

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON MARCH 13, 2019

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD REGULAR MEETING Multi-Purpose Room, Community Services Building, Basement Level 440 Civic Center Plaza, Richmond CA 94804

February 27, 2019

6:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS

Meredith Benz
Michael Hannah
Macy Leung
Karlyn Neel

Kimberly Butt
Tom Leader
Jonathan Livingston

Chair Livingston called the meeting to order at 6:04 P.M.

ROLL CALL

Present: Chair Jonathan Livingston, Vice Chair Michael Hannah, and Boardmembers Meredith Benz, Kimberly Butt, Tom Leader, and Macy Leung

Absent: Boardmember Karlyn Neel

INTRODUCTIONS

Staff Present: Planners Roberta Feliciano, Hector Lopez, and City Attorney James Atencio

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: February 13, 2019

Boardmember Butt requested two corrections: On Page 2 related to PLN18-339, Hampton New Single-Family Dwelling, the following statement had been incorrectly attributed to Boardmember Benz and should be corrected to read: *Boardmember Butt recognized that the colors had been provided on the plans but given a concern for true color representations, she requested a color palette;* and on Page 3 related to PLN18-373, New 4-Unit Live-Work Development, the same error had occurred and the statement should read that *Boardmember Butt requested a color and materials palette.*

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Hannah/Livingston) to approve the minutes of the February 13, 2019 meeting, with Boardmember Butt's corrections to Pages 2 and 3, as shown; approved by voice vote: 6-0 (Ayes: Benz, Butt, Hannah, Leader, Leung, and Livingston; Noes: None; Absent: Neel).

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Public Forum

CORDELL HINDLER, Richmond, referred to the comments from Annie King-Meredith from the last meeting and clarified that she represented the Shields-Reid Neighborhood Council. He also repeated his request that any project considered by the DRB must be submitted to the applicable Neighborhood Council for consideration.

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON MARCH 13, 2019

Mr. Hindler noted, for instance, that the application on the agenda for Mike's Auto Body Commercial Addition had not been reviewed by the Fairmede-Hilltop Neighborhood Council, nor had a prior application for Aspire Technology.

City Council Liaison Report – Mayor Butt was not present.

CONSENT CALENDAR: None

Chair Livingston announced that any decision approved may be appealed in writing to the City Clerk within ten (10) days, or by Monday, March 11, 2019 by 5:00 P.M. and he announced it after each affected item.

PUBLIC HEARINGS:

- | | |
|---------------------|---|
| 1. PLN18-343 | NEW 3-UNIT MULTIFAMILY DWELLING |
| Description | PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT THREE RESIDENTIAL DWELLING UNITS ON A ±5,550 SQUARE FOOT VACANT PARCEL |
| Location: | 5206 SAN JOSE AVENUE |
| APN | 510-081-034 |
| Zoning | RM-1, MEDIUM DENSITY MULTIFAMILY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT |
| Owner: | MALIK FAISAL |
| Applicant | LECK SOUNGPANYA (DESIGNER) |
| Staff Contact | HECTOR LOPEZ |
| | Recommendation: CONDITIONAL APPROVAL |

Hector Lopez presented the staff report dated February 27, 2019 for three new dwelling units on a site that contained a two-car garage (to be removed) with a driveway in the front of the property surrounded by a metal and chain link fence with two-story buildings in the front and rear of the property ranging in size from 852 to 1,224 square feet. The units in the two-story building in the rear would be connected by a three-car garage. The garage would include a roof deck between the two proposed units and would provide open space. With the exception of open space, the proposal met all zoning requirements. As a condition of approval an area 15 by 20 feet separated from the private space for Unit 3 was recommended to be allocated as a shared space for the three units on the property.

Chair Livingston noted that the site was surrounded on three sides by industrial uses and he asked if a buffer zone was required. Mr. Lopez explained that a buffer zone was not required.

Chair Livingston opened the public hearing.

LECK SOUNGPANYA, the Designer, presented the proposal and explained that the original proposal had been reduced in size at the request of staff and had been designed to match the existing character of the neighborhood.

