

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON AUGUST 8, 2018

**DESIGN REVIEW BOARD REGULAR MEETING
Multi-Purpose Room, Community Services Building, Basement Level
440 Civic Center Plaza, Richmond CA 94804**

July 25, 2018
6:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS

Meredith Benz
Michael Hannah
Tom Leader
Karlyn Neel

Kimberly Butt
Bhavin Khatri
Jonathan Livingston

Chair Livingston called the meeting to order at 6:10 P.M.

ROLL CALL

Present: Chair Jonathan Livingston, Vice Chair Tom Leader, and Boardmembers Meredith Benz, Kimberly Butt, Michael Hannah*, and Karlyn Neel*

*Arrived after Roll Call

Absent: Boardmember Bhavin Khatri

INTRODUCTIONS

Staff Present: Planners Jonelyn Whales and Hector Lopez, and City Attorney James Atencio

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: June 13, 2018 and June 27, 2018

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Benz/Leader) to approve the minutes of the June 13, 2018 meeting, as amended; approved by voice vote: 4-0 (Ayes: Benz, Butt, Leader, and Livingston; Noes: None; Absent: Hannah, Neel, and Khatri).

For the June 27, 2018 minutes, Boardmember Benz referred to her corrections for PLN18-059 Daran Single-Family Residence, and emphasized the need to clarify the conflict that while all the neighbors had approved the project, all the buildings occupied by those neighbors would be torn down. The minutes of June 27, 2018 were therefore continued to the next meeting to address those comments.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Public Forum

City Council Liaison Report – Mayor Butt was not present.

CONSENT CALENDAR: None

Chair Livingston announced that any decision approved may be appealed in writing to the City Clerk within ten (10) days, or by Monday, August 6, 2018 by 5:00 P.M. and he announced it after each affected item.

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON AUGUST 8, 2018

PUBLIC HEARINGS:

Both PLN18-015 and PLN18-016 were continued to the meeting on August 8, 2018.

- 1. PLN18-015 SMART NEW RESIDENCE**
Description PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT A \pm 2,600 SQUARE FOOT TWO-STORY RESIDENCE ON AN \pm 8,700 SQUARE FOOT VACANT PARCEL.

Location 70 BELVEDERE AVENUE
APN 558-012-015
Zoning RL-1, SINGLE-FAMILY VERY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT
Owner AARON SMART
Applicant ROGER KURATH, DESIGN 21, LLC
Staff Contact HECTOR LOPEZ Recommendation: **CONTINUE TO AUGUST 8, 2018**
- 2. PLN18-016 SMART NEW RESIDENCE**
Description PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT A \pm 2,800 SQUARE FOOT TWO-STORY RESIDENCE ON A \pm 9,850 SQUARE FOOT VACANT PARCEL.

Location 80 BELVEDERE AVENUE
APN 558-012-014
Zoning RL-1, SINGLE-FAMILY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT
Owner AARON SMART
Applicant ROGER KURATH, DESIGN 21, LLC
Staff Contact HECTOR LOPEZ Recommendation: **CONTINUE TO AUGUST 8, 2018**
- 3. PLN18-114 HUMPHREY NEW RESIDENCE**
Description PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT A \pm 1,600 SQUARE FOOT NEW SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE ON A \pm 10,000 SQUARE FOOT VACANT PARCEL.

Location DIANE DRIVE (VACANT LOT NORTH OF 2468 DIANE DRIVE)
APN 431-100-005
Zoning RL-2, SINGLE-FAMILY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT
Applicant WALTER DESIGN STUDIO (ARCHITECT)
Staff Contact HECTOR LOPEZ Recommendation: **CONDITIONAL APPROVAL**

Hector Lopez presented the staff report dated July 25, 2018, for the construction of a new single-family two-story residence located on Diane Drive in El Sobrante in the proximity of De Anza High School. The proposal met all required zoning requirements. Approval was recommended subject to conditions.

SCOTT HUMPHREY, the property owner, described the design and intent of the plans to meet his needs and to be compatible with the neighborhood. In response to comments from the DRB, he explained that while he had initially envisioned the fence being close to the walkway with the side yard to be part of the backyard, he had since decided to install the fence on the other side of the porch. He described a preference for a simple landscape plan with white roses in the front of the porch, with a Japanese maple in a raised mound in the middle of the yard, along with some rocks, mulch, and drought-resistant plants.

RAY WALTER, Walter Design Studio, clarified that the large cedar trees along the south

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON AUGUST 8, 2018

property line would remain and there would be an opportunity to install trees along the back property line to replace those that had been removed to allow construction of the building.

