



RACC/PAAC REGULAR MEETING

Thursday, November 9, 2023, 7:00p.m. – 9:00 p.m. In Person Meeting
Location: 450 Civic Center Plaza, Richmond Rm 1st Floor Conference Room
Masks are highly encouraged.

<u>RACC Chair</u>	<u>RACC Vice-Chair</u>	<u>Council Liaison</u>	<u>Staff</u>
Lynson Beaulieu	Kaelen Van Cura	Soheila Bana	Winifred Day Tony Tamayo Shane Johnson

RACC Members:

Phillip Mehas, Ted Bell, Melody Kozma-Kennedy, Carole Porter, Arleide Santos
(Currently all, Richmond Arts and Culture Commissioners (RACC) also serve as Public Art Advisory Committee (PAAC) members)

- I. WELCOME/CALL TO ORDER/ ROLL CALL (Chair Beaulieu) 7:00 p.m.**
- II. ACTION ITEMS: 7:03 p.m.**
 - a. APPROVE November 9, 2023 RACC/PAAC Meeting Agenda**
 - b. APPROVE October 12, 2023 RACC/PAAC Meeting Minutes**
- III. PUBLIC COMMENTS 7:06 p.m.**

Individuals who would like to address the Richmond Arts and Culture Commission (RACC) on relevant matters not listed on the agenda may do so under Public Comment. Public comments cannot result in discussion/action at this meeting.
- IV. INFORMATION ITEMS 7:08 p.m.**
 - a. Mayor’s Office Report – Proposed Banner Project – T. Tamayo**
 - b. Economic Development Director Update – N. Beacham**
 - c. Budget Wish List FY 24-25**
 - d. Ordinance, Policies and Procedures - Memorial Public Art Projects**
- V. RACC PROJECTS and PUBLIC ART Staff Report/Updates 8:00 p.m.**
 - a. Technical Assistance Workshop October 18 Update**
 - b. NPA Mini Grant RFP Update**
 - c. CW Allen Brothers Public Art Project RFP**
 - d. Large Public Art Commission Project Update**
 - e. Public Works Civic Center Plaza Lighting Project**

VI. Commissioner Updates

8:45 p.m.

ADJOURNMENT until December 14, 2023

9:00 p.m.

Attachments:

1. RACC October 12 Meeting Minutes
<https://www.ci.richmond.ca.us/DocumentCenter/View/67268/RACC-Minutes101223---FINAL>
2. Technical Assistance Workshop
https://richmond.granicus.com/ViewPublisher.php?view_id=35
3. SLATE Art Consulting [Nevin Press Release Oct 24 2023.pdf](#)
4. [Sample Memorials Policy \(003\).docx](#)
[GiftsandMemorialsIntro \(002\).docx](#)
[PortlandMemorialsPolicy \(002\).docx](#)
5. [NIAD's artists work is getting added to the SF MOMA](#)

Please encourage artists to register for the Artist Database using this link:

<https://www.ci.richmond.ca.us/FormCenter/Arts-Culture-Division-20/City-of-Richmond-Artist-Database-149>

Please submit a boards/commissions application for consideration to:
cityclerkdept@ci.richmond.ca.us

Link to
application: <https://www.ci.richmond.ca.us/DocumentCenter/View/2641/BOARD-OR-COMMISSION-APPLICATION-FORM-fillable>

**RICHMOND ARTS AND CULTURE COMMISSION (RACC)
PUBLIC ART ADVISORY COMMITTEE (PAAC)
In-Person Meeting
450 Civic Center Plaza, 1st Floor Conference Room
Richmond, California
Regular Meeting Minutes
October 12, 2023
7:00 p.m. - 9:00 p.m.**

Present: Chair Lynson Beaulieu, Vice-Chair Kaelen Van Cura and Commissioners Ted Bell, Melody Kozma-Kennedy, Arleide da Silva Santos and Council Liaison Soheila Bana*
*Arrived after Roll Call

Absent: Commissioners Phillip Mehas, Carole Porter and Council Liaison Doria Robinson

Staff Present: Arts & Culture Manager Winifred Day and Administrative Analyst Shané Johnson

I. WELCOME / CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

The RACC/PAAC Regular Meeting was called to order by Chair Beaulieu at 7:00 p.m.