Boardmember Benz referred to the garage doors shown on the elevations and verified with the Designer his intent to propose something other than a roll-up door. She also verified that the patio divider would likely be a solid wall of Hardie material with a trellis on top.

Boardmember Leader verified with the applicant the intent that drainage from the site would flow to the street. If that could not be done, he recommended an area where some of the lawn would include pea gravel to allow percolation on site without ponding. With respect to the

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON MARCH 13, 2019

comment for a buffer zone to attenuate sound and dust, he recommended a denser planting plan.

Boardmember Benz recommended the elimination of one of the colors to offer a more neutral tone with a cardboard color brown or grey, and instead of having red and green suggested green with a neutral color or red with a neutral color.

Mr. Soungpanya offered paint samples.

Boardmember Butt referred to the sides of the building that faced industrial, which she recommended be more solid and industrial, potentially with an actual wall on the deck level, to potentially include awnings, and encouraged a more pleasing view from the street as well as a more pleasing appearance on the roof.

Boardmember Hannah presented a sketch for a trellis element and a divider for a solid wall for the porch and explained how the access could be adjusted. He presented the sketch to the owner and designer. When asked, the DRB clarified that Trex could be used. He also recommended centering the window of the front elevation on the second floor. He commented that the lower floor was not consistent with the plan but noted that either way was fine on the bottom but on the top the two windows should be centered on the face of the wall, not balanced off the roof. He added that the belly band needed to be taller by 4 inches minimum, and he requested that the elevations be identified with orientations of north, east, west, and south.

Boardmember Leader noted that while nothing would eliminate the dust from adjacent uses, a “dust buffer” that might help would be to plant Canary Island pines (*pinus canariensis*) along the west edge of the property at 18 feet on center, with *escallonia rubra* on the south edge at 5 feet on center, leaving the purple plums as shown on the plans at 25 feet on center, all to be automatically irrigated. He added that window screens should also be provided.

Public Comments:

There were no comments from the public.

Chair Livingston closed the public hearing.

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Hannah/Butt) to approve PLN18-343, New 3-Unit Multifamily Dwelling, subject to the four Findings and Statements of Fact with 13 staff recommended conditions of approval, and additional DRB conditions as follows: 14) Trellis wall material same as the siding per Exhibit A and as discussed with the Designer; 15) Create a bio-swale in the rear with pipes to slope to the front or use pea gravel and 10x10 area of drain rock; 16) Eliminate one color from the palette per Kelly Moore Color Board Exhibit B at color nos. 417, K15788 and 259; 17) Jog the rear unit by 12 inches to break the planes on the elevation; 18) Center the front window on the front elevation on the exterior wall face; 19) Trees along the south edge and side to be *pinus canariensis* 18 feet on center and on the south side *escallonia rubra*, and retain the plum trees at 25 feet on center, all to be automatically irrigated; 20) Belly bands should be 4 inches taller than drawn minimum; and 21) Overhead garage doors carriage style with simplified lights and no decorative elements; approved by voice vote: 6-0 (Ayes: Benz, Butt, Hannah, Leader, Leung, and Livingston; Noes: None; Absent: Neel).

2. PLN18-057
Description

MIKE'S AUTO BODY COMMERCIAL ADDITION
PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A RECOMMENDATION TO THE

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON MARCH 13, 2019

PLANNING COMMISSION OF A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT A ±9,000 SQUARE FOOT ADDITION TO AN EXISTING AUTO BODY SHOP LOCATED IN HILLTOP AUTO PLAZA

Location	3230 AUTO PLAZA	
APN	405-330-003	
Zoning	CR, REGIONAL COMMERCIAL	
Owner	ROSE FAMILY PROPERTIES, LLC	
Applicant	MIKE ROSE'S AUTO BODY	
Staff Contact	HECTOR LOPEZ	Recommendation: RECOMMENDATION TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION

Hector Lopez presented the staff report dated February 27, 2019, for a 9,000 square foot addition to an existing 15,000 square foot building on a developed site currently used by Buick/GMC Dealership and Mike's Auto Body, which used 6,500 square feet of the building. A new entrance had been proposed on Auto Plaza and a new eight foot fence would delineate the separation of the two businesses. The building would meet green building requirements. A renovation of the existing space would be included, additional landscaping consisting of shrubs and ground cover would be provided along the new driveway entry and along the perimeter of the site, and two palm trees had been proposed as an accent to accentuate a covered entry. He recommended approval of the application. He added that the application would require Planning Commission approval given that an auto body shop was a conditionally permitted use in the CR District.