Vice Chair Leader recommended an irrigated zone with non-flammable plants closer to the home. He verified that the area to the rear was relatively flat and Mr. Humphrey commented that the area beyond the fence tapered down, which was why he wanted to plant trees to provide roots to stabilize that area and to offer privacy.

Vice Chair Leader recommended a topo to clarify the slope and the drainage and recommended a subtle swale around the street to address any future flooding. With respect to the remaining Monterey pine trees on the property, he suggested if healthy they could remain but if not it would be best to remove them.

Mr. Humphrey clarified that Diane Drive was private, asphalt, and there were no sidewalks, curbs, or gutters.

Boardmember Benz supported the board and batten home, and verified that the white home would also have white trim.

Boardmember Hannah supported the board and batten as well, along with the simple design and the standing seam roof, and verified with the applicant the materials proposed for the fascia, the deck, the railings, the garage doors, crawl space vents, attic vents, and other details that had not been identified on the plans, and requested that all the materials be added to the notes. He strongly supported non-white windows and commented that views from the inside would be nicely framed with black vinyl windows.

Boardmember Butt liked the plan and verified that the windows would be black framed vinyl Anderson 100 Series windows. She suggested that the posts could be thicker.

For the posts, Mr., Walter recommended 4x4's with wrapped wood trim, 8-inch square.

Boardmember Neel called out the lighting, wanted to ensure appropriate lighting along the front, and emphasized the required specifications with down lighting. The applicant advised that lights on either side of the garage had been proposed and there was a power pole at the corner of the yard.

Boardmember Neel verified that trash receptacles would be located on the side behind the gate, supported the proposed windows, and urged care when trimming the pine trees.

Chair Livingston verified that the proposed roof would be a 50-year dark, comp roof. With respect to the front of the house, he commented that the two front windows were too small and suggested they be combined. He also recommended that the garage doors be divided to play off the width of the dormer above.

Mr. Walter explained that the windows were not egress windows and could be enlarged a bit to be wider and longer, although he noted that the rooms were small and there was no desire to restrict bed walls. With respect to the garage doors, he suggested perhaps two doors instead of one big door.

Boardmember Hannah referred to a window at the lower right of the double doors and suggested that width as appropriate for the front. Minimally, he recommended the windows be wider by six inches, and Boardmember Benz recommended black shutters on the windows as an alternative to create the same effect.

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON AUGUST 8, 2018

Chair Livingston opened the public hearing.

Public Comments

There were no comments from the public.

Chair Livingston closed the public hearing.

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Livingston/Leader) to approve PLN18-114, Humphrey New Residence, subject to the 12 Design Review findings and 10 staff recommended conditions of approval, and additional DRB recommendations as follows: 11) Landscape plan to show a fence five feet back from the front porch house line; 12) Provide a specimen tree in the front yard; 13) Provide a fire protection zone around the house per CalFire; 14) Posts in front to be a minimum of 8-inch square, painted; 15) Lighting shall be shielded with maximum 3,000k, and be called out on the plans; 16) Provide 50-year comp roof; 17) Front upper level windows to be six inches wider; 18) Windows to be black or dark in color, (non-white); and 19) Trash area to be called out on the plans; approved by voice vote: 6-0 (Ayes: Benz, Butt, Hannah, Leader, Neel, and Livingston; Noes: None; Absent: Khatri).

The next item was continued to a future meeting.

- | | |
|---------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 4. PLN18-162 | GUNKEL NEW RESIDENCE |
| Description | PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT A \pm 1,900 SQUARE FOOT NEW SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE ON A \pm 2,900 SQUARE FOOT VACANT PARCEL. THE PROJECT WILL ALSO BE SUBJECT TO A VARIANCE BY THE PLANNING COMMISSION FOR MINIMUM LOT AREA (6,000 SQUARE FEET REQUIRED). |
| Location | 527 SANTA FE AVENUE |
| APN | 558-184-008 |
| Zoning | RL-1, SINGLE-FAMILY VERY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT |
| Applicant | BRAD GUNKEL (ARCHITECT) |
| Staff Contact | JONELYN WHALES Recommendation: CONTINUE TO FUTURE MEETING |
| | |
| 5. PLN18-081 | ORDONEZ NEW RESIDENCE |
| Description | PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A DESIGN REVIEW TO CONSTRUCT A \pm 2,212 SQUARE FOOT SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE ON A 31,095 SQUARE FOOT VACANT PARCEL IN THE CARRIAGE HILLS SUBDIVISION |
| Location | 5401 HACKNEY LANE |
| APN | 432-142-006 |
| Zoning | RH-SINGLE FAMILY HILLSIDE RESIDENTIAL |
| Applicant | COREY ORDONEZ (DESIGNER) |
| Staff Contact | JONELYN WHALES Recommendation: CONDITIONAL APPROVAL |