II. ACTION ITEMS

a. APPROVE October 12, 2023 RACC/PAAC Meeting Agenda

Chair Beaulieu requested the addition of a voting item to the agenda to postpone taking any additional action on the request by Councilmember Soheila Bana for the Commission to approve a \$450.00 payment to the Pedie Perez Family for their memorial project until changes to the ordinance concerning these types of requests from private parties for privately funded public art are approved by the Commission and the City Council.

Motion by Commissioner Kozma-Kennedy, seconded by Commissioner Santos to approve the October 12, 2023 Meeting Agenda, as modified, carried by a show of hands.

b. APPROVE September 14, 2023 RACC Meeting Minutes

Motion by Vice-Chair Van Cura, seconded by Commissioner Bell to approve the September 14, 2023 RACC Meeting Minutes, as shown, carried by a show of hands.

III. PUBLIC COMMENTS

Arts & Culture Manager Winifred Day read into the record the following public comment: *Cordell Hindler: Hello Winifred, I am submitting the following comments into the record. 1) The Arts and Culture Commission is invited to the Contra Costa Mayors' Conference on November the 2nd at 6:30 hosted by the City of Brentwood the location to be announced.*

2) On a side note, there is another Arts and Culture Manager position that was approved by the Personnel Board on the 28th of September. Sincerely, Cordell.

IV. Poet Laureate Reading (Stephen Sharpe)

Poet Laureate Stephen Sharpe read into the record two poems he had prepared, the first of many readings to be provided to the RACC over the next two years. He also announced a public reading of original poems had been scheduled for Saturday, October 14, 2023 at the Spirit and Soul Festival, located at MacDonald Avenue and Marina Way, from 11:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. He had been scheduled to read his poems at 11:30 a.m. Everyone was invited to attend.

The RACC thanked Mr. Sharpe for his poetry reading.

V. INFORMATION ITEMS

a. 1411 Harbour Way Private Developer Projects (SLATE)

Ms. Day reported that SLATE Contemporary Gallery & Art Consulting had been selected by a private developer to provide the public art component for the project at 1411 Harbour Way, with the firm to serve as the manager of the public art project and with periodic updates of the project to be provided to the RACC.

Danielle Fox, Principal Partner, SLATE Contemporary Gallery & Art Consulting, 473 25th Street, Oakland, provided a PowerPoint presentation for the SLATE Project at 1411 Harbour Way and provided an overview of SLATE's management of public art projects exclusively with private developers. SLATE would manage the percent for public art project for private developer CA Ventures. In this case, the current site at 1411 Harbour Way was comprised of an empty lot, located kitty-corner from the Ford Assembly Plant to be developed by CA Ventures which would build a new industrial building to be leased to Maxion, a clean energy battery manufacturer.

The redevelopment of the site and renewal of industry in the City of Richmond would offer an interesting through-line from past to present and an opportunity to tell a story to celebrate Richmond as a center of industrial and technological innovation.

Ms. Fox presented a color rendering of the development as presented to the Richmond Design Review Board (DRB), which had requested two murals at specified locations at Terminal Three and Port of Richmond, and a Rosie the Riveter sculpture to be located in the center to provide interest, break the length of the building, and with trees to be planted to provide life and color to the façade. The historical context of the Kaiser Shipyards in the City of Richmond; a historical site overview; old and new industry and CA Ventures' plans to build the new industrial building at 1411 Harbour Way was highlighted.

The public art project would consist of two murals and one Rosie the Riveter Sculpture, which would be placed on a pedestal four feet in height and of significant size. The sculpture and murals would be sited on the east façade of the long building facing busy Harbour Way, with the intent that the designs be simple and graphic, easy to grasp and enjoy in an instant from passing traffic with some color to stand out from the gray building façade. The budget was limited and would be spread out between the three art installations. The sculpture would consist of laser-cut metal in order to be economically manufactured and the history of Rosie the Riveter would be provided.

