our relation to it is one-sided. The US provides Israel with 3.8 billion dollars in military aid annually, and is set to pass billions more for this year. All of this supports an apartheid state that has kept Gaza under a brutal 15 year blockade. We must support a peaceful resolution to the violence, we must oppose apartheid and

For

Appro

ethnic cleansing everywhere, and that's what this resolution calls for.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM

Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza

Cynthia Robinson

cynson@yahoo.com

I did not elect the Richmond City Council to weigh in on international affairs. It's resolution merely reiterates views already in circulation by the Palestinian press. To reframe the miliary actions of Israel as "ethnic cleansing" is to attribute an intent to the miliary action on par with genocide, as if the attack by Hamas never happened and Israel should "turn the other cheek." I want the people of Gaza to have safety. I want the people of Israel to have safety. I respectfully request the Richmond City Council set aside this resolution. The world is a tinder box ready to be set aflame by

Against

Appro

vengeance, anger
and retribution.
Please do not add
fuel to the fire.

10/24/2023 4:30
PM

Resolution
Affirming
Richmond's
Support and
Solidarity with the
Palestinian People
of Gaza

Alicia D. Polak

adpnyc@yahoo.co
m

According to the
most recent data
from the FBI, the
total crime rate in
Richmond is
4,267.9 per
100,000 people.
That's 81.92%
higher than the
national rate of
2,346.0 per
100,000 people
and 65.36% higher
than the California
total crime rate of
2,581.0 per
100,000 people. I
cannot fathom why
you would choose
to bring forth such
a resolution which
is so one sided,
makes no mention
of the death of
innocent children,
families and babies
in light of the
severity of the
problems in your
own backyard.
Your language is
inciteful and does
nothing to foster
community
building, peace,

Against

Appro

				tolerance or understanding.		
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Nishat Ahmed		I applaud the Richmond City Council for taking up this resolution. Given that this country is based on the principles of freedom and justice, it's crazy that this has not happened yet.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Khadeeja ABdullah		Thank you for taking a stance for humanity. The world is watching us here in the US and I'm so proud of Richmond for trying to stop the loss of innocent lives of children, men and women.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Maryam Gul	maryamgul@gmail.com	Dear council ! Thank you for your effort. Thank you for being on the side of humanity thank you for being on the side of empathy , thank you for not dehumanizing kids of Palestine . Thank you for reaching our kids	For	Appro

				humanity . Please pass this so we can have one step close to ceasefire .		
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Emine Yildiz	eyildiza@yahoo.com	I am proud of the Richmond community and city council for having the courage to do what most people are afraid to do at the moment. This is a humanitarian issue and we must unite in doing the right thing. Richmond city council and community are heroes for taking the lead in this!	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Sara Ahmed		Thank you for taking this stance for humanity and being positive examples for the broader community.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Bennish		Thank you Council for this necessary and brave act of solidarity.	For	Appro

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Adeel Syed	It's been heart breaking to see that in the name of defense over 6000 Palestinians have been killed. War crimes as recognized by the UN are being committed. It needs to end. Thank you for voicing the concern of residents of Richmond.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Lena Abdelfattah	Thank you managing to take the humane route amid all the anger. For upholding the universal sanctity of human life and reaffirming that we all must follow the framework of international law and human rights no matter what. Your leadership is inspiring.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Haania Hasan	Thankful for Richmond city council for taking this brave and humanitarian step.	For	Appro

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Mariam	omeera@gmail.com	I appreciate Richmond's stance on this issue. Blocking food, water, fuel, etc to civilians is wrong. The bombing of civilians is not the answer.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Omeera Qadir	omeera@gmail.com	Thank you City of Richmond for showing that Palestinian civilians do not deserve to be killed. All people deserve access to water, fuel, and clean air. This is a humanitarian crisis, where innocent people need access to aid. There needs to be an immediate ceasefire and the state of Israel needs to be held accountable for its war crimes. The world should be using the City of Richmond as an example for standing for humanity and the people of Palestine.	For	Appro