Chair Livingston spoke to the fact that the building was surrounded by asphalt and the size of the specific use would more than double.

Chair Livingston opened the public hearing.

VERNON ROSE, Mike's Auto Body, one of the property owners, clarified the areas that Mike's Auto Body currently occupied and showed where some parking was shared with the dealership.

DAVID KOTZEBUE, the Architect, clarified the fence to divide the auto body shop and the car dealership as well as a yard fence that would separate the staging area of the auto body from parking. He identified one handicap accessible spot with the rest to be for customers, estimating, and some employee spaces. He also clarified that the CMU walls along the perimeter at four to five feet high blocked most views of the property which was four or five feet higher in grade than Blume Drive and Auto Plaza obscuring the ground plane of the asphalt area.

Boardmember Hannah suggested that any improvement in the Hilltop area needed to include the installation of trees to create a buffer zone or screen.

Boardmember Leung supported the planting of additional trees and asked about the roof material and whether the color would be lighter. Mr. Kotzebue stated a tar and gravel roof would be provided.

Boardmember Benz liked the materials, suggested the building would be nice, the landscaping additions looked good, and she liked the use of the stone.

Mr. Rose noted that between Blume and the sidewalk there was a 4 foot section that could accommodate trees at the corner entering Auto Plaza.

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON MARCH 13, 2019

Boardmember Hannah commented that there was so much asphalt and so much building that the heat island effect created a problem for the whole area. Since the existing roof was highly reflective, he recommended that the roof of the addition match the existing roof.

Chair Livingston referred to a simulated vinyl rock wall and Boardmembers requested a sample of that product. Given C.3 stormwater requirements, he spoke to the need to create a detention basin on the site.

Boardmember Hannah was not concerned with the architecture, suggested the roof should match the existing roof and be lighter, but expressed concern with the permeability, asphalt, and trees as seen from Blume Drive. He recommended consolidating a retention bio-swale and creating a seating area on the edge of Blume Drive.

Mr. Rose stated that there were seating areas and staff areas inside the facility. He pointed out the storm drain in the front on the plans.

Public Comments:

There were no comments from the public.

Chair Livingston closed the public hearing.

Boardmember Leader emphasized the need for a grading and drainage plan to show the elevations and the asphalt, determine whether a bio-swale could be included, add more suitable bio-filtration material, and trees that would not block the display area.

While some Boardmembers recommended that the application be continued to allow the grading and drainage plan to be prepared, with the help of the DRB Chair Livingston prepared an Exhibit A to identify the requested information to be forwarded to the Landscape Architect for inclusion.

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Livingston/Leader) to recommend to the Planning Commission the approval of PLN18-057, Mike's Auto Body Commercial Addition, subject to the four Findings and Statements of Fact with 10 staff recommended conditions of approval, and additional DRB condition as follows: 11) The landscape plan to be amended to include a six-foot planting strip on the inside of the fence per Exhibit A and with the addition of evergreen trees on the Blume Drive frontage; approved by voice vote: 6-0 (Ayes: Benz, Butt, Hannah, Leader, Leung, and Livingston; Noes: None; Absent: Neel).

3. PLN18-351	PRECIADO TWO-STORY ADDITION
Description	PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT A 910 SQUARE FOOT TWO-STORY ADDITION TO AN EXISTING SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE
Location	427 C STREET
APN	538-022-020
Zoning	LW, LIVE-WORK
Applicant	JOSE PRECIADO (OWNER)
Staff Contact	ROBERTA FELICIANO Recommendation: CONDITIONAL APPROVAL

Roberta Feliciano presented the staff report dated February 27, 2019, for a 910 square foot two-story addition to an existing single-family residence of 958 square feet constructed in 1904. The

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON MARCH 13, 2019

addition would consist of a 455 square foot one-car garage on the first floor and 455 square feet on the second floor for a bedroom, bathroom, and closet. The addition would be consistent with the Craftsman style home. Staff recommended approval subject to conditions, one of which would be to incorporate a two-car garage instead of the single-car garage that had been proposed.