The artist and artwork criteria for the project, the background of artist Miriam Klein Stahl who had been recommended to the developer and who had accepted the recommendation as the artist for the sculpture, and Brian Barnecllo recommended artist for the murals, along with the project details, timeline and budget were all highlighted.

An overview of the specifications of the proposed Miriam Klein Stahl sculpture and Brian Barnecllo public art murals was also provided and Miriam Klein Stahl was present to respond to questions from the RACC on some of the design elements of the sculpture. The RACC offered some recommendations to collaborate with the landscape architect on lighting to improve the darkness of the corridor, include references to the maritime industry and the shipyards, and possibly include some youth participation from the community to allow them to learn more about the City's history. A statement from Mr. Barnecllo on the design components of his proposed murals was also provided with the two murals to be approximately 28 to 30 feet in height by 40 feet in width.

Miriam Klein Stahl provided examples of some of her artwork at this time and expressed the willingness to include youth participation from the community from after school programs.

Ms. Day explained that it was not typical for the DRB to be so specific about the art component. Staff would be working with the DRB in the future with the understanding it was not appropriate for the DRB to be so specific about a public art project. In this case, the developer had been able to respond to the request and had hired a good art consultant to address the DRB's recommendations.

Ms. Fox clarified, when asked by Council Liaison Soheila Bana, that the DRB had not seen the designs for the public art project and was not required to review the designs. The RACC would approve the designs. She confirmed the DRB had requested the Rosie the Riveter themed sculpture.

Responding to additional questions from Council Liaison Bana, George Atalla, CA Ventures Development Manager and Ms. Fox provided an overview of the DRB's approval process of the project, with the entitlements for the project approval including a condition for the Rosie the Riveter sculpture and murals, although the DRB had no say about the appearance of the murals. As to whether the Richmond Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) would have a role in the project, it was clarified that the HPC did not, although separately, the project would include a public outlook area dedicated to the south, with the developer working with Trails for Richmond Action Committee (TRAC) and the National Park Services for panels that would include photography on the Kaiser Shipyards. No building was being historically preserved. It was reiterated that the property was a large empty lot.

Ms. Day further clarified the budget constraints and a community engagement component was not a requirement of the contract for the project.

Ms. Fox also clarified the developer was not responsible to include classes for youth but options could be discussed between staff and the artists.

Ms. Day suggested there may be some possibilities with community engagement as part of the NPA Mini Grant process that could piggy-back onto this project and which could be discussed later on the agenda.

Council Liaison Bana found the work to be beautiful but commented that none of the mural artwork had shown the change in population in the City of Richmond over the years since the shipyards had been built, with the majority of Richmond no longer African-American but comprised of Latino residents, and she wanted to see fewer objects in the murals and more people and diversity of the City's residents.

Ms. Fox explained that a final application would be submitted in the next few weeks and a revised schedule would be provided to the City for the installation of the sculpture and the painting of the murals anticipated in June 2024.

Commissioner Kozma-Kennedy suggested consideration of a time lapse video of when the sculpture was being installed for the benefit of the public, which would reflect where residents' tax dollars were going and the labor involved in the art installation to tie it into the history of the shipyards.

Ms. Fox advised that progress shots would be done during the course of the design of the sculpture and she clarified the RACC had an Instagram and social media presence where that information could be tagged for the benefit of Richmond residents.

Commissioner Santos stated she would tag the developer after the meeting and the community to keep the community updated.

Council Liaison Bana again clarified with Ms. Fox and Mr. Atalla the background of CA Ventures, SLATE's management of the public art project, how the artists had been selected and the City of Richmond requirements for public art. She understood the City's Request for Proposal (RFP) process would have involved artist selection from the top three artists by the RACC, not the developer.

Ms. Fox clarified that would have been the case if the artwork had been paid for by the City and involved taxpayer funding but this was a private development project, paid by a private developer and located on private property with no requirement for an RFP process.