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Jennifer Webb	jennwebby@gmail.com	Thank you City of Richmond for standing with the Palestinians! Thank you for standing up against these horrific war crimes and ethnic cleansing.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Amtul Aziz		Thank you for voting to stop the bloodshed.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Ammar chaudhry	ammam.chaudhry84@gmail.com	Thank you for being on the side of humanity. You are the voice of people with no voice	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Saad hasan		Please save people of Gazaz	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the	Alia Dada		Thank you for being a voice for the hundreds of thousands of Americans of all	For	Appro

Palestinian People
of Gaza

faiths and
nationalities
AGAINST this
genocide against
the people of Gaza.
You all are a sign
that humanity still
exists !!

10/24/2023 4:30
PM

PUBLIC COMMENT
BEFORE CLOSED
SESSION (limited to
items on the
Closed Session
agenda only)

Palestinians for
Liberation

The US is complicit -
in the ongoing
ethnic cleansing of
Palestine. We hold
you responsible to
act against ongoing
warcrimes now.
We demand -the
complete
liberation of
Palestine -the
return of all
refugees to their
homeland -the
release of the
thousands of
Palestinian
hostages kept in
Israeli prisons,
including women
and children -
reparations for the
Palestinian people
-a complete
dismantlement of
the Zionist project
that has held the
US complicit in war
crimes, genocide,
ethnic cleansing,
and land theft.

Appro

Palestinians have the right to defend themselves against genocide. The entire world is disgusted by our veto against the ceasefire and the crumbs of aid being allowed in for performative measure. We demand an immediate opening of all borders into Palestine for access to unconditional and limitless humanitarian aid from the international community. Stop standing in the way, and do the ethical thing.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Armand Doner	This is a much needed resolution and I strongly support it. I applaud the city of Richmond in having the bravery to stand up for all humanity!	For	Appro	
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's	Hitfan Kurtu	hitfankurtu@gmail.com	Thank you Richmond City Council standing in	For	Appro

	Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza			solidarity with the people of Gaza.		
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Norah S		This position is in favor. However more must be done, this is the bare minimum.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Tazeen Ghani	aztazh@yahoo.com	Thank you for supporting the Palestinian people and raising awareness of their plight	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Marwan S		Zionism is Fascism, what a shame that Never Again became Everyday! Zionists are a danger to America! Free Palestine	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Zain Hasan		Please support little children of Gaza who are wondering why are they getting killed mercilessly.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming	Uzma		Thank you council for recognizing the	For	Appro

	Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza		grave humanitarian crisis facing the innocent civilians in Gaza		
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Sadia	Thank you council for recognizing the grave humanitarian crisis facing the innocent civilians in Gaza	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Omar	Thank you council for recognizing the grave humanitarian crisis facing the innocent civilians in Gaza	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Safaa Abdelfatah	Free Palestine, Stop the genocide.	-	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Moona	Thank you council for recognizing the grave humanitarian crisis facing the innocent civilians in Gaza	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming	Yusuf	Thank you council for recognizing the	For	Appro

	Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza			grave humanitarian crisis facing the innocent civilians in Gaza		
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	OPEN FORUM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT	Sana Rizwan	sananaved@gmail.com	Ceasefire Now! 100 percent FOR the resolution.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Diane Goldberg		Thank you Richmond for standing in solidarity with Gaza	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Farida shah		Please stop senseless killing of little children. Please support ceasefire.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Mohammad Ajmal		Thank you City of Richmond for showing humanity to the people of Palestine.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the	Steve mercado		I am not a Muslim nor a Palestinian. I am a human who is so sad to see so many small	For	Appro