Chair Livingston opened the public hearing.

JOSE PRECIADO, the applicant/owner, explained when asked that the site was primarily concrete.

Boardmember Butt clarified with the applicant that while the existing house would be painted, no other improvements had been proposed to the existing home.

Boardmember Hannah recognized the staff recommendation for a two-car garage but noted the stairway would have to be reconfigured which would be difficult. Noting the proportions of the new addition matched the proportions of the existing home, he offered a sketch to show a wider garage door with four windows above instead of the three that had been proposed to offer better proportions for the larger addition.

Chair Livingston liked the addition and supported Boardmember Hannah's Exhibit A recommendation for a wider garage door for the single-car garage, with the windows to be appropriately apportioned to the wider garage door.

Boardmember Leader recommended that shrubs be planted on either side of the entry in front of the house.

Boardmember Benz agreed that widening the garage door would help. She supported the addition and suggested that the dormer in the new addition could be eliminated since the addition did not need to exactly match the existing home. She did not recommend a decorative garage door.

Public Comments:

There were no comments from the public.

Chair Livingston closed the public hearing.

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Hannah/Livingston) to approve PLN18-351, Preciado Two-Story Addition, based on the four Findings and Statements of Fact and the 12 staff recommended conditions of approval, and additional DRB conditions as follows: 13) Pursuant to Exhibit A (two-page) and Exhibit B (landscape/shrub planting); and 14) LED color temperature for the light shall be no more than 3,000k pursuant to Exhibit C; approved by voice vote: 6-0 (Ayes: Benz, Butt, Hannah, Leader, Leung, and Livingston; Noes: None; Absent: Neel).

4. PLN18-361 Description

HUANG ACCESSORY STRUCTURE

PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO LEGALIZE A 555 SQUARE FOOT ACCESSORY STRUCTURE IN THE REAR YARD OF AN EXISTING SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON MARCH 13, 2019

Location: 2726 LINCOLN AVENUE
APN 528-141-010
Zoning RL2, SINGLE-FAMILY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL
Applicant QING JUAN HUANG (OWNER)
Staff Contact ROBERTA FELICIANO Recommendation: **CONDITIONAL APPROVAL**

Roberta Feliciano presented the staff report dated February 27, 2019, to legalize a 555 square foot accessory structure to be used for storage.

Ms. Feliciano reported that the design was characterized by a 4:12 slope gable roof with exterior materials to include lap siding and a black composite shingle roof. Given the width of the structure, staff recommend that a porch and at least one window be added to improve the design. Approval was recommended. She clarified that if the unit was legalized and was intended to be an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) in the future that action could be accommodated over the counter.

Chair Livingston opened the public hearing.

QING JUAN HUANG, the applicant/owner was present but had nothing further to add.

Given that the unit was a storage shed that was not visible from the street and to avoid encouraging a conversion to an ADU, Boardmember Hannah questioned the need for a porch and a window. The other Boardmembers agreed.

Public Comments:

There were no comments from the public.

Chair Livingston closed the public hearing.

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Benz/Butt) to approve PLN18-361, Huang Accessory Structure, subject to the four Findings and Statements of Fact and 11 staff recommended conditions of approval; approved by voice vote: 6-0 (Ayes: Benz, Butt, Hannah, Leader, Leung, and Livingston; Noes: None; Absent: Neel).

Board Business

A. Staff reports, requests, or announcements:

There were no staff reports, requests, or announcements.

B. Boardmember reports, requests, or announcements:

Chair Livingston reported on a visioning kick-off meeting with the new City Manager, a Subcommittee meeting with the applicant for the 12th and Macdonald Avenue project, and noted that the Terminal One project was before the Bay Conservation and Development Commission (BCDC), which had recommended parking on both sides of the perimeter road contrary to the DRB's approval, and expressed concern that was able to occur.

Adjournment

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON MARCH 13, 2019

The meeting was adjourned at 8:14 P.M. to the next regular Design Review Board meeting on Wednesday, March 13, 2019.