Ms. Day further clarified the schedule for the project had been fast-tracked and she again clarified the City's process for the one percent requirement for public artwork.

Ms. Fox further commented, when asked by Council Liaison Bana, that including diversity of skin tones in the murals was possible and had been done by the muralist in the past. She and Mr. Atalla also clarified the mural size had been dictated by the DRB and while a larger mural to run the entire length of the building would have looked spectacular it would cost too much.

Commissioner Kozma-Kennedy complimented the two artists and thanked Ms. Klein Stahl for her attendance and for providing examples. She liked the prototype of the sculpture and she found the styles of the sculpture and murals to be in harmony and to complement each other.

Ms. Fox reiterated the application would be revised. The comments from the RACC would be forwarded to the muralist to ensure more people and representation of diversity and possibly work out more details in the designs that would include the specific sizes of the murals, a more formal maintenance plan, borrow waivers and a lighting strategy. When asked by staff whether signage would be included for the artwork, she was thinking of including three plaques, one next to each mural and one on the pedestal in front of the sculpture.

Ms. Day commented that once the application had been revised and submitted to the City, she would distribute it to the RACC to allow the RACC to make comments.

Mr. Atalla asked whether the mural was required to be done at the same time as the building and Ms. Day explained that a signature would be required at completion and prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy.

Ms. Fox noted the murals could be started earlier but primer and sealing for the paint on the building would be required first and the muralist would require a lift. There was a need to ensure the work was done prior to installation of landscaping.

Mr. Atalla advised he would coordinate the work with the landscape architect.

Council Liaison Bana asked of the location and size of the name or logo for Maxion on the building and Ms. Fox described the building as a very industrial site with the signage depicted on the architectural plans at either end of the building.

Ms. Day also clarified with Mr. Atalla that the City of Richmond owned the property, CA Ventures would be the sublandlord in partnership with Brookfield Properties (CA Ventures paid for the ground lease) and Maxion would be a 10-year tenant with two five-year extensions.

Ms. Day also clarified this was not a voting item as had been shown on the agenda but an information item for the RACC.

VI. DISCUSSION ITEMS

a. Richmond Historic Preservation Commission

Jonathan Haeber, a member of the HPC provided an overview of his background and described the request to consider potential collaborative partnerships between the RACC and the HPC, with an interest for RACC members to also attend HPC meetings held the second Tuesday of each month in the Civic Center Plaza, Richmond Room 1st Floor Conference Room at 5:30 p.m.

Mr. Haeber highlighted the work of the HPC, specifically the completion of Rooted in Richmond, Greenway History Walking and Audio Tour, an app developed by the HPC volunteer team with support from a Certified Local Government Grant, which provided stories of people and places in Richmond through exclusive audio interviews, 3D models of Richmond's historical artifacts and dozens of vivid historical images. He again commented on the intent to partner on any initiatives the RACC was working on. He asked whether the RACC was interested in working on a plaque program Council Liaison Bana had offered to work on for Richmond historic sites but the HPC needed to consider how to implement that as a Commission, particularly since the HPC was a smaller Commission than the RACC, which had greater resources.

Commissioner Kozma-Kennedy commented that with the Richmond Library being remodeled that could be a good intersection to consider for the HPC.

Mr. Haeber understood the Richmond Library, a designated historic site, may come before the HPC at some point.

Chair Beaulieu reported she had been sharing ideas with staff for building plaques relevant to the RACC's artwork. She found some plaque examples from England that were ceramic and which identified certain buildings around London and elsewhere, as an example that consisted of blue plaques for historic buildings and designations. There were also plaques made with decorative ironwork. Plaques could be considered as works of art and could be a way to create an intersection between the RACC and the HPC.