Jonelyn Whales presented the staff report dated July 25, 2018, for the construction of a new single-family residence on a now vacant lot where a landslide from the upper slope had damaged the prior home that had to be demolished and removed. The slide had also damaged the adjacent home. She noted there had been several geotechnical reports conducted for the property. The Carriage Hills North Homeowner's Association (HOA) had approved the proposal

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON AUGUST 8, 2018

and design which complied with the HOA's development guidelines. She clarified, when asked, that a concrete retaining wall currently on the property had been installed after the slide based on the geotechnical studies.

COREY ORDONEZ, the property owner, reported that he had worked with a drafting company to prepare the plan and he was open and receptive to feedback. He understood that the home had been demolished around 2000. The proposed design, by Diablo Valley Designs, was compatible with the adjacent homes and with the HOA regulations, with a proposed 50-year composite roof. Neighboring roofs were terra cotta tile. With respect to the landslide, he had copies of the geotechnical reports from Alan Kropp & Associates, which had recommended the extensive tie-back retaining wall system. A follow-up report had recommended the site as ready for construction. The V-ditches had been provided and would need to be cleaned out.

Boardmember Neel verified with Mr. Ordonez the building colors as dark blue with a red terra cotta roof; the trees that remained on the property; no exterior lighting had been provided on the plans; there was a street lamp on the cul-de-sac near his home; and there would be a step-up concrete landing.

Boardmember Butt verified that the back half of the home would be stucco with Hardie plank along the front. While she had an aversion to garage doors being the primary view, she understood the design was mimicking the neighborhood.

Boardmember Hannah stated that all the vents would have to be smaller; there was siding shown between the trim pieces in the side light in the front door which would have to be removed from the plans; there needed to be a better definition in the expression of entry; and he recommended that the roof be concrete to match the adjacent buildings which would add weight and require more engineering.

Mr. Ordonez reported that he had proposed solar on the roof.

Boardmember Benz recommended more landscaping.

Vice Chair Leader agreed with the need for more landscaping and proposed a non-flammable setback with non-flammable gravel or irrigated landscape. He encouraged an irrigated lawn in the back as opposed to the front, recommended a landscape plan with trees in the front for shade; recommended a drainage plan to keep water away from the home, and noted that the existing trees were highly flammable.

Boardmember Butt commented that the siding change was in front of the fence and should be pulled back behind the fence. She recommended a warmer color such as a taupe to go with the red mission tile roof. She also noted it was a feature in the neighborhood that the vents were larger in size.

Boardmember Benz referred to the three windows on the left elevation, noted that the drawings showed the windows as touching, and Boardmember Hannah recommended some trim similar to the recommended door trim to consolidate the windows.

Boardmember Hannah agreed

Chair Livingston opened the public hearing.

Public Comments

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON AUGUST 8, 2018

There were no comments from the public.

The DRB offered the following comments and recommendations:

- 1) Gable end vents be reduced in scale to be at least 75 percent of the current size;
- 2) Eliminate the gaps between the trim for the front door and side;
- 3) Evaluate the entry expression (an Exhibit A was offered by the Chair to staff for the applicant);
- 4) Roof to be concrete tile to match the community in color and in the distribution of color;
- 5) Provide a proper landscape plan in conformance with CalFire regulations;
- 6) Move front lawn to the back with a landscape plan and integrated use areas and trees for shade, and drainage;
- 7) Reconsider the color palette and provide a more typical color plan in the community, potentially in warmer tones of taupe or green;
- 8) Pull the siding past the fence lines or potentially consider all stucco.

Boardmember Hannah volunteered to work with the applicant on the roof design.

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Livingston/Leader) to continue PLN18-081, Ordonez New Residence, subject to the eight recommendations; approved by voice vote: 6-0 (Ayes: Benz, Butt, Hannah, Leader, Neel, and Livingston; Noes: None; Absent: Khatri).

Board Business

A. Staff reports, requests, or announcements: None

B. Boardmember reports, requests, or announcements:

Chair Livingston and subcommittee members provided a status report on projects, and reported on numerous subcommittee meetings related to applications for Mechanic's Bank; mini storage on West Cutting; 7-Eleven; Central Avenue; Hilltop Mall; Terminal One; Cutting and Foothill; Bay Walk; and others.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 7:35 P.M. to the next regular Design Review Board meeting on Wednesday, August 8, 2018.