	Palestinian People of Gaza			children getting killed in cold blood.		
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Faryal		I write to urge the city council to pass the resolution R.1 to support Palestinian people, to stand up for humanity, peace and justice. No one should have to bear witness to thousands of children being massacred and starved. Please be on the right side of history.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Aysha Qadir	aysha.qadir@gmail.com	Thank you city of Richmond for showing that the Palestinian people do not deserve to be eliminated. Humanity deserves at least the basic rights such as food, shelter, water. We can clearly see that in Gaza, israel has been restricting those needs while dropping bombs day in and day out. Killing innocent people. Innocent children and babies. They are	For	Appro

				trying to wipe out the people and yes it is seen as a genocide at this point. There needs to be an immediate stop to this and a ceasefire needs to take place. I thank you all for those who are for the ceasefire.		
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Julie Cohen		The people of Palestine are facing war crimes and civilians need access to aid. Thank you City of Richmond for standing up for Gaza!	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Corrie San Jose		I appreciate Richmond city council who is trying to stand right side of history. This is unfortunately so sad to be witness to.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the	Baqir Hussain		I applaud the Richmond Council for taking a stance for justice and humanity.	For	Appro

Palestinian People
of Gaza

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Katie Horowitz	Please pass this , so we can have peace . You are on the right side of humanity, you are the voice of many. We appreciate you	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Lizette	Thank you Richmond City Council for standing in solidarity with the people of Gaza. You are the beacon of light our government needs. We fully support you and appreciate you!	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Ezra Abraham	End this madness now. We stand with freedom of speech we stand with the innocent and against genocide	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	nadia selod	Thank you council for recognizing the grave humanitarian crisis facing the innocent civilians in Gaza	For	Appro

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	nadeem aibani	Thank you council for recognizing the grave humanitarian crisis facing the innocent civilians in Gaza	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	adnan selod	Thank you council for recognizing the grave humanitarian crisis facing the innocent civilians in Gaza	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Sabiha	Thank you council for being the voice and standing up against humanitarian crisis faced by the Palestinians.	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Sofia	Please stop killing innocent people	-	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Najwa Ann	End the genocide!	For	Appro

10/24/2023 4:30
PMResolution
Affirming
Richmond's
Support and
Solidarity with the
Palestinian People
of Gaza

Jameelah Shukri

I would like to acknowledge the Council for being brave and taking the necessary act of solidarity. I stand in solidarity with the people of Palestine and believe they deserve the right to live and have access to clean water, electricity, food and shelter. Israel's attacks on Gaza are a form of ethnic cleansing and collective punishment of civilians, which by international law is considered a war crime. We have the power to call on our government to put a stop to the war crimes of the Israeli government. We stand with those who seek humanitarian justice.

For

Appro

10/24/2023 4:30
PMResolution
Affirming
Richmond's
Support and
Solidarity with the

Shahidah Shukri

I would like to acknowledge the Council for being brave and taking the necessary act of solidarity. I

For

Appro

Palestinian People
of Gaza

stand in solidarity
with the people of
Palestine and
believe they
deserve the right
to live and have
access to clean
water, electricity,
food and shelter.

10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Safa	Stop killing the innocent people	Against	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Elle Frank	For the resolution!	For	Appro
10/24/2023 4:30 PM	Resolution Affirming Richmond's Support and Solidarity with the Palestinian People of Gaza	Alma Barrios	I would like to thank the council for this brave and necessary act of solidarity with the people of Gaza. It is horrible witnessing the genocide of an entire community. Israel's ongoing bombing campaign in Gaza, which has resulted in the loss of thousands of	For	Appro

Palestinian civilian lives is something that our tax dollars should not be funding. I applaud your bravery to stand for humanity in these moments. We believe that all people deserve the right to clean air, water, food, electricity and most importantly; safety.

1 2 3

R-1

Instead of speaking, I wish to submit these comments:

I support the city of Richmond's solidarity with the people of Palestine. What Israel is doing is not only cruel but inhumane. I fully support the resolution in support of Gaza. The 24/7 bombings of civilian targets needs to end immediately.

R-1

Instead of speaking, I wish to submit these comments:

My name is Mateo Romeo and I am a Richmond resident and military veteran. I am here to support fully your bold leadership to demonstrate our city's solidarity with the Palestinians in Gaza. I fully support the resolution in support of the people of Gaza.