Mr. Haeber looked forward to such an idea and commented the HPC was working towards getting more support from the City and how to consider financial incentives for building owners of historic buildings where there were grant opportunities. He liked the idea of a plaque program as artwork. Council Liaison Bana wanted to see a timeline designated and the RACC and the HPC to work together. She commented there were people in Point Richmond already working on a plaque for the former historic International Hotel, also known as the Pullman Hotel, which had burned down. She wanted to see a collaboration between the RACC and the HPC commence as soon as possible and consideration of a standard procedure and protocol on a design to allow that to work.

Chair Beaulieu explained that an RFP process and solicitation of artists would be required and the RACC needed the ideas on a building plaque program from the HPC to allow a discussion and have something to work from.

Council Liaison Bana advised that a sample from the City of San Francisco had been provided and while she did not want what San Francisco had done, she recommended considering the City's protocol with a design specific for the City of Richmond.

Mr. Haeber stated the HPC had information from surveys and research on what sites were historic in Richmond, but the HPC did not have the expertise of the RACC and would like guidance on the visual side of things.

Chair Beaulieu noted the RACC needed more input from the HPC on the types of plaques the HPC desired and needed more specific input from the HPC on this concept.

Commissioner Santos suggested this could be a good project to start in 2024, which would allow the HPC the opportunity to identify what it wanted for a plaque program.

Commissioner Kozma-Kennedy commented on her background and experience working with historical plaques and commented that the use of ceramics and color identifying with different fonts and templates was important, with the plaque required to be scaled up for the specific artwork to ensure it was legible. She recommended consideration of Braille and any text that was permanent so that it could be read by both the seeing and non-seeing public, and artists needed to know that must be researched. While ceramic material was great, it could crack in an earthquake, iron was cheap but could rust fast and was porous and not as legible, and bronze was the cleanest metal used and could fill in tiny text. There should also be historical proof if the plaque was damaged, relocated or dismantled.

Ms. Day did not see why the HPC could not apply for an NPA Mini Grant since it would be part of a partnership opportunity and that information could be used toward potential federal grants. She also commented on the ongoing work to map artwork in Richmond and the HPC had skill sets that could help with that effort.

Mr. Haeber reported he had received an email from the City Manager's Office that asked whether the RACC could use the technology the HPC had developed for its walking tour of historic sites, and while there was no reason that could not be done, he wanted to ensure it was used for its purpose to spread the culture and history of the City of Richmond to a broader audience.

Ms. Day suggested application for an NPA Mini Grant could be a place to start with the grant in the amount of \$9,000 and it was possible the City Council could contribute additional funds. She clarified if signage just had text and was not advertising it was not art. Anything considered as art would require a graphic picture. Color coating, as an example, may involve different neighborhoods with different colors and there were many options that could be considered for different plaques. Based on the discussion, perhaps a committee needed to be established with at least one person from the RACC and possibly one or two members from the HPC.

Mr. Haeber expressed the willingness to serve as one of the representatives from the HPC on such a committee and he could reach out to other HPC Commissioners to solicit interest.

Ms. Day advised the RACC would be holding a Technical Assistance Workshop on October 18 and that would be an opportunity for the HPC to consider a preliminary concept and apply for an NPA Mini Grant. She could forward names from any RACC members interested in serving on such a committee.

Council Liaison Bana again commented on the change over the years in Richmond's population from a majority of African-American to Latino residents, with a strong desire to keep the history of Richmond registered through public art, which was why the RACC and HPC should work together.

b. Mayor's Office Report – Proposed Banner Project

Ms. Day provided a PowerPoint presentation on the Community Showcase Banner Program, a program presented to the Mayor's Office from CGI Digital, which worked with local business communities on beautification of cities and which highlighted the different types of banners that could be placed on different types of existing lampposts in the City, with the bottom part of the banners to have logos and sponsors. There would be no cost to the City and CGI would work directly with local merchants to obtain sponsors.

Samples of banners across the country as part of the work with CGI were provided. Banners for the City of Richmond were proposed to be seasonal with the program to be paid primarily by Richmond businesses. Costs for the banners was identified with CGI to provide direct marketing for the product for the local businesses and CGI could provide all installation services by contracting with local vendors in coordination with the Richmond Public Works Department. Staff had asked CGI to provide examples from cities of a similar size and type as the City of Richmond.

Commissioner Bell liked the program but wanted more background information to get more of a feel of CGI, and requested that a formal presentation from CGI be provided.

Council Liaison Bana commented that her only concern was the pricing if CGI entered into a contract with the City. She too wanted more information on costs, contract parameters and how the project may impact the placement of other banners in the City.

Ms. Day clarified there would be no contract with the City in that CGI would work directly with local businesses. Once locations had been clarified and a plan identified, there would be no conflict between the proposed banners and existing banners.

Council Liaison Bana reiterated that if CGI contracted with the City of Richmond and had the sole right to place banners in the City, the City would have to go through CGI and it was important to have more information on the pricing and contracting.

Commissioner Kozma-Kennedy also sought more information about CGI as a company that may do business with the City of Richmond. She suggested the City should put more money towards the City's local businesses that printed banners than a company out of New York State where CGI was located.

Ms. Day agreed those issues needed to be further discussed.

Vice-Chair Van Cura agreed more detail was needed on the proposed banner project.

c. Budget Wish List FY 24-25

Ms. Day reported the RACC had been provided copies of the approved City Council budget that had also been included in the August retreat packet. She provided an overview of the Budget Wish List for FY 24-25, as shown. In particular, she highlighted how the NPA Mini Grants could be stretched for other projects, such as the effort in Ookwe Park in the Marina District by an Ohlone Indian Group who had been cleaning up the park, planting and harvesting medicinal plants, but due to issues with people feeding feral cats in the park who were defecating on the plants, the plants could not be used for human consumption. The City was in the process of evaluating the expense for a variety of options to mitigate that issue but that effort was not part of the original budget for Ookwe Park, which had been designed as a public art park. There were also other potential projects that Commissioners may have identified to be established in the next budget.

Council Liaison Bana identified a small triangular area near the firefighter's training campus on Cutting Boulevard, which was a place for emergency responders. She suggested something honoring the sanctity of life and something that was anti-violence and in recognition of first responders should be considered. She understood there was a metal piece from 9-11 that could be used in an art piece. She also suggested consideration of Poetry Nights for the Poet Laureate and others, provided in other languages, at least once a month and in different locations in the City.

Ms. Day advised a concept and associated dollar amount would be required and suggested more information should be provided for such an item that could be discussed at the next RACC meeting. She added that Poet Laureate Stephen Sharpe would be applying for an NPA Mini Grant and in his first year he wanted to build on the Richmond Writes Program, where all Richmond schools were invited to participate in a competition, with the top winners to receive Target gift cards in various amounts. That effort could also piggy-back on the Poetry Night concept as proposed by Council Liaison Bana; however, the RACC did not have the budget for awards for competition winners and a future discussion was needed on the amount of a cash award and to whom. She suggested a comprehensive program be considered with planning in year one and with execution in year two.

Ms. Day added the Ookwe Park Ohlone Group had also been invited to apply for an NPA Mini Grant to expand their services, which was currently comprised of volunteers with the desire for an education component with a curriculum-based program and field trips.

Ms. Day further reported in response to a recommendation for poetry readings at City Council meetings that she had spoken with Tony Tamayo, Deputy Chief of Staff in the Mayor's Office, who had suggested that could be complicated since City Council meetings did not always start on time but it was possible for City Council members to read specific poems into the record.

Council Liaison Bana again referenced the loss of the Pullman Hotel due to a fire. She recommended consideration of building an over-sized statue of one of the Pullman workers on the property that would be historic and preserve the history of the property and which could serve as a destination location for the City of Richmond. She was uncertain how an estimate could be prepared for such a piece of artwork and there was discussion amongst the RACC about the possible contamination of the soil as a result of the burned building and where more research was needed for such a concept.

Ms. Day suggested between now and the next meeting of the RACC more details could be provided and possibly a presentation on the concept and scope of services could be prepared. Council Liaison Bana reported she would not be in attendance at the next RACC meeting but she could work with Mr. Haeber on a possible concept.

VII. COMMITTEE and PUBLIC ART Report

- a. Technical Assistance Workshop October 18, 2023, 7:00 – 9:00 p.m.

Ms. Day reported the RACC had been provided information in the agenda packet for the Technical Assistance Workshop scheduled for October 18 to be shared with each RACC member to share with their social media network with the purpose of the workshop to provide information on how to do business with the City of Richmond. The workshop would be recorded with the information to be available for access online.

Responding to questions from Council Liaison Bana, Chair Beaulieu advised that a separate training session would be provided for the NPA Mini Grants and she again explained the purpose of the Technical Assistance Workshop, which had been found to be helpful on how to work more effectively with the City and how to avoid past issues with the artists and the contracts for the NPA Mini Grants. If an artist was unable to participate in the Technical Assistance Workshop, there would be written instructions within the contract for the NPA Mini Grants for artists.

Commissioner Kozma-Kennedy added that feedback from the community was that the community wanted such a workshop and that was now being provided to ensure full information was provided to the community and artists to understand and navigate the City's application process.

- b. NPA Mini Grant Update

No report.

- c. Staff Report

Ms. Day reported the Information Technology (IT) Department within the City of Richmond was offering Gmail email accounts for all Commissioners. Commissioners interested in having a City of Richmond email address should express that interest to staff. She added that anyone interested in serving on any of the committees connected to the ten recommendations that resulted from the August retreat were also asked to contact staff. There had also been interest in establishing a Memorial Committee to allow the RACC to establish language for projects related to memorials and to address future requests.

Council Liaison Bana understood a vote was to be taken at this meeting for a Memorial Committee along with the request for funding from the Perez Family and these items were to have been agendaized, although Ms. Day advised she had been informed by legal the RACC could not move forward with the request from the Perez Family until the RACC had language that addressed their request for funds.

Council Liaison Bana advised she would follow up with legal since she understood a decision was to be made at this meeting. She was displeased that the item had not been agendaized for consideration and she questioned whether the principles of democracy were being followed.

Chair Beaulieu stated at the start of the meeting Council Liaison Bana had not been present, and she as the Chair had recommended the meeting agenda be modified. She requested the addition of a voting item to the agenda to postpone taking any additional action on the request by Councilmember Soheila Bana for the Commission to approve a \$450.00 payment to the Pedie Perez Family for their memorial project until changes to the ordinance concerning these types of requests from private parties for privately funded public art are approved by the Commission and the City Council.

Ms. Day reported she had provided the language the Chair just referenced to Council Liaison Bana prior to the meeting.

Council Liaison Bana stated she had not received that information, had not checked her email prior to the meeting and questioned taking such action on the day of the meeting. She found this action undemocratic, she was not aware of this action, and reiterated the direction provided by the RACC during the September 14, 2023 meeting on this topic, which had been recorded. She had been embarrassed the request for funding had been denied at the September 14 meeting in front of Pedie Perez's parents and she expressed her frustration at this time and suggested the decision on her request should not depend on staff or the Chair.

Ms. Day emphasized the need to be consistent and commented that when the concept had initially been brought forward by Council Liaison Bana, she had indicated the Perez Family would pay for all expenses for the memorial but at the last-minute funding had been requested from the RACC.

Council Liaison Bana commented that art was the means of connecting people and she questioned the decision made to postpone taking action on the funding request. She again expressed her frustration with the RACC not taking action on the funding request at this time.

Commissioner Kozma-Kennedy explained the need for a policy to be established and foundation put in place for the request from the Perez Family and for all future requests.

Council Liaison Bana emphasized that government was to protect humanity. She left the meeting at this time and prior to adjournment.

Ms. Day otherwise provided an example from the Alameda County Art Commission to be applied to the Shields-Reid Project in terms of community outreach.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT until November 9, 2023

On motion by Vice-Chair Van Cura, seconded by Commissioner Bell, and carried unanimously to adjourn the meeting at 9:11 p.m. to a Regular Meeting of the RACC/PAAC on November 9, 